# A Multilevel Memetic Approach for Improving Graph k-Partitions

Una Benlic and Jin-Kao Hao To appear in *IEEE Transactions on Evolutionary Computation* 15 March 2011

Abstract-Graph partitioning is one of the most studied NPcomplete problems. Given a graph G = (V, E), the task is to partition the vertex set V into k disjoint subsets of about the same size, such that the number of edges with endpoints in different subsets is minimized. In this work, we present a highly effective multilevel memetic algorithm, which integrates a new multiparent crossover operator and a powerful perturbation-based tabu search algorithm. The proposed crossover operator tends to preserve the backbone with respect to a certain number of parent individuals, i.e. the grouping of vertices which is common to all parent individuals. Extensive experimental studies on numerous benchmark instances from the Graph Partitioning Archive show that the proposed approach, within a time limit ranging from several minutes to several hours, performs far better than any of the existing graph partitioning algorithm in terms of solution quality.

*Index Terms*—Graph partitioning, multi-parent crossover, tabu search, backbone, landscape analysis.

## I. INTRODUCTION

Graph partitioning is one of the fundamental combinatorial optimization problems which is notable for its applicability to a wide range of domains, such as VLSI design [1], [39], data mining [47], image segmentation [37], etc. It is well known that the general graph partitioning problem is NP-complete [15], so approximate approaches are very useful to address this problem.

Evolutionary algorithms are among the most popular approaches for the graph partitioning problem. Some representative examples include: Mansour and Fox [29], who enforce the equi-partition constraint with a penalty term; Talbi and Bessiere [42], whose genetic algorithm is based on a cellular population structure; Bui and Moon [10], who additionally employ a preprocessing phase scheme that improves the space searching capability of the genetic algorithm; Gil et al. [16], who use the direct encoding for circuit partitioning; Kang and Moon [23], and Kim and Moon [27], who perform extensive experiments on graphs with up to 5,000 vertices that show an improvement over the local optimization approaches. In [43], von Laszewski employs a 'structural genetic operator' which copies subsets of vertices to the offspring. The current most effective population-based approach is the one reported by Soper et al. [38], which employs a multilevel heuristic algorithm to provide an effective crossover. Although this approach requires considerable computing time (up to one week), it achieves partitions significantly better than those generated by the state-of-art graph partitioning packages.

Moreover, a great number of well-known graph partitioning approaches are based on other popular metaheuristics including Tabu Search [12], [36], [4], Simmulated Annealing [21], Neural Networks [2], Swarm Intelligence [41], etc.

To handle very large graphs, the so-called multilevel paradigm has shown to be very effective for partitioning graphs [3], [19], [25], [44], [31]. The basic idea of multilevel approaches is to first coarsen the original graph G down to a certain number of vertices, generate a partition of this much smaller graph, and then project this partition back towards G by successively refining the partition.

In this paper, we introduce a new multilevel memetic algorithm which combines a dedicated multi-parent crossover operator based on the notion of backbone and a perturbationbased tabu search algorithm. This work extends thus a preliminary memetic algorithm presented in [5], where a different crossover operator and a hill-climbing based local search algorithm are used. Compared to this previous work, the new algorithm presented in this paper ensures better exploration with the new multi-parent crossover operator, and better exploitation provided by an effective tabu search algorithm. Furthermore, this paper additionally includes: (a) more extensive experimental evaluations on a set of benchmark instances from the Graph Partitioning Archive; (b) a detailed analysis on several key issues such as the distribution of local optima and the backbone size; (c) a comparison of the proposed crossover operator with the traditional uniform crossover, and analysis on the impact of perturbation within the proposed crossover operator; and (d) an analysis on the impact of the employed local search mechanism on the overall performance of our memetic algorithm.

The paper is organized as follows. In the next section, we recall the definition of the graph partitioning problem and some basic notations used. In Section III, we describe the multilevel paradigm, as well as the general scheme of the proposed multilevel approach. In Section IV, we present the memetic algorithm, which is the partition refinement mechanism of the multilevel approach. In Section V, we provide computational results of extensive experiments on benchmark instances from the Graph Partitioning Archive. In Sections VI, we show a landscape and backbone analysis, and based on the observations made, provide a motivation for our proposed multi-parent crossover operator. In Section VII, we compare the proposed

Una Benlic and Jin-Kao Hao (Corresponding author) are with the LERIA, University of Angers, 2 Boulevard Lavoisier, 49045 Angers Cedex 01, France (e-mail: {benlic,hao}@info.univ-angers.fr)

crossover with a conventional uniform crossover operator, and study the impact of perturbation strength within our multiparent crossover operator. In Section VIII, we analyze the impact of local search on the overall algorithm performance before concluding in Section IX.

## **II. PROBLEM DESCRIPTION AND NOTATIONS**

Given an undirected graph G = (V, E), V and E being the set of vertices and edges respectively, and a fixed number k, a k-partition of G can be defined as a mapping (partition function)  $\pi : V \to \{1, 2, ..., k\}$  that distributes the vertices of V among k disjoint subsets  $S_1 \cup S_2 \cup ... \cup S_k = V$ .

Let  $\{S_1, S_2, ..., S_k\}$  be a partition of V obtained by  $\pi$ ,  $E^c$ the set of all the cutting edges of G induced by  $\pi$ , i.e.  $E^c = \{\{x, y\} \in E \mid x \in S_i \text{ and } y \in S_j \text{ and } i \neq j \}$ , and let  $\varphi$  be the set of all the partition functions of G. The graph k-partitioning problem consists in determining  $\pi^* \in \varphi$  such that the partition  $\{S_1, S_2, ..., S_k\}$  given by  $\pi^*$  minimizes the number of cutting edges in  $E^c$  while ensuring that each  $S_i$ ,  $i \in \{1, 2, ..., k\}$  is of roughly equal size.

Throughout this paper, the initial input graph G is supposed to have a unit cost weight for both vertices and edges. However, as explained in Section III-B, the multi-level approach generates intermediate (coarsened) graphs with weighted edges and vertices. It is then useful to define the notion of edge and vertex weight.

Let |v| denote the weight of a vertex v in a coarsened graph, which corresponds to the number of aggregated vertices of the initial graph. Then, the weight  $W(S_i)$  of a vertex subset  $S_i$  is equal to the sum of weights of the vertices in  $S_i$ ,  $W(S_i) = \sum_{v \in S_i} |v|$ . The weight of a set of edges in the coarsened graph can similarly be defined.

In this paper, we are essentially interested in finding almost evenly balanced partitions. The notion of balance is defined as follows. Let  $W_{opt} = \lceil |V|/k \rceil$  be the optimal subset weight, where  $\lceil x \rceil$  represents the first integer  $\ge x$ , then the quantity  $\varepsilon = max_{i \in \{1...k\}}W(S_i)/W_{opt}$  defines the degree of imbalance among the k subsets of a partition  $\{S_1, S_2, ..., S_k\}$ .  $\varepsilon = 1$ means that the partition is perfectly balanced while  $\varepsilon > 1$ indicates an imbalanced partition with larger  $\varepsilon$  corresponding to larger imbalance.

The optimization objective f of our graph partitioning algorithm is to find a k-partition with the smallest number of edge cuts in  $E^c$ , such that each partition subset is of almost equal size ( $\epsilon = 1.00$ ).

# III. MULTILEVEL MEMETIC ALGORITHM FOR GRAPH PARTITIONING

## A. General procedure

Our multilevel memetic approach follows the general multilevel paradigm [9], [3], [19], [45]. Graph G is first coarsened down to a certain number of vertices (coarsening phase), an initial partition of this much smaller graph is generated (initial partitioning phase), and then this partition is projected back towards the original graph (uncoarsening phase) followed by partition refinement. The proposed multilevel approach, which employs memetic partition refinement at each uncoarsening step, is presented in Algorithm 1.

**Require:** An undirected graph  $G_0 = (V_0, E_0)$  and the number of subsets k

**Ensure:** A k partition of  $G_0$ 

i := 0
 while |V<sub>i</sub>| > coarsening\_threshold do

3:  $G_{i+1} = Coarsen(G_i) /*Section III-B*/$ 

4: 
$$i := i + 1$$

5: **end while** 

6:  $POP_i =$ **Initial\_Partition**( $G_i$ ) /\*Section III-C\*/

7:  $POP_i$  = Short\_Tabu\_Search( $POP_i$ ) /\*Section IV-C\*/

8:  $POP_i$  = Memetic\_Refinement( $POP_i$ ) /\*Section IV\*/

9: while i > 0 do

10: i := i - 1

11:  $POP_i = \operatorname{Project}(POP_{i+1}, G_i) / *\operatorname{Section III-D*}/$ 

12:  $POP_i =$ **Short\_Tabu\_Search** $(POP_i)$ 

13: 
$$POP_i = \text{Memetic}_\text{Refinement}(POP_i)$$

14: end while

## B. Coarsening phase

Let  $G_0 = (V_0, E_0)$  be the initial graph. Creating a coarser graph  $G_{i+1} = (V_{i+1}, E_{i+1})$  from  $G_i = (V_i, E_i)$  consists in finding an independent subset of edges (matching)  $\Gamma \subset E_i$ , and then collapsing the two vertices of each edge in  $\Gamma$  to form a new vertex in  $V_{i+1}$ . Any vertex that is not part of  $\Gamma$ is simply copied over to  $G_{i+1}$  (see Fig. 1 for an illustrative example).

When two vertices  $v_1, v_2 \in V_i$  are collapsed to form a new vertex  $v_a \in V_{i+1}$ , the weight of the resulting vertex  $v_a$  is set equal to the sum of weights of vertices  $v_1$  and  $v_2$ . Therefore, the weight of a vertex of a coarsened graph equals the number of aggregated vertices of the initial graph  $G_0$ .

Similarly, let  $v_a, v_b \in V_{i+1}$  be two vertices formed by collapsing  $\{v_1, v_2\} \in \Gamma$  and  $\{v_3, v_4\} \in \Gamma$ . All the edges incident to  $\{v_1, v_2\}$  and  $\{v_3, v_4\}$  are merged to form a new edge  $\{v_a, v_b\} \in E_{i+1}$  with a weight that is set equal to the sum of weights of edges incident to  $\{v_1, v_2\}$  and  $\{v_3, v_4\}$ .

One key issue here is the selection of the independent subset of graph edges  $\Gamma$  to be collapsed at each step of the coarsening phase. This can be achieved by finding a maximal matching of the graph [32]. There exist polynomial time algorithms for tackling this problem, with running time of at least  $O(|V|^{2.5})$ . Unfortunately, this is too slow to be applicable to the partitioning problem. That is why we compute an approximate maximal matching using a fast heuristic called heavy-edge matching (HEM), which has O(|E|) time complexity [24]. This method considers vertices in random order, matching each unmatched vertex v with its unmatched neighbor u, if any, such that the weight of edge  $\{u, v\}$  is maximal among all the edges incident to v. An example of vertex and edge aggregation with HEM of an initial graph with seven vertices is provided in Figure 1.



Fig. 1. An example of coarsening with HEM of an initial unweighted graph  $G_0$  with seven vertices. The weight of a vertex |v| of a coarsened graph  $G_i$  equals the number of aggregated vertices of the initial graph  $G_0$ . The weight of the resulting edge, which is incident to the collapsed vertex  $v_c = \{u, v\}$  is set equal to the sum of weights of all the edges incident to u and v minus the weight of edge  $\{u, v\}$ .

## C. Initial partition and its refinement

To create each individual of the initial population in the second phase (line 6 of Alg. 1), we first assign randomly the vertices of the coarsest graph  $G_m = (V_m, E_m)$  to subsets  $S_i \in \{S_1, S_2, ...S_k\}$ , such that each subset is as evenly balanced as possible, i.e. each  $S_i$ ,  $i \in \{1, ..., k\}$  has a similar weight  $W(S_i)$ . Afterwards, we apply a short run of the perturbation-based tabu search, previously presented in [6], to improve all individuals of this initial population (see Section IV-C), followed by the memetic refinement which is described in Section IV (lines 7–8 of alg. 1).

This refinement step is essential for our approach to improve progressively the quality of partitions. It should be noted that for certain graphs, it may be impossible to obtain a perfectly balanced initial partition, since weights of vertices in the coarsest graph are often greatly inhomogeneous. This imbalance is gradually reduced throughout each uncoarsening step, and (usually) completely eliminated by the end of the algorithm execution.

# D. Uncoarsening phase

The uncoarsening phase carries out the inverse of the coarsening phase. The idea is to go from level to level, uncoarsening the clustered vertices in the same way they were grouped during the coarsening phase. The partition projection from a graph  $G_i = (V_i, E_i)$  onto a partition of the parent graph  $G_{i-1} = (V_{i-1}, E_{i-1})$  is a trivial process. If a vertex  $v \in V_i$  is in subset  $S_m$ , then the matched pair of vertices  $v_1, v_2 \in V_{i-1}$  which represents vertex  $v \in V_i$  will also be in subset  $S_m$ .

Before projecting a partition on to the next level, we first apply a short run of the perturbation-based tabu search to improve all the individuals of the population, which is immediately followed by the memetic refinement (lines 12–13 of alg. 1). Experiments show that the local optimization applied on the initial population before memetic refinement (lines 7 and 12 of Alg. 1) influences favorably the final result, though this influence is not very important.

As the uncoarsening-refining process proceeds, the partition quality of a graph  $G_{i-1}$  is usually better than that of  $G_i$  because there is a greater degree of freedom for refinement. This is one of the most attractive characteristics of a multilevel algorithm.

# IV. THE MEMETIC REFINEMENT

The general idea behind memetic approaches is to combine advantages of both crossover that discovers unexplored promising regions of the search space, and local search that finds good solutions by concentrating the search around these regions. Given an initial population which consists of locally optimal solutions, a memetic approach generates a new set of improved local optima by applying a crossover operator and/or mutation to the population, followed by local refinement. The success of this method depends critically on the crossover operator that discovers new promising regions of the search space by performing 'jumps' from one local optimum to another. These jumps need to be far enough to escape from the basin of attraction of the current local optimum, but still not too far to degenerate into a simple random search algorithm. Furthermore, in order to perform a directed 'jump', a crossover operator should be able to recognize what elements must be preserved through the recombination and what elements can be perturbed.

Motivated by the observation that high quality partitions share many groupings of vertices (backbone, see below), we propose in this work an original backbone-based multi-parent crossover (BBC) which preserves the backbone with respect to a certain number of parent individuals. After the offspring has been generated by the proposed crossover, it is refined with a perturbation-based tabu search algorithm. Finally, we apply a replacement strategy, which takes into consideration both the partition quality and the distance between individuals in the population.

The general architecture of our memetic approach is described in Algorithm IV. The main components are detailed in the following subsections.

## A. Encoding and fitness function

Given a graph  $G_i = (V_i, E_i)$  at level *i* and an integer *k*, an individual *I* corresponds to a partition of  $V_i$  into *k* disjoint

Algorithm 2 Memetic refinement of our multilevel approach Require: Population  $POP_i$  at graph level i

**Ensure:** Refined population  $POP_i$ 

I: I\* ← Best(POP<sub>i</sub>) /\* the best individual found so far \*/
 for n := 1 to number of crossovers θ do

- 3: Select p  $(p \ge 2)$  individuals  $\{I^1, ..., I^p\}$  with the tournament selection strategy
- 4:  $I^0 \leftarrow \mathbf{BBC}(I^1, ..., I^p) /* \text{ Section IV-B }*/$
- 5:  $I^0 \leftarrow \text{Tabu}_\text{Search}(I^0) / \text{* Section IV-C */}$
- 6: **if**  $(f(I^0) < f(I^*))$  **then**
- 7:  $I^* \leftarrow I^0$  /\* update best individual found so far \*/ 8: **end if**
- 9:  $POP_i \leftarrow \textbf{Pool\_Updating}(I^0, POP_i) /* \text{ Section IV-D2} */$

groups or subsets  $I = \{S_1, ..., S_k\}$ , such that each  $S_j, j \in \{1, ..., k\}$  is composed of vertices that are assigned to the  $j^{th}$  subset.

The optimization objective of our k-partitioning problem is to minimize the cutting edges in  $E^c$  (see Section II), while maintaining the best possible balance between partition subsets.

The fitness function f(I) of our memetic algorithm is directly related to the optimization objective and sums up the cutting edge weights of a k-partition (individual)  $I = \{S_1, ..., S_k\}$ . More formally,

$$f(I) = \sum_{\{u,v\} \in E_i} \varrho_{u,v}(I) \tag{1}$$

$$\varrho_{u,v}(I) = \begin{cases} w_{u,v} & \text{if } u \in S_x \text{ and } v \in S_y \ (x \neq y); \\ 0, & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases}$$

where  $w_{u,v}$  represents the weight of edge  $\{u, v\} \in E_i$ , i.e. the number of unit cost edges of the original graph  $G_0 = (V_0, E_0)$  that are aggregated within  $\{u, v\} \in E_i$  during the coarsening phase.

Then, individual  $I^A$  is considered better than individual  $I^B$  only if  $f(I^A) < f(I^B)$  (lines 6-8 of algo. 2).

Since our goal is to find perfectly balanced partitions ( $\varepsilon = 1.00$ ), the partition balance is imposed as a constraint rather than an objective. However, as mentioned earlier, it is sometimes impossible to establish perfect balance in coarsened graphs since vertex weights can be extremely inhomogeneous. It is during the partition refinement of levels which are closer to the original graph that the balance condition is (usually) completely satisfied. More precisely, the tabu search procedure of our memetic algorithm employs two move operators that take care of partition imbalance by transferring vertices to subsets of smaller weight (see Section IV-C). In addition, the proposed backbone-based crossover operator insures that the balance is not degraded during the crossover process (see Section IV-B).

## B. Backbone and crossover

1) Notion of backbone: Our backbone-based multi-parent crossover described in this section tries to preserve the back-

bone with respect to a number of parent individuals while redistributing with a certain probability vertices that do not belong to the backbone.

For optimization problems, the term *backbone* is usually used to define a set of variables B having the same value assignment throughout all the global optima, while the *backbone size* corresponds to the number of elements in B. The similar idea has been used in several contexts [13], [26], [46], [48].

For our graph partition problem, the notion of backbone can be defined as follows.

**Definition 1 (Backbone):** Let G be a graph,  $\Omega$  the set of all optimal k-partitions of G. The backbone B of G is a set of k subsets of vertices  $\{B_1, ..., B_k\}$  such that each  $B_i$ ,  $i \in \{1, ..., k\}$  is the subset of vertices that are grouped together throughout all the optima of  $\Omega$ .

**Definition 2 (Backbone size):** Given a backbone  $B = \{B_1, ..., B_k\}$ , its size |B| equals  $|B_1 \cup ... \cup B_k|$ .

Such a definition cannot be applied in practice given that the optimal solutions are unknown (our goal is to find such a solution). Therefore, in this paper, we use a relaxed definition of backbone by considering a set of locally optimal (high quality) solutions. Therefore, if a set of vertices are shared through the set of selected k-partitions, these vertices are considered to have a high chance to be part of the backbone.

2) The backbone-based multi-parent crossover operator (BBC): Given the set  $P = \{I^1, ..., I^p\}$  of p parent individuals, BBC constructs the offspring  $I^0 = \{S_1^0, ..., S_k^0\}$  in k passes (one for each subset of the partition). In each pass  $\mu$  it performs the following steps:

- Select a subset S<sup>i</sup><sub>j</sub> of I<sup>i</sup> such that the weight W(S<sup>i</sup><sub>j</sub>) is maximal across the subsets j ∈ {1..k} of each individual I<sup>i</sup> ∈ P, i.e. max<sub>i∈{1..p},j∈{1..k}</sub>{W(S<sup>i</sup><sub>j</sub>)}, with the constraint that at most [k/p] subsets can be chosen from each individual I<sup>i</sup> ∈ P (line 5 of alg. 3).
- Given I<sup>i</sup> and S<sup>i</sup><sub>j</sub> determined in Step 1, for *each* individual I<sup>t</sup> ∈ P (t ≠ i), let ∏<sub>t</sub> contain the largest number of vertices that are shared by the subset S<sup>i</sup><sub>j</sub> of I<sup>i</sup> and a subset S<sup>t</sup><sub>η</sub> of I<sup>t</sup>, i.e. ∏<sub>t</sub> = {S<sup>i</sup><sub>j</sub>∩S<sup>t</sup><sub>η</sub> |max<sub>η∈{1..k}</sub>|S<sup>i</sup><sub>j</sub>∩S<sup>t</sup><sub>η</sub>|}. Then, ∏ = {∏<sub>1</sub>, ..., ∏<sub>p-1</sub>} forms a set of these vertex subsets (lines 6–9 of alg. 3).
- 3) Set S<sup>0</sup><sub>μ</sub> = ∏<sub>1</sub> ∩ ∏<sub>2</sub> ∩... ∩ ∏<sub>p-1</sub>. S<sup>0</sup><sub>μ</sub> is the largest subset of vertices that are shared by all the parent individuals. For each vertex v ∈ S<sup>i</sup><sub>j</sub> and v ≠ S<sup>0</sup><sub>μ</sub>, v is assigned to subset S<sup>0</sup><sub>μ</sub> of I<sup>0</sup> if c(v)/p − 1 is greater than or equal to some random real number in the range [0, 1], where c(v) is the number of subsets of ∏ in which v occurs (lines 11–15 of alg. 3).
- 4) When a vertex v is assigned to subset  $S^0_{\mu}$  of  $I^0$  in the  $\mu^{th}$  pass, v is removed from all the parent individual subsets in which it occurs, and the weights of these subsets are adjusted accordingly (lines 17–18 of alg. 3).

After the previous four steps, the last step handles the unassigned vertices. Any vertex v missing from  $I^0$  is placed at random to a subset  $S_r$  of  $I^0$  such that  $W(S_r \cup \{v\}) \leq W_{opt}$  (lines 21–26 of alg. 3), where  $W_{opt}$  is defined in Section II. This step introduces a degree of diversification in the crossover



Fig. 2. An illustration of the BBC crossover with three parents. A circled subset of a parent corresponds to the subset chosen in the  $\mu^{th}$  pass, i.e. the subset of maximal weight across all the parent individuals with the constraint that at most  $\lceil k/p \rceil$  subsets can be chosen from each individual.

process.

Notice that the proposed BBC operator never degrades the balance with respect to the set of parent individuals P, since given a subset  $S_j^i$  of individual  $I^i$  which is chosen in the  $\mu^{th}$  pass (see line 5 of alg. 3), at most  $|S_j^i|$  vertices can be transmitted to the subset  $S_{\mu}^0$  of offspring  $I^0$ . In addition, an unassigned vertex v in  $I^0$  is assigned to a subset  $S_r^0$  only if adding v to  $S_r^0$  does not exceed the expected optimal subset weight  $W_{opt}$ .

The complexity of the proposed crossover is  $O(p * k * |V_i|)$ , where  $|V_i|$  is the number of vertices in graph  $G_i(V_i, E_i)$ .

To determine the subset  $P \subset POP$  of p parent individuals, we employ the tournament selection strategy. Let  $\lambda$  be the size of the tournament pool. We select each individual  $I^i \in P$  in the following way: randomly choose  $\lambda$  individuals from POP; among the  $\lambda$  chosen individuals, place the best one into P if it is not already present in P.

An example of this crossover with three parent individuals (p = 3) for k = 3 is provided in Figure 2.

## C. Perturbation-based Iterated Tabu Search improvement

To improve the newly generated offspring, we apply an iterated tabu search algorithm [6] whose basic components are briefly described in this section.

Basically, the TS algorithm uses two neighborhood relations (call them  $N_1$  and  $N_2$ ) which are explored in a token-ring way. That is, we repeatedly apply one neighborhood search to the best local optimum produced by the other neighborhood. The algorithm incorporates as well a perturbation mechanism in order to bring diversification into the search. 1) Neighborhood relations: Given a subset  $S_i$  of a kpartition  $I = \{S_1, S_2, ..., S_k\}$ , the basic idea of the neighborhood relations is to move a vertex v from another subset to  $S_i$ . Such a move is constrained such that v must be a border vertex relative to  $S_i$ , i.e.  $v \notin S_i$  has at least one adjacent vertex in  $S_i$ . Note that in this way, the size of the neighborhoods is limited, since the set of border vertices relative to  $S_i$  is generally of small size. In addition, such a neighborhood allows the search to concentrate around these critical vertices.

The key concept related to the two neighborhoods is the *move gain*, which represents the change in the optimization objective. It expresses an estimate on how much a partition could be improved if a vertex v is moved to another subset  $S_n$ . Given a vertex v from subset  $S_c$ , the gain g(v, n) can be computed for every other subset  $S_n$ ,  $n \neq c$ . The selection of the vertex with the highest gain, as well as the updates needed after each move, are achieved efficiently by using an adaptation of bucket sorting [6] that was originally proposed in [14] for graph bisection.

Let  $I = \{S_1, S_2, ..., S_k\}$  be a k-partition,  $V(S_i)$  the set of border vertices relative to subset  $S_i$ , and  $S_{max} = \{S_i | max_{i \in \{1...k\}} \{W(S_i)\}\}$  the subset with the maximum vertex weight. The neighborhood relations  $N_1$  and  $N_2$  can be explained by the two move operators given below.

**Move 1**: Move one highest gain vertex  $v_m$ . Choose randomly a subset  $S_m \in \{S_1, S_2, ..., S_k\} - \{S_{max}\}$ . Then, select the *highest gain* vertex  $v_m \in V(S_m)$  whose current subset is  $S_c$ , such that  $S_c \in \{S \in I | W(S) > W(S_m)\}$ . Move the selected vertex  $v_m$  to subset  $S_m$ .

Move 2: Move two highest gain vertices  $v_m$  and  $v_n$ .

Algorithm 3 Backbone-based multi-parent crossover (BBC)

**Require:** Set  $P = \{I^1, ..., I^p\}$  of p parent individuals

- **Ensure:** An offspring  $I^0 = \{S_1^0, ..., S_k^0\}$
- 1: Initialize offspring  $I^0 = \phi$
- 2: Set for each  $I^e \in P$  the number of times it has been selected:  $q(I^e) = 0$
- 3: Determine subset weights  $W(S_b^e)$  of each  $I^e \in P$ ,  $\forall b \in \{1..k\}$
- 4: for  $\mu := 1$  to k do
- 5: /\* Step 1 \*/ Select an individual  $I^i$  and its subset  $S^i_j$  such that:  $max_{i \in \{1...p\}, j \in \{1...k\}} \{W(S^i_j)\}$  and  $q(I^i) \leq \lceil k/p \rceil$ /\* Step 2: Determine  $\prod = \{\prod_1, ..., \prod_{p-1}\}$  \*/
- 6: **for each**  $I^t \neq I^i$ ,  $I^t \in P$  **do**

7: 
$$\prod_{t} = \{\{S_{j}^{t} \cap S_{\eta}^{t}\} | max_{\eta \in \{1..k\}} | S_{j}^{t} \cap S_{\eta}^{t} | \}$$

- 8: end for
- 9:  $S^0_{\mu} \leftarrow \prod_1 \cap \prod_2 \cap \ldots \cap \prod_{p-1}$ 10: /\* **Step 3**: Assign vertices \*/
- 10: /\* Step 3: Assign vertices \*/ Count the number of occurrences c(v) of each vertex  $v \in S_j^i$  in  $\prod$
- 11: **for all** vertices  $v \in S_i^i$  **do**
- 12: **if**  $(v \notin S^0_{\mu} \text{ and } c(v))/p 1 \ge random[0..1])$  **then** 13:  $S^0_{\mu} = S^0_{\mu} \cup \{v\}$
- 14: **end** *if*
- 15: end for
- 16:  $q(I^i) = q(I^i) + 1$ /\* Step 4 \*/
- 17: Remove all vertices  $v \in S^0_{\mu}$  from each  $I^e \in P$
- 18: Update subset weights  $W(S_b^e)$  of each  $I^e \in P, \forall b \in \{1...k\}$
- 19: **end for**
- 20: /\* Step 5: Handle unassigned vertices \*/ Compute subset weights  $W(S_b^0)$  of  $I^0$ ,  $\forall b \in \{1..k\}$
- 21: for all vertices  $v \in V$  do
- 22: **if**  $v \notin \bigcup_{i=1}^k S_i^0$  then
- 23: Assign v to a random subset  $S_r^0$ ,  $r \in \{1..k\}$  such that  $W(S_r^0 \cup \{v\}) \le W_{opt}$
- 24: Update subset weight  $W(S_r^0)$
- 25: **end if**
- 26: end for
- 27: return  $I^0 = \{S_1^0, S_2^0, ..., S_k^0\}$

Choose vertex  $v_m$  and its new subset  $S_m$  as in the first move operator. Choose randomly a new subset  $S_n \in \{S_1, S_2, ..., S_k\} - \{S_{max}, S_m\}$ . Then, select vertex  $v_n \in V(S_n)$  whose current subset is  $S_c$ , such that  $S_c \in \{S \in I | S \neq S_n\}$ . Move  $v_m$  to  $S_m$ , and  $v_n$  to  $S_n$ .

It is important to note that these move operators progressively lead the search toward a balanced partition since they basically constraint (partially with Move 2) vertex migration from heavy weight subsets to light weight subsets. Indeed, with Move 1 and the first choice of Move 2, a vertex can never be moved to a subset of the highest weight. The second choice of Move 2 is allowed to bring some diversification into the search. Let  $V_{cand} \subset V(S_m)$  be the set of the highest gain vertices which are considered for migration to subset  $S_m$ . The selection of vertex v, which is moved to  $S_m$ , is based on several pieces of history information.

This selection strategy is first conditioned by the tabu status (see IV-C2). It also employs two additional criteria which are based on vertex move frequency and vertex weight. The move frequency is a long term memory that records, for each vertex v, the number of times v has been moved to a different subset. Our usage of this frequency information penalizes moves with vertices having high frequency count, by giving priority to those that have been moved less often. If there is more than one vertex with the same move frequency in the set  $V_{cand}$ , we use the second criterion to distinguish them and prefer a vertex v which, when moved to subset  $S_m$ , minimizes the weight difference between the target subset  $S_m$  and the original subset  $S_c$ .

2) Tabu list and tabu tenure management: Each time a vertex v is moved from a subset  $S_c$  to another subset  $S_m$ , it is forbidden to move v back to its original subset  $S_c$  for the next tt iterations (tabu tenure). The tabu tenure tt of v is tuned adaptively according to the number of border vertices relative to  $S_c$ ,

$$tt(S_c)(v) = |V(S_c)| * \alpha,$$

where  $|V(S_c)|$  is the number of border vertices relative to  $S_c$ , and  $\alpha$  a parameter that takes randomly a value in the range [0.05, ..., 0.2].

3) Perturbation mechanism: Since our local search procedure focuses its search only around border (critical) vertices, it can get trapped in a local optimum. Therefore, we periodically apply a simple perturbation which consists in moving a fixed number of vertices  $\gamma$ , including nonborder ones, in the following way.

Let  $S_{max}$  be the set of vertices with the maximum vertex weight,  $S_{max} = max_{i \in \{1...k\}}\{W(S_i)\}$ . Randomly select a subset  $S_m \in \{S_1, S_2, ..., S_k\} - \{S_{max}\}$ . Then, randomly choose a vertex  $v_m$  whose current subset is  $S_c$ , such that  $S_c \in \{S \in I | W(S) > W(S_m)\}$ . Move the selected vertex  $v_m$ to subset  $S_m$ . This operation is repeated  $\gamma$  times (perturbation strength  $\gamma$  is set in this paper to 2% of the total number of vertices).

Making such moves introduces naturally more diversification into the search.

# D. Population updating based on distance

After offspring  $I^0$  has been obtained with the proposed multi-parent crossover operator, we improve it with the perturbation-based tabu search algorithm from Section IV-C, and then decide whether  $I^0$  should be inserted into the population. To base this decision, our algorithm combines the ideas presented in [34] and [28] and considers both the solution quality and the distance between individuals in population. Therefore, we first formally define the notion of distance between two individuals before presenting the used replacement strategy.

1) Distance measure: To determine the distance between two individuals  $I^A = \{S_1^A, S_2^A, ..., S_k^A\}$  and  $I^B =$  $\{S_1^B, S_2^B, ..., S_k^B\}$ , we use the well-known set-theoretic partition distance [17] (call it d), which is the minimum number of one-move steps needed to transform  $I^A$  to  $I^B$ , i.e.  $d(I^A, I^B) = |V| - sim(I^A, I^B)$ , where  $sim(I^A, I^B)$  is the similarity function.

Given the partition encoding from Section IV-A, the similarity function  $sim(I^A, I^B)$  is defined as  $max_{\sigma \in \Psi} \sum_{i=1}^k M_{i,\sigma(i)}$ , where  $\Psi$  is the set of all the possible permutations  $\sigma_{i,\sigma(i)}$  $\{1, 2, .., k\}$  and M a matrix with elements  $M_{i,j} = |S_i^A \cap S_j^B|$ . This function  $sim(I^A, I^B)$ , which reflects structural similarity, corresponds to the number of elements that do not need to be moved to transform  $I^A$  to  $I^B$ .

Algorithm 4 Pool updating strategy

**Require:** Population  $POP = \{I^1, ..., I^m\}$  and offspring  $I^0$ **Ensure:** Updated population  $POP = \{I^1, ..., I^m\}$ 

- 1: Tentatively add  $I^0$  to population:  $POP' = POP \cup \{I^0\}$ 2: for i := 0 to m do
- Calculate the minimum distance  $D_{i,POP'}$  between  $I^i$ 3: and any individual in POP' according to Eq.(2)
- Calculate the goodness score  $H_{i,POP'}$  of  $I^i$  according 4: to Eq.(3)
- 5: end for
- 6: Select individual  $I^w$ with the largest H score  $max_{j \in \{0..m\}} \{H_{j,POP'}\}$
- 7: Determine the minimum distance between two individuals:  $D_{min} = min_{j \in \{0...m\}} \{D_{j,POP'}\}$
- 8: if  $(I^0 \neq I^w)$  and  $(D_{0,POP} > D_{min} \text{ or } f(I^{best}) > f(I^0)))$ then
- Replace  $I^w$  with  $I^0: POP = POP \cup \{I^0\} \setminus \{I^w\}$ 9: 10: end if

2) Pool updating strategy: Given a population POP = $\{I^1, I^2, ..., I^m\}$  of size m and the distance  $d_{i,j}$  between any two individuals  $I^i$  and  $I^j$   $(i, j \in \{1...m\}$  and  $i \neq j$ ), the minimum distance between  $I^i$  and any other individual in POP is given by:

$$D_{i,POP} = min\{d_{i,j} | I^j \in POP, j \neq i\}$$

$$(2)$$

Offspring  $I^0$  is then inserted into POP if it is of the best quality relative to the population, or if  $D_{0,POP}$  >  $min_{i \in \{1...m\}} \{ (D_{i,POP}) \}$ , i.e. the minimum distance between  $I^0$  and any other individual in the population is greater than the minimum distance between any two individuals in the population. This idea was originally proposed in [34], and has shown to be very effective in ensuring the population diversity.

To determine the individual that is to be replaced by  $I^0$ , we adopt the strategy proposed in [28]. This strategy uses a quality-and-distance scoring function H to rank the individuals of the population.

$$H_{i,POP} = f(I^i) + \beta/D_{i,POP} \tag{3}$$

where f is the objective function defined in Section IV-A and  $\beta$  a parameter set to  $\beta = 0.08 * |V|$ .

7

Our pool updating strategy consists thus of three phases: for each individual  $I^i \in POP$ , calculating  $D_{i,POP}$  and the corresponding  $H_{i,POP}$  score (lines 2–5 of alg. 4); identifying the minimum distance  $D_{min}$  between any two individuals as well as the worst individual  $I^w$  (lines 6–7 of alg. 4); and updating the pool (lines 8–10 of alg. 4). This pool updating strategy contributes to maintaining a healthy diversity of the population.

# V. EXPERIMENTAL RESULTS

### A. Benchmark instances

To evaluate the efficiency of our proposed memetic approach, we carry out extensive experiments on a set of graphs that are frequently used to assess graph partitioning algorithms. These benchmark graphs are samples of small to medium scale real-life problems arising in different applications. They can be downloaded from Walshaw's Graph Partitioning Archive at: http://staffweb.cms.gre.ac.uk/~c.walshaw/partition/ in the same format as used by JOSTLE [44], METIS [25] and CHACO [18]. These graphs have unit vertex and edge weights. Table I shows the main characteristics of the graphs.

## B. Experimental protocol

There is generally a trade-off between execution time and partition quality. The preference of time vs. quality is problem dependent. For instance, in the context of network layout or VLSI design, even a slight improvement of partition quality can be of significant importance. For these applications, it is worthwhile to employ a partition algorithm able to obtain excellent quality solutions even if the algorithm is computationally intensive. On the other hand, in other cases like sparse matrix-vector multiplication, a very fast algorithm is indispensable since the computing time required for the partitioning task has to be less than the time needed by a fast vector multiplication algorithm.

Our MMA algorithm is designed to produce excellent quality partitions with the possibility to be used to generate solutions of various qualities depending on the amount of computing time allowed. We thus report computational results of two experiments with short and long runs of MMA. For the first experiment, we parameterize our MMA such that each run lasts from one second to 15 minutes depending on the size of the graph (see Table II and Section V-C). The second experiment aims to assess our MMA approach with respect to the best partitions reported at the Graph Partitioning Archive. For this experiment, we use a set of parameter values that lengthens each run of the MMA algorithm (see Section V-D). The second experiment allows us to test the limit of MMA and to obtain the best results possible with more computing budgets. Given the stochastic nature of MMA, computational statistics are based on 20 or 30 independent runs of MMA on each graph.

The proposed multilevel memetic algorithm is programmed in C++, and compiled with GNU gcc on a Xeon E5440 with 2.83 GHz and 8GB. The parameter settings applied in both experiments are reported in Table II. We fix experimentally the number of parents p for BBC relative to k: p = 3 for k = 16; p = 4 for k = 2, 32, 64; p = 5 for k = 4, 8.

 TABLE I

 The list of benchmark graphs together with their characteristics

	Size		Degree	2		
Grap h	V	E	Max	Min	Avg	Туре
add20	2395	7462	123	1	6.23	20-bit adder
data	2851	15093	17	3	10.59	3D FEM
3elt	4720	13722	9	3	5.81	2D nodal graph
uk	4824	6837	3	1	2.83	2D dual graph
add32	4960	9462	31	1	3.82	32-bit adder
bcsstk33	8738	291583	140	19	66.74	3D stiffness matrix
whitaker3	9800	28989	8	3	5.92	2D nodal graph
crack	10240	30380	9	3	5.93	2D nodal graph
wing-nodal	10937	75488	28	5	13.80	3D nodal graph
fe-4elt2	11143	32818	12	3	5.89	2D FEM
vibrobox	12328	165250	120	8	26.8	Sparse matrix
bcsstk29	13992	302748	70	4	43.27	3D stiffness matrix
4elt	15606	45878	10	3	5.88	2D nodal graph
fe-sphere	16386	49152	6	4	5.99	3D FEM
cti	16840	48232	6	3	5.73	3D semi-structured graph
memplus	17758	54196	573	1	6.10	Memory circuit
cs4	22499	43858	4	2	3.90	3D nodal graph
bcsstk30	28924	1007284	218	3	69.65	3D stiffness matrix
bcsstk31	35588	572914	188	1	32.197	3D stiffness matrix
fe-pwt	36519	144794	15	0	7.93	3D FEL
bcsstk32	44609	985046	215	1	44.1636	3D stiffness matrix
fe-body	45097	163734	28	0	7.26	3D FEM
t60k	60005	89440	3	2	2.98	2D dual graph
wing	62032	121544	4	2	2.57	3D dual graph
brack2	62631	366559	32	3	11.71	3D nodal graph
finan512	74752	261120	54	2	6.99	stochastic programming matrix
fe-tooth	78136	452591	39	3	11.58	3D FEM
fe-rotor	99617	662431	125	5	13.30	3D FEM
598a	110971	741934	26	5	13.37	3D FEM
fe-ocean	143437	409593	6	1	5.71	3D dual graph

 TABLE II

 Settings of important parameters.

Parameters	Description	Values for Comp. 1	Values for Comp. 2
k	number of partition subsets	[2, 4, 8, 16, 32, 64]	[2, 4, 8, 16, 32, 64]
$POP_s$	size of population	10	30
p	number of parents involved in crossover	[3, 4, 5]	[3, 4, 5]
$\lambda$	size of tournament pool	6	6
$\theta$	number of crossover operations	10	30
sr	number of TS iter. before crossover (line 7 of alg. 1)		10 *  V
lr	number of TS iter. after crossover	5 *  V	100 *  V
ct	coarsening threshold	200	200
$p_{str}$	perturbation strength	0.02 *  V	0.02 *  V
$\gamma$	non-improvement TS iter. before perturbation	0.01 *  V	0.01 *  V

## C. Computational results with short running time

In this section, we show computational results of the first experiment and compare our results with those of the latest versions of METIS (METIS-4.0) [25] and CHACO (CHACO-2.2) [18] available at the time of writing. For METIS, we use the multilevel pMetis algorithm, and for CHACO, we choose the multilevel KL algorithm with recursive bisection and a coarsening threshold of 100. Notice however that the purpose of this experiment is not to show a rigorous comparison of MMA with METIS and CHACO, given that MMA is a computationally intensive stochastic algorithm while METIS and CHACO are based on very fast heuristics (order of second) whose computing time cannot be tuned. Instead, we want to assess whether MMA can obtain good partitions with a reduced running time (one second to 15 minutes). Only for this purpose, we use the results of METIS and CHACO as our references. We do not claim that MMA can be a substitute for the existing fast partition packages. Therefore, this comparison should be interpreted with caution.

The computational results of the first experiment are shown in Table III. Columns two and three report respectively the partition quality obtained by pMetis and CHACO, while columns  $MMA_B$  and  $MMA_{Av}$  provide respectively the result of the best and average partition obtained with MMA (based on 30 independent runs per graph). We indicate the MMA's average partition in bold if it is better than the partitions obtained by both pMetis and CHACO. The last column shows the average time (in seconds) needed by our approach to generate the reported partition.

From Table III, we observe that the best partitions obtained with our MMA approach within a time limit ranging from less than one second up to 15 minutes are of far better quality in almost every case. In addition, the average quality of partitions obtained with MMA are also generally better than those of pMetis and CHACO.

However as k increases, MMA (but also pMetis) fails to generate partitions of perfect balance in some cases. For imbalanced partitions, we indicate in parentheses the degree of imbalance or '-' if the resulting partition has an imbalance degree greater than 1.07. For these cases, partition balance can not be completely established since the tabu search procedure does not move vertices strictly from the highest to the lightest weight subsets (see Section IV-C1). Although Move 1 of the

COMPARISON OF OUR MMA APPROACH WITH PMETIS AND CHACO FOR $k \in \{2, 4, 8, 16, 32, 64\}$ . PMETIS IS PART OF THE METIS FAMILY OF
MULTILEVEL PARTITIONING ALGORITHMS. CHACO IS A PACKAGE THAT INTEGRATES A VARIETY OF ALGORITHMS FOR GRAPH PARTITIONING. BESID
providing the values of partitions obtained with PMETIS and CHACO, we show the best $(MMA_B)$ and average $(MMA_{Av})$
partitions obtained with MMA after 30 runs, as well as the average time in seconds. If the partition is imbalanced, we report th
DEGREE OF IMBALANCE BETWEEN PARENTHESES.

	k-2					k-4					k-8				
Graph	nMetis	CHACO	MMAR	MMA	time	nMetis	CHACO	MMAR	MMA	time	nMetis	CHACO	MMAR	MMA	time
add20	729	742	697	709.0	0.9	1292	1329	1179	1205.1	3.6	1907	1867	1708	1730.7	8.4
data	218	199	189	195.0	0.8	480	433	383	409.7	3.0	842	783	674	699.6	3.2
3elt	108	103	90	103.2	1.5	231	234	201	208.4	4.8	388	389	348	359.5	49
uk	23	36	20	24.4	1.5	67	69	43	50.8	49	101	119	93	102.0	51
add32	21	11	10	12.8	1.0	42	56	33	39.5	7.5	81	115	66	76.9	71
hesstk33	10205	10172	10171	10224.4	17.1	23131	23723	21748	22119.0	37.6	40070	39070	34443	34585 1	51.3
whitaker3	135	131	127	127 3	51	406	425	383	394 3	17.1	719	765	659	669 3	12.7
crack	187	225	184	188.4	6.5	382	445	367	372.2	14.1	773	703	685	711.2	14.2
wing nodal	1820	1823	1708	1721 1	8.0	4000	4022	3582	3625.1	16.9	6070	6147	5445	5534.6	19.5
fe delt2	130	1025	130	1/21.1	10.4	350	4022	3/0	354.2	17.7	654	718	613	635 7	15.0
vibroboy	12427	11367	11184	1404.6	15.1	21471	21774	10288	10664.0	11.7	28177	33362	24790	24075 7	17.4
besetk20	28/3	3140	28/3	3030.1	20.0	8826	0202	8/05	8663 1	37.3	16555	18158	15760	16587.6	47.5
Aalt	154	159	120	170.4	14.2	406	422	227	260.6	25.6	625	200	549	10387.0 591 2	75.9
4ell	134	136	139	1/9.4	14.5	400	433	327	300.0	25.0	1220	1202	346	501.5 1221.9	20.4
re_sphere	440	424	380	380.0	18.1	8/2	852	//1	//3.8	20.2	1330	1302	1212	1231.8	23.0
cu	554	372	334	540.4	13.0	1115	1117	970	994.4	29.4	2110	2102	1801	18/0.0	31.2
memplus	6337	7549	5556	5645.4	29.3	10559	11535	9687	9916.6	63.5	13110	14265	12438	12546.3	73.8
cs4	414	517	374	379.0	28.6	1154	1166	977	1003.9	18.3	1746	1844	1497	1532.7	43.8
bcsstk30	6458	6563	6394	9664.5	91.6	17685	17106	16681	20002.4	127.7	36357	37406	35909	38441.3	113.9
bcsstk31	3638	3391	2767	3404.1	74.1	8770	9199	7699	8314.2	125.3	16012	15551	13465	15088.7	150.4
fe_pwt	366	362	340	428.8	85.8	738	911	707	722.6	91.2	1620	1670	1452	1486.5	92.9
bcsstk32	5672	6137	4667	5611.8	170.4	12205	15704	9386	11203.7	175.3	23601	25719	21790	23546.6	208.6
fe_body	311	1036	262	291.5	88.9	957	1415	672	802.6	188.8	1348	2277	1115	1290.5	137.0
t60k	100	91	84	111.3	176.7	255	235	221	256.7	199.6	561	524	490	524.6	205.2
wing	950	901	814	842.5	182.8	2086	1982	1696	1740.1	331.4	3205	3174	2595	2668.6	228.7
brack2	738	976	731	819.5	173.0	3250	3462	3087	3199.6	318.0	7844	8026	7246	7641.1	274.4
finan512	162	162	162	194.4	343	324	325	324	448.2	427.8	810	648	648	734.4	429.7
fe_tooth	4297	4642	3822	4019.1	277.8	8577	8430	6941	7110.9	435.1	13653	13484	11688	11966.6	344.2
fe_rotor	2190	2151	2098	2102.3	426.2	8564	8215	7310	7745.1	525.2	15712	15244	13026	13693.3	518.8
598a	2504	2465	2398	2405.5	504.8	8533	8975	8044	8240.1	645.7	17276	17530	16061	16524.2	598.5
fe ocean	505	499	464	647.2	977.4	2039	2110	1897	1910.5	894.6	4516	5309	4210	4313.1	984.1
							-						-		
	k=16	au co	26264	16164		k=32	G114 G0	26264	26264		k=64	arri do		26264	
Graph	k=16 pMetis	CHACO	MMA <sub>B</sub>	MMA <sub>Av</sub>	time	k=32 pMetis	CHACO	MMA <sub>B</sub>	MMA <sub>Av</sub>	time	k=64 pMetis	CHACO	MMA <sub>B</sub>	MMA <sub>Av</sub>	time
Graph add20	k=16 pMetis 2504	CHACO 2297	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2113	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2113.8	time 16.3	k=32 pMetis	CHACO 2684	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01)	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2439.4	time 20.6	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07)	CHACO 3349	MMA <sub>B</sub> 3050(1.05)	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 3068.7	time 38.5
Graph add20 data	k=16 pMetis 2504 1370	CHACO 2297 1360	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2113 1154	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2113.8 1168.3	time 16.3 3.4	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01)	CHACO 2684 2143	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01) 1859	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> 2439.4 1881.9	time 20.6 3.9	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03)	CHACO 3349 3145	MMA <sub>B</sub> 3050(1.05)	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 3068.7	time 38.5 -
Graph add20 data 3elt	k=16 pMetis 2504 1370 665	CHACO 2297 1360 660	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2113 1154 579	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2113.8 1168.3 589.9	time 16.3 3.4 5.4	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093	CHACO 2684 2143 1106	<i>MMA<sub>B</sub></i> 2447(1.01) 1859 978	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8	time 20.6 3.9 5.6	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710	CHACO 3349 3145 1722	MMA <sub>B</sub> 3050(1.05) - 1574	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>3068.7</b> - <b>1583.9</b>	time 38.5 - 6.4
Graph add20 data 3elt uk	k=16 pMetis 2504 1370 665 189	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211	<i>MMA<sub>B</sub></i> 2113 1154 579 164	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2113.8 1168.3 589.9 182.1	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01)	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343	<i>MMA<sub>B</sub></i> 2447(1.01) 1859 978 288(1.01)	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02)	CHACO 3349 3145 1722 540	<i>MMA<sub>B</sub></i> 3050(1.05) - 1574 513	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>3068.7</b> - <b>1583.9</b> 508.2	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32	k=16 pMetis 2504 1370 665 189 128	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174	<i>MMA<sub>B</sub></i> 2113 1154 579 164 117	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> 2113.8 1168.3 589.9 182.1 129.3	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01)	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303	<i>MMA<sub>B</sub></i> 2447(1.01) 1859 978 288(1.01) 212(1.01)	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8 224.9	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02)	CHACO 3349 3145 1722 540 730	MMA <sub>B</sub> 3050(1.05) - 1574 513 572	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>3068.7</b> - <b>1583.9</b> 508.2 <b>574.8</b>	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33	k=16 pMetis 2504 1370 665 189 128 59791	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174 61890	<i>MMA<sub>B</sub></i> 2113 1154 579 164 117 55522	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> 2113.8 1168.3 589.9 182.1 129.3 55800.7	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9 54.1	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01) 86008	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303 84613	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01) 1859 978 288(1.01) 212(1.01) 78844	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8 224.9 79374.2	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7 80.5	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02) 116203(1.01)	CHACO 3349 3145 1722 540 730 0)115530	<i>MMA<sub>B</sub></i> 3050(1.05) - 1574 513 572 125407	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>3068.7</b> - <b>1583.9</b> 508.2 <b>574.8</b> 125275.0	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2 142.4
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3	k=16 pMetis 2504 1370 665 189 128 59791 1237	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174 61890 1218	<i>MMA<sub>B</sub></i> 2113 1154 579 164 117 55522 1101	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> 2113.8 1168.3 589.9 182.1 129.3 55800.7 1121.6	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9 54.1 11.9	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01) 86008 1891	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303 84613 1895	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01) 1859 978 288(1.01) 212(1.01) 78844 1727	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8 224.9 79374.2 1750.7	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7 80.5 12.8	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02) 116203(1.01) 2796(1.01)	CHACO 3349 3145 1722 540 730 )115530 2811	<i>MMA<sub>B</sub></i> 3050(1.05) - 1574 513 572 125407 2594	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>3068.7</b> - <b>1583.9</b> 508.2 <b>574.8</b> 125275.0 <b>2621.2</b>	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2 142.4 14.9
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack	k=16 pMetis 2504 1370 665 189 128 59791 1237 1255	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174 61890 1218 1253	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2113 1154 579 164 117 55522 1101 1101	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>2113.8</b> <b>1168.3</b> <b>589.9</b> <b>182.1</b> 129.3 <b>55800.7</b> <b>1121.6</b> <b>1142.6</b>	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9 54.1 11.9 13.9	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01) 86008 1891 1890	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303 84613 1895 1962	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01) 1859 978 288(1.01) 212(1.01) 78844 1727 1730	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8 224.9 79374.2 1750.7 1767.4	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7 80.5 12.8 13.71	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02) 116203(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2847(1.01)	CHACO 3349 3145 540 730 )115530 2811 2904	<u>MMA</u> <sub>B</sub> 3050(1.05) - 1574 513 572 125407 2594 2609(1.01)	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>3068.7</b> - <b>1583.9</b> 508.2 <b>574.8</b> 125275.0 <b>2621.2</b> <b>2640.7</b>	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2 142.4 14.9 15.8
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal	k=16 pMetis 2504 1370 665 189 128 59791 1237 1255 9290	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174 61890 1218 1253 9273	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2113 1154 579 164 117 55522 1101 1101 8437	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>2113.8</b> <b>1168.3</b> <b>589.9</b> <b>182.1</b> 129.3 <b>55800.7</b> <b>1121.6</b> <b>1142.6</b> <b>8508.7</b>	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9 54.1 11.9 13.9 24.3	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01) 86008 1891 1890 13237	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303 84613 1895 1962 13258	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01) 1859 978 288(1.01) 212(1.01) 78844 1727 1730 11990	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>2439.4</b> <b>1881.9</b> <b>988.8</b> <b>307.8</b> <b>224.9</b> <b>79374.2</b> <b>1750.7</b> <b>1767.4</b> <b>12064.7</b>	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7 80.5 12.8 13.71 23.5	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02) 116203(1.01 2796(1.01) 2847(1.01) 17899(1.01)	CHACO 3349 3145 1722 540 730 )115530 2811 2904 17783	<u>MMA<sub>B</sub></u> 3050(1.05) - 1574 513 572 125407 2594 2609(1.01) 16075(1.01)	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>3068.7</b> - <b>1583.9</b> 508.2 <b>574.8</b> 125275.0 <b>2621.2</b> <b>2640.7</b> <b>16178</b>	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2 142.4 14.9 15.8 32.9
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2	k=16 pMetis 2504 1370 665 189 128 59791 1237 1255 9290 1152	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174 61890 1218 1253 9273 1135	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2113 1154 579 164 117 55522 1101 1101 8437 1015	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> 2113.8 1168.3 589.9 182.1 129.3 55800.7 1121.6 1142.6 8508.7 1041.8	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9 54.1 11.9 13.9 24.3 15.7	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01) 86008 1891 1890 13237 1787	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303 84613 1895 1962 13258 1796	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01)           1859           978           288(1.01)           212(1.01)           78844           1727           1730           11990           1655	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8 224.9 79374.2 1750.7 1767.4 12064.7 1681.8	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7 80.5 12.8 13.71 23.5 15.1	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02) 116203(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2847(1.01) 17899(1.01) 2765(1.01)	CHACO 3349 3145 1722 540 730 0)115530 2811 2904 17783 2781	<u>MMA_B</u> 3050(1.05) - 1574 513 572 125407 2594 2609(1.01) 16075(1.01) 2574	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>3068.7</b> <b>1583.9</b> 508.2 <b>574.8</b> 125275.0 <b>2621.2</b> <b>2640.7</b> <b>16178</b> <b>2585.6</b>	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2 142.4 14.9 15.8 32.9 17.5
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox	k=16 pMetis 2504 1370 665 189 128 59791 1237 1255 9290 1152 37441	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174 61890 1218 1253 9273 1135 43064	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2113 1154 579 164 117 55522 1101 1101 8437 1015 33919	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> 2113.8 1168.3 589.9 182.1 129.3 55800.7 1121.6 1142.6 8508.7 1041.8 34839.1	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9 54.1 11.9 13.9 24.3 15.7 73.2	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01) 86008 1891 1890 13237 1787 46112	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303 84613 1895 1962 13258 1796 51006	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01) 1859 978 288(1.01) 212(1.01) 78844 1727 1730 11990 1655 42579	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8 224.9 79374.2 1750.7 1767.4 12064.7 1681.8 45100.9	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7 80.5 12.8 13.71 23.5 15.1 94.2	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02) 116203(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2847(1.01) 17899(1.01) 2765(1.01) 53764(1.01)	CHACO 3349 3145 1722 540 730 )115530 2811 2904 17783 2781 58392	MMA <sub>B</sub> 3050(1.05) - 1574 513 572 125407 2594 2609(1.01) 16075(1.01) 2574 55189	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>3068.7</b> - <b>1583.9</b> 508.2 <b>574.8</b> 125275.0 <b>2621.2</b> <b>2640.7</b> <b>16178</b> <b>2585.6</b> <b>54632.1</b>	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2 142.4 14.9 15.8 32.9 17.5 135.8
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29	k=16 pMetis 2504 1370 665 189 128 59791 1237 1255 9290 1152 37441 28151	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174 61890 1218 1253 9273 1135 43064 28629	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2113 1154 579 164 117 55522 1101 1101 8437 1015 33919 24508	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>2113.8</b> <b>1168.3</b> <b>589.9</b> <b>182.1</b> 129.3 <b>55800.7</b> <b>1121.6</b> <b>1142.6</b> <b>8508.7</b> <b>1041.8</b> <b>34839.1</b> <b>25711.3</b>	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9 54.1 11.9 13.9 24.3 15.7 73.2 51.2	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01) 86008 1891 1890 13237 1787 46112 41190	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303 84613 1895 1962 13258 1796 51006 42935	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01)           1859           978           288(1.01)           212(1.01)           78844           1727           1730           11990           1655           42579           36330	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8 224.9 79374.2 1750.7 1767.4 12064.7 1681.8 45100.9 37265.4	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7 80.5 12.8 13.71 23.5 15.1 94.2 57.9	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02) 116203(1.01) 2847(1.01) 17899(1.01) 2765(1.01) 53764(1.01) 62891(1.01)	CHACO 3349 3145 1722 540 )115530 2811 2904 17783 2781 58392 63576	MMA <sub>B</sub> 3050(1.05)           -           1574           513           572           125407           2594           2609(1.01)           16075(1.01)           2574           55189           58272(1.01)	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>3068.7</b> - <b>1583.9</b> 508.2 <b>574.8</b> 125275.0 <b>2621.2</b> <b>2640.7</b> <b>16178</b> <b>2585.6</b> 54632.1 <b>58607.5</b>	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2 142.4 14.9 15.8 32.9 17.5 135.8 93.2
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt	k=16 pMetis 2504 1370 665 189 128 59791 1237 1255 9290 1152 37441 28151 1056	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174 61890 1218 1253 9273 1135 43064 28629 1083	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2113 1154 579 164 117 55522 1101 1101 8437 1015 33919 24508 951	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>2113.8</b> <b>1168.3</b> <b>589.9</b> <b>182.1</b> 129.3 <b>55800.7</b> <b>1121.6</b> <b>1142.6</b> <b>8508.7</b> <b>1041.8</b> <b>34839.1</b> <b>25711.3</b> <b>983.3</b>	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9 554.1 11.9 13.9 24.3 15.7 73.2 51.2 24.2	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01) 86008 1891 13237 1787 46112 41190 1769	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303 84613 1895 1962 13258 1796 51006 42935 1766	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01)           1859           978           288(1.01)           212(1.01)           78844           1727           1730           11990           1655           42579           36330           1597	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8 224.9 79374.2 1750.7 1767.4 12064.7 1681.8 45100.9 37265.4 1650.5	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7 80.5 12.8 13.71 23.5 15.1 94.2 57.9 27.3	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02) 116203(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2847(1.01) 17899(1.01) 2765(1.01) 53764(1.01) 62891(1.01) 2953	CHACO 3349 3145 540 730 )115530 2811 2904 17783 2781 58392 63576 2921	<u>MMA<sub>B</sub></u> 3050(1.05) - 1574 513 572 125407 2594 2609(1.01) 16075(1.01) 2574 55189 58272(1.01) 2640	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>3068.7</b> - <b>1583.9</b> 508.2 <b>574.8</b> 125275.0 <b>2621.2</b> <b>2640.7</b> <b>16178</b> <b>2585.6</b> 54632.1 <b>58607.5</b> <b>2692.9</b>	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2 142.4 14.9 15.8 32.9 17.5 135.8 93.2 28.0
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere	k=16 pMetis 2504 1370 665 189 128 59791 1237 1255 9290 1152 37441 28151 1056 2030	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174 61890 1218 1253 9273 1135 43064 28629 1083 2037	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2113 1154 579 164 117 55522 1101 1101 8437 1015 33919 24508 951 1752	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>2113.8</b> <b>1168.3</b> <b>589.9</b> <b>182.1</b> 129.3 <b>55800.7</b> <b>1121.6</b> <b>1142.6</b> <b>8508.7</b> <b>1041.8</b> <b>34839.1</b> <b>25711.3</b> <b>983.3</b> <b>1806.3</b>	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9 54.1 11.9 13.9 24.3 15.7 73.2 51.2 24.2 26.8	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01) 86008 1891 1890 13237 1787 46112 41190 1769 2913	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303 84613 1895 1962 13258 1796 51006 42935 1766 2920	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01)           1859           978           288(1.01)           212(1.01)           78844           1727           1730           11990           1655           42579           36330           1597           2638	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8 224.9 79374.2 1750.7 1767.4 12064.7 1681.8 45100.9 37265.4 1650.5 2686.7	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7 80.5 12.8 13.71 23.5 15.1 94.2 57.9 27.3 24.6	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02) 116203(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2765(1.01) 53764(1.01) 62891(1.01) 2953 4191	CHACO 3349 3145 540 730 0)115530 2811 2904 17783 2781 58392 63576 2921 4151	MMA <sub>B</sub> 3050(1.05) - 1574 513 572 125407 2594 2609(1.01) 16075(1.01) 2574 55189 58272(1.01) 2640 3803	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>3068.7</b> <b>-</b> <b>1583.9</b> <b>508.2</b> <b>574.8</b> 125275.0 <b>2621.2</b> <b>2640.7</b> <b>16178</b> <b>2585.6</b> <b>54632.1</b> <b>58607.5</b> <b>2692.9</b> <b>3834.5</b>	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2 142.4 14.9 15.8 32.9 17.5 135.8 93.2 28.0 29
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti	k=16 pMetis 2504 1370 665 189 128 59791 1237 1255 9290 1152 37441 28151 1056 2030 3181	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174 61890 1218 1253 9273 1135 43064 28629 1083 2037 3083	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2113           1154           579           164           117           55522           1101           8437           1015           33919           24508           951           1752           2921	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2113.8 1168.3 589.9 182.1 129.3 55800.7 1121.6 1142.6 8508.7 1041.8 34839.1 25711.3 983.3 1806.3 2989.6	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9 54.1 11.9 13.9 24.3 15.7 73.2 51.2 24.2 26.8 29.9	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01) 86008 1891 1890 13237 1787 46112 41190 1769 2913 4605	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303 84613 1895 1962 13258 1796 51006 42935 1766 2920 4532	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01)           1859           978           288(1.01)           212(1.01)           78844           1727           1730           11990           1655           42579           36330           1597           2638           4243	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8 224.9 79374.2 1750.7 1767.4 12064.7 1681.8 45100.9 37265.4 1650.5 2686.7 4335.3	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7 80.5 12.8 13.71 23.5 15.1 94.2 57.9 27.3 24.6 28.3	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02) 116203(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2795(1.01) 53764(1.01) 62891(1.01) 2953 4191 6461	CHACO 3349 3145 1722 540 730 0115530 2811 2904 17783 2781 58392 63576 2921 4151 6334	MMA <sub>B</sub> 3050(1.05) - 1574 513 572 125407 2594 2609(1.01) 16075(1.01) 2574 55189 58272(1.01) 2640 3803 66014	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>3068.7</b> - <b>1583.9</b> 508.2 <b>574.8</b> 125275.0 <b>2621.2</b> <b>2640.7</b> <b>16178</b> <b>2585.6</b> 54632.1 <b>58607.5</b> <b>2692.9</b> <b>3834.5</b> <b>6070.8</b>	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2 142.4 14.9 15.8 32.9 17.5 135.8 93.2 28.0 29 35.3
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus	k=16 pMetis 2504 1370 665 189 128 59791 1237 1255 9290 1152 37441 28151 1056 2030 3181 14942	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174 61890 1218 1253 9273 1135 43064 28629 1083 2037 3083 16433	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2113 1154 579 164 117 55522 1101 1101 8437 1015 33919 24508 951 1752 2921 13361	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2113.8 1168.3 589.9 182.1 129.3 55800.7 1121.6 1142.6 8508.7 1041.8 34839.1 25711.3 983.3 1806.3 2989.6 13558.5	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9 54.1 11.9 13.9 24.3 15.7 73.2 51.2 24.2 26.8 29.9 273.8	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01) 86008 1891 1890 13237 1787 46112 41190 1769 2913 4605 17303	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303 84613 1895 1962 13258 1796 51006 42935 1766 2920 4532 17936	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01)           1859           978           288(1.01)           212(1.01)           78844           1727           1730           11990           1655           42579           36330           1597           2638           4243           14778	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8 224.9 79374.2 1750.7 1767.4 12064.7 1681.8 45100.9 37265.4 1650.5 2686.7 4335.3 15110.4	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7 80.5 12.8 13.71 23.5 15.1 94.2 57.9 27.3 24.6 28.3 569.6	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02) 116203(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2847(1.01) 17899(1.01) 2765(1.01) 53764(1.01) 62891(1.01) 2953 4191 6461 19140(1.01)	CHACO 3349 3145 1722 540 730 )115530 2811 2904 17783 2781 58392 63576 2921 4151 6334 18978	MMA <sub>B</sub> 3050(1.05) - 1574 513 572 125407 2594 2609(1.01) 16075(1.01) 2574 55189 58272(1.01) 2640 3803 6014 -	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>3068.7</b> - <b>1583.9</b> 508.2 <b>574.8</b> 125275.0 <b>2621.2</b> <b>2640.7</b> <b>16178</b> <b>2585.6</b> <b>54632.1</b> <b>58607.5</b> <b>2692.9</b> <b>3834.5</b> <b>6070.8</b> -	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2 142.4 14.9 15.8 32.9 17.5 135.8 93.2 28.0 29 35.3 -
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4	k=16 pMetis 2504 1370 665 189 128 59791 1237 1255 9290 1152 37441 28151 1056 2030 3181 14942 2538	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174 61890 1218 1253 9273 1135 43064 28629 1083 2037 3083 16433 2552	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2113           1154           579           164           117           55522           1101           1101           8437           1015           33919           24508           951           1752           2921           13361           2160	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2113.8 1168.3 589.9 182.1 129.3 55800.7 1121.6 1142.6 8508.7 1041.8 34839.1 25711.3 983.3 1806.3 2989.6 13558.5 2221.7	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9 54.1 11.9 13.9 24.3 15.7 73.2 51.2 24.2 26.8 29.9 273.8 44.8	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01) 86008 1890 13237 1787 46112 41190 1769 2913 4605 17303 3579	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303 84613 1895 1962 13258 1796 51006 42935 1766 2920 4532 17936 3588	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01)           1859           978           288(1.01)           212(1.01)           78844           1727           1730           11990           1655           42579           36330           1597           2638           4243           14778           3057	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8 224.9 79374.2 1750.7 1767.4 12064.7 1681.8 45100.9 37265.4 1650.5 2686.7 4335.3 15110.4 3111.6	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7 80.5 12.8 13.71 23.5 15.1 94.2 57.9 27.3 24.6 28.3 569.6 39.6	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02) 116203(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2795(1.01) 17899(1.01) 2765(1.01) 53764(1.01) 62891(1.01) 2953 4191 6461 19140(1.01) 4791	CHACO 3349 3145 1722 540 730 )115530 2811 2904 17783 2781 58392 2904 17783 2781 58392 2921 4151 63374 4151 63376 2921	MMA <sub>B</sub> 3050(1.05) - 1574 5513 572 125407 2594 2609(1.01) 16075(1.01) 2574 55189 58272(1.01) 2640 3803 6014 - 4219	MMA <sub>Av</sub> <b>3068.7</b> - <b>1583.9</b> 508.2 <b>574.8</b> 125275.0 <b>2621.2</b> <b>2640.7</b> <b>16178</b> <b>2585.6</b> 54632.1 <b>58607.5</b> <b>2692.9</b> <b>3834.5</b> <b>6070.8</b> - <b>4278.9</b>	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2 142.4 14.9 15.8 32.9 17.5 135.8 93.2 28.0 29 35.3 - 49.8
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30	k=16 pMetis 2504 1370 665 189 128 59791 1237 1255 9290 1152 37441 28151 1056 2030 3181 14942 2538 77293	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174 61890 1218 1253 9273 1135 43064 28629 1083 2037 3083 16433 2552 81069	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2113           1154           579           164           117           55522           1101           1015           33919           24508           951           1752           2921           13361           2160           76258	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> 2113.8 1168.3 589.9 182.1 129.3 55800.7 1121.6 1142.6 8508.7 1041.8 34839.1 25711.3 983.3 1806.3 2989.6 13558.5 2221.7 76954.5	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9 54.1 11.9 24.3 15.7 73.2 24.2 26.8 29.9 273.8 44.8 141.9	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01) 86008 1891 1890 13237 1787 46112 41190 1769 2913 4605 17303 3579 131405	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303 84613 1895 1962 13258 1796 51006 42935 1766 2920 4532 17936 3588 128694	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01) 1859 978 288(1.01) 212(1.01) 78844 1727 1730 11990 1655 42579 36330 1597 2638 4243 14778 3057 119413	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8 224.9 79374.2 1750.7 1767.4 12064.7 1681.8 45100.9 37265.4 1650.5 2686.7 4335.3 15110.4 3111.6 123824.0	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7 80.5 12.8 13.71 23.5 15.1 94.2 57.9 27.3 24.6 28.3 569.6 39.6 267.3	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02) 116203(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2765(1.01) 53764(1.01) 62891(1.01) 2953 4191 6461 19140(1.01) 4791 191691	CHACO 3349 3145 1722 540 730 0)115530 2811 2904 17783 2781 58392 63576 2921 4151 6334 18978 4817 191445	MMA <sub>B</sub> 3050(1.05) - 1574 513 572 125407 2594 2609(1.01) 16075(1.01) 2574 55189 58272(1.01) 2640 3803 6014 - 4219 184829	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>3068.7</b> <b>1583.9</b> <b>508.2</b> <b>574.8</b> 125275.0 <b>2640.7</b> <b>16178</b> <b>2585.6</b> <b>54632.1</b> <b>58607.5</b> <b>2692.9</b> <b>3834.5</b> <b>6070.8</b> <b>-</b> <b>4278.9</b> <b>204726.0</b>	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2 142.4 14.9 15.8 32.9 17.5 135.8 93.2 28.0 29 35.3 - 49.8 662.3
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30	k=16           pMetis           2504           1370           665           189           128           59791           1237           1255           9290           1152           37441           28151           1056           2030           3181           14942           2538           77293	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174 61890 1218 1253 9273 1135 43064 28629 1083 2037 3083 16433 2552 81069	$\begin{array}{c} MMA_B \\ 2113 \\ 1154 \\ 579 \\ 164 \\ 117 \\ 55522 \\ 1101 \\ 1101 \\ 8437 \\ 1015 \\ 33919 \\ 24508 \\ 951 \\ 1752 \\ 2921 \\ 13361 \\ 2160 \\ 76258 \end{array}$	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> 2113.8 1168.3 589.9 182.1 129.3 55800.7 1121.6 1142.6 8508.7 1041.8 34839.1 25711.3 983.3 1806.3 2989.6 13558.5 2221.7 76954.5	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9 54.1 11.9 13.9 24.3 15.7 73.2 51.2 24.2 26.8 29.9 273.8 44.8 141.9	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01) 86008 1891 1890 13237 1787 46112 41190 1769 2913 4605 17303 3579 131405	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303 84613 1895 1962 13258 1796 51006 42935 1766 2920 4532 17936 3588 128694	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01)           1859           978           288(1.01)           212(1.01)           78844           1727           1730           11990           1655           42579           36330           1597           2638           4243           14778           3057           119413	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8 224.9 79374.2 1750.7 1767.4 12064.7 1681.8 45100.9 37265.4 1650.5 2686.7 4335.3 15110.4 3111.6 123824.0	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7 80.5 12.8 13.71 23.5 15.1 94.2 57.9 27.3 24.6 28.3 569.6 39.6 267.3	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02) 116203(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2765(1.01) 53764(1.01) 62891(1.01) 2953 4191 6461 19140(1.01) 4791 191691	CHACO 3349 3145 1722 540 730 0)115530 2811 2904 17783 2781 58392 63576 2921 4151 6334 18978 4817 191445	MMA <sub>B</sub> 3050(1.05) - 1574 513 572 125407 2594 2609(1.01) 16075(1.01) 2574 55189 58272(1.01) 2640 3803 60014 - 4219 184829	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>3068.7</b> <b>1583.9</b> <b>508.2</b> <b>574.8</b> 125275.0 <b>2621.2</b> <b>2640.7</b> <b>16178</b> <b>2585.6</b> <b>54632.1</b> <b>58607.5</b> <b>2692.9</b> <b>3834.5</b> <b>6070.8</b> <b>-</b> <b>4278.9</b> 204726.0	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2 142.4 14.9 15.8 32.9 17.5 135.8 93.2 28.0 29 35.3 - 49.8 662.3
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk31	k=16           pMetis           2504           1370           665           189           128           59791           1237           1255           9290           1152           37441           28151           1056           2030           3181           14942           2538           77293           27180	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174 61890 1218 1253 9273 1135 43064 28629 1083 2037 3083 16433 2552 81069 28557	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2113 1154 579 164 117 55522 1101 1101 8437 1015 33919 24508 951 1752 2921 13361 2160 76258 24934	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2113.8 1168.3 589.9 182.1 129.3 55800.7 1121.6 1142.6 8508.7 1041.8 34839.1 25711.3 983.3 1806.3 2989.6 13558.5 2221.7 76954.5 26192.0	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9 54.1 11.9 13.9 24.3 15.7 73.2 51.2 24.2 26.8 29.9 273.8 44.8 141.9 147.3	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01) 86008 1891 1890 13237 1787 46112 41190 1769 2913 4605 17303 3579 131405 42645	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303 84613 1895 1962 13258 1796 51006 42935 1796 51006 42935 1766 2920 4532 17936 3588 128694 45354	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01)           1859           978           288(1.01)           212(1.01)           78844           1727           1730           11990           1655           42579           36330           1597           2638           4243           14778           3057           119413           40742	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8 224.9 79374.2 1750.7 1767.4 12064.7 1681.8 45100.9 37265.4 1650.5 2686.7 4335.3 15110.4 3111.6 123824.0 41573.5	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7 80.5 12.8 13.71 23.5 15.1 94.2 57.9 27.3 24.6 28.3 569.6 39.6 267.3 123.1	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02) 116203(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2795(1.01) 53764(1.01) 62891(1.01) 53764(1.01) 62891(1.01) 4191 6461 19140(1.01) 4791 191691 66526	CHACO 3349 3145 1722 540 730 0115530 2811 2904 17783 2781 58392 63576 2921 4151 6334 18978 4817 191445 68375	MMA <sub>B</sub> 3050(1.05) - 1574 513 572 125407 2594 2609(1.01) 16075(1.01) 2574 55189 58272(1.01) 2640 3803 6014 - 4219 184829 61778	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>3068.7</b> <b>1583.9</b> 508.2 <b>574.8</b> 125275.0 <b>2621.2</b> <b>2640.7</b> <b>16178</b> <b>2585.6</b> 54632.1 <b>58607.5</b> <b>2692.9</b> <b>3834.5</b> <b>6070.8</b> <b>-</b> <b>4278.9</b> 204726.0 <b>63207.6</b>	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2 142.4 14.9 15.8 32.9 17.5 135.8 93.2 28.0 29 35.3 - 49.8 662.3 266.1
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe pwt	k=16           pMetis           2504           1370           665           189           128           59791           1237           1255           9290           1152           37441           28151           1056           2030           3181           14942           2538           77293           27180           2933	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174 61890 1218 1253 9273 1135 43064 28629 1083 2037 3083 16433 2552 81069 28557 3200	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2113           1154           579           164           117           55522           1101           1101           8437           1015           33919           24508           951           1752           2921           13361           2160           76258           24934           2839	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2113.8 1168.3 589.9 182.1 129.3 55800.7 1121.6 1142.6 8508.7 1041.8 34839.1 25711.3 983.3 1806.3 2989.6 13558.5 2221.7 76954.5 26192.0 2864.5	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9 54.1 11.9 13.9 24.3 15.7 73.2 51.2 24.2 26.8 29.9 273.8 44.8 141.9 147.3 83.4	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01) 86008 1891 1890 13237 1787 46112 41190 1769 2913 4605 17303 3579 131405 42645 6029	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303 84613 1895 1962 13258 1796 51006 42935 1766 2920 4532 17936 3588 128694 45354 6036	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01)           1859           978           288(1.01)           212(1.01)           78844           1727           1730           11990           1655           42579           36330           1597           2638           4243           14778           3057           119413           40742           5783	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8 224.9 79374.2 1750.7 1767.4 12064.7 1681.8 45100.9 37265.4 1650.5 2686.7 4335.3 15110.4 3111.6 123824.0	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7 80.5 12.8 13.71 23.5 15.1 94.2 57.9 27.3 24.6 28.3 569.6 39.6 267.3 123.1 92.8	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02) 116203(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2847(1.01) 2765(1.01) 53764(1.01) 62891(1.01) 2953 4191 6461 19140(1.01) 4791 191691 66526 9310	CHACO 3349 3145 1722 540 730 115530 2811 2904 2904 2904 2904 2904 2904 2904 2904	MMA <sub>B</sub> 3050(1.05) - 1574 513 572 125407 2594 2609(1.01) 16075(1.01) 2574 55189 58272(1.01) 2640 3803 6014 - 4219 184829 61778 8532	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>3068.7</b> - <b>1583.9</b> 508.2 <b>574.8</b> 125275.0 <b>2621.2</b> <b>2640.7</b> <b>16178</b> <b>2585.6</b> 54632.1 <b>58607.5</b> <b>2692.9</b> <b>3834.5</b> <b>6070.8</b> - <b>4278.9</b> 204726.0 <b>63207.6</b> <b>8577.7</b>	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2 142.4 14.9 15.8 32.9 17.5 135.8 93.2 28.0 29 35.3 - 49.8 662.3 2666.1 96.8
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe_pwt bcsstk32	k=16           pMetis           2504           1370           665           189           128           59791           1237           1255           9290           1152           37441           28151           1056           2030           3181           14942           2538           77293           27180           2933           43371	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174 61890 1218 1253 9273 1135 43064 28629 1083 2037 3083 16433 2552 81069 28557 3200 47829	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2113           1154           579           164           117           55522           1101           8437           1015           33919           24508           951           1752           2921           13361           2160           76258           24934           2839           38361	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2113.8 1168.3 589.9 182.1 129.3 55800.7 1121.6 1142.6 8508.7 1041.8 34839.1 25711.3 983.3 1806.3 2989.6 13558.5 2221.7 76954.5 26192.0 2864.5 40966.4	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9 54.1 11.9 24.3 15.7 73.2 24.3 15.7 73.2 24.2 26.8 29.9 273.8 44.8 141.9 147.3 83.4 214.2	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01) 86008 1891 1890 13237 1787 46112 41190 1769 2913 4605 17303 3579 131405 42645 6029 70020	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303 84613 1895 1962 13258 1796 51006 42935 1766 2920 4532 17936 3588 128694 45354 6036 73377	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01) 1859 978 288(1.01) 212(1.01) 78844 1727 1730 11990 1655 42579 36330 1597 2638 4243 14778 3057 119413 40742 5783 64186	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8 224.9 79374.2 1750.7 1767.4 12064.7 1681.8 45100.9 37265.4 1650.5 2686.7 4335.3 15110.4 3111.6 123824.0 41573.5 5966.2 68541.7	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7 80.5 12.8 13.71 23.5 15.1 94.2 57.9 27.3 24.6 28.3 569.6 267.3 123.1 92.8 406.7	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02) 116203(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2847(1.01) 2765(1.01) 2765(1.01) 53764(1.01) 62891(1.01) 53764(1.01) 62891(1.01) 2953 4191 6461 19140(1.01) 4791 191691 66526 9310 106733	CHACO 3349 3145 540 730 )115530 2811 2904 17783 2781 58392 63576 63576 63576 6334 18978 4817 191445 68375 9231 108855	MMA <sub>B</sub> 3050(1.05) - 1574 5513 572 125407 2594 2609(1.01) 16075(1.01) 2574 55189 58272(1.01) 2640 3803 6014 - 4219 184829 61778 8532 101861	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>3068.7</b> - <b>1583.9</b> 508.2 <b>574.8</b> 125275.0 <b>2640.7</b> <b>16178</b> <b>2585.6</b> 54632.1 <b>58607.5</b> <b>2692.9</b> <b>3834.5</b> <b>6070.8</b> - <b>4278.9</b> 204726.0 <b>63207.6</b> <b>8577.7</b> <b>106247.0</b>	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2 142.4 14.9 15.8 32.9 17.5 135.8 93.2 28.0 29 35.3 - 49.8 662.3 266.1 96.8 711.8
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe_pwt bcsstk32 fe_body	k=16           pMetis           2504           1370           665           189           128           59791           1237           1255           9290           1152           37441           28151           1056           2030           3181           14942           2538           77293           27180           2933           43371           2181	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174 61890 1218 1253 9273 1135 43064 28629 1083 2037 3083 16433 2552 81069 28557 3200 47829 2947	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2113           1154           579           164           117           55522           1101           1101           8437           1015           33919           24508           951           1752           2921           13361           2160           76258           24934           2839           38361           2118	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>2113.8</b> <b>1168.3</b> <b>589.9</b> <b>182.1</b> 129.3 <b>55800.7</b> <b>1121.6</b> <b>1142.6</b> <b>8508.7</b> <b>1041.8</b> <b>34839.1</b> <b>25711.3</b> <b>983.3</b> <b>1806.3</b> <b>2989.6</b> <b>13558.5</b> <b>2221.7</b> <b>76954.5</b> <b>26192.0</b> <b>2864.5</b> <b>40966.4</b> <b>2201.7</b> <i>7</i>	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9 54.1 11.9 13.9 24.3 15.7 73.2 51.2 24.2 26.8 29.9 273.8 44.8 141.9 147.3 83.4 214.2 140.4	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01) 86008 1891 1890 13237 1787 46112 41190 1769 2913 4605 17303 3579 131405 42645 6029 70020 3424	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303 84613 1895 1962 13258 1796 51006 42935 1766 51006 42935 1766 2920 4532 17936 3588 128694 45354 6036 73377 4194	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01)           1859           978           288(1.01)           212(1.01)           78844           1727           1730           11990           1655           42579           36330           1597           2638           4243           14778           3057           119413           40742           5783           64186           3385	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8 224.9 79374.2 1750.7 1767.4 12064.7 1681.8 45100.9 37265.4 1650.5 2686.7 4335.3 15110.4 3111.6 123824.0 41573.5 5966.2 68541.7 3516.2	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7 80.5 12.8 13.71 23.5 15.1 94.2 57.9 27.3 24.6 28.3 569.6 39.6 267.3 123.1 92.8 406.7 137.4	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02) 116203(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2765(1.01) 53764(1.01) 62891(1.01) 2953 4191 6461 19140(1.01) 4791 191691 66526 9310 106733 5843	CHACO 3349 3145 1722 540 730 0)115530 2811 2904 17783 2781 58392 63576 2921 4151 6334 18978 4817 191445 68375 9231 108855 6326	MMA <sub>B</sub> 3050(1.05)           -           1574           513           572           125407           2594           2609(1.01)           16075(1.01)           2574           5189           58272(1.01)           2640           3803           6014           -           4219           184829           61778           8532           101861           5576	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>3068.7</b> - <b>1583.9</b> 508.2 <b>574.8</b> 125275.0 <b>2621.2</b> <b>2640.7</b> <b>16178</b> <b>2585.6</b> 54632.1 <b>58607.5</b> <b>2692.9</b> <b>3834.5</b> <b>6070.8</b> - <b>4278.9</b> 204726.0 <b>63207.6</b> <b>8577.7</b> <b>106247.0</b> <b>5683.7</b>	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2 142.4 14.9 15.8 32.9 17.5 135.8 93.2 28.0 29 35.3 - 49.8 662.3 266.1 96.8 711.8 142.5
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe_pwt bcsstk32 fe_body t60k	k=16           pMetis           2504           1370           665           189           128           59791           1237           1255           9290           1152           37441           28151           1056           2030           3181           14942           2538           77293           27180           2933           43371           2181           998	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174 61890 1218 1253 9273 1135 43064 28629 1083 2037 3083 16433 2552 81069 28557 3200 47829 2947 977	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2113 1154 579 164 117 55522 1101 1101 8437 1015 33919 24508 951 1752 2921 13361 2160 76258 24934 2839 38361 2118 899	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>2113.8</b> <b>1168.3</b> <b>589.9</b> <b>182.1</b> 129.3 <b>55800.7</b> <b>1121.6</b> <b>1142.6</b> <b>8508.7</b> <b>1041.8</b> <b>34839.1</b> <b>25711.3</b> <b>983.3</b> <b>1806.3</b> <b>2989.6</b> <b>13558.5</b> <b>2221.7</b> <b>76954.5</b> <b>26192.0</b> <b>2864.5</b> <b>40966.4</b> <b>2201.7</b> <b>922.9</b>	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9 54.1 11.9 13.9 24.3 15.7 73.2 51.2 24.2 26.8 29.9 273.8 44.8 141.9 147.3 83.4 214.2 140.4 228.9	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01) 86008 1891 1890 13237 1787 46112 41190 1769 2913 4605 17303 3579 131405 42645 6029 70020 3424 1613	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303 84613 1895 1962 13258 1796 51006 42935 1766 2920 4532 17936 3588 128694 45354 6036 73377 4194 1594	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01)           1859           978           288(1.01)           212(1.01)           78844           1727           1730           11990           1655           42579           36330           1597           2638           4243           14778           3057           119413           40742           5783           64186           3385           1488	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8 224.9 79374.2 1750.7 1767.4 12064.7 1681.8 45100.9 37265.4 1650.5 2686.7 4335.3 15110.4 3111.6 123824.0 41573.5 5966.2 68541.7 3516.2 1549.3	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7 80.5 12.8 13.71 23.5 15.1 94.2 57.9 27.3 24.6 28.3 569.6 39.6 267.3 123.1 92.8 406.7 137.4 194.5	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02) 626(1.02) 116203(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2847(1.01) 17899(1.01) 2847(1.01) 62891(1.01) 2953 4191 6461 19140(1.01) 4791 191691 66526 9310 106733 5843 2484	CHACO 3349 3145 1722 540 730 115530 2811 2904 17783 2781 58392 63576 2921 4151 6334 18978 4817 191445 68375 9231 108855 6326 6326	MMA <sub>B</sub> 3050(1.05)           -           1574           513           572           125407           2594           2609(1.01)           16075(1.01)           2574           55189           58272(1.01)           2640           3803           6014           -           4219           184829           61778           8532           101861           5576           2331	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>3068.7</b> - <b>1583.9</b> 508.2 <b>574.8</b> 125275.0 <b>2621.2</b> <b>2640.7</b> <b>16178</b> <b>2585.6</b> 54632.1 <b>58607.5</b> <b>2692.9</b> <b>3834.5</b> <b>6070.8</b> - <b>4278.9</b> 204726.0 <b>63207.6</b> <b>8577.7</b> <b>106247.0</b> <b>5683.7</b> <b>2397 7</b>	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2 142.4 14.9 15.8 32.9 17.5 135.8 93.2 28.0 29 35.3 - 49.8 662.3 266.1 96.8 711.8 142.5 201.7
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe_pwt bcsstk32 fe_body t60k wing	k=16           pMetis           2504           1370           665           189           128           59791           1237           1255           9290           1152           37441           28151           1056           2030           3181           14942           2538           77293           27180           2933           43371           2181           998           4666	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174 61890 1218 1253 9273 1135 43064 28629 1083 2037 3083 16433 2552 81069 28557 3200 47829 2947 977 4671	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2113           1154           579           164           117           55522           1101           1101           8437           1015           33919           24508           951           1752           2921           13361           2160           76258           24934           2839           38361           2118           899           4076	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>2113.8</b> <b>1168.3</b> <b>589.9</b> <b>182.1</b> 129.3 <b>55800.7</b> <b>1121.6</b> <b>1142.6</b> <b>8508.7</b> <b>1041.8</b> <b>34839.1</b> <b>25711.3</b> <b>983.3</b> <b>1806.3</b> <b>2989.6</b> <b>13558.5</b> <b>2221.7</b> <b>76954.5</b> <b>26192.0</b> <b>2864.5</b> <b>40966.4</b> <b>2201.7</b> <b>922.9</b> <b>4154 1</b>	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9 54.1 11.9 13.9 24.3 15.7 73.2 51.2 24.2 26.8 29.9 273.8 44.8 141.9 147.3 83.4 214.2 140.4 228.9 235.1	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01) 86008 1891 13237 1787 46112 41190 1769 2913 4605 17303 3579 131405 42645 6029 70020 3424 1613 6700	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303 84613 1895 1962 13258 1796 51006 42935 1766 2920 4532 17936 3588 128694 45354 6036 73377 4194 1594 6843	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01)           1859           978           288(1.01)           212(1.01)           78844           1727           1730           11990           1655           42579           36330           1597           2638           4243           14778           3057           119413           40742           5783           64186           3385           1488           5896	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8 224.9 79374.2 1750.7 1767.4 12064.7 1681.8 45100.9 37265.4 1650.5 2686.7 4335.3 15110.4 3111.6 123824.0 41573.5 5966.2 68541.7 3516.2 1549.3 66001 0	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7 80.5 12.8 13.71 23.5 15.1 94.2 27.3 24.6 28.3 569.6 39.6 267.3 123.1 92.8 406.7 137.4 194.5 224.1	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02) 116203(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2795(1.01) 2765(1.01) 53764(1.01) 62891(1.01) 2953 4191 6461 19140(1.01) 4791 191691 66526 9310 106733 5843 2484 9405	CHACO 3349 3145 1722 540 730 )115530 2811 2904 17783 2781 58392 2904 17783 2781 58392 4151 63576 2921 4151 63576 2921 4151 63576 2921 108855 6326 2506	MMA <sub>B</sub> 3050(1.05) - 1574 513 572 125407 2594 2609(1.01) 16075(1.01) 2574 55189 58272(1.01) 2640 3803 6014 - 4219 184829 61778 8532 101861 5576 2331 8065	MMA <sub>Av</sub> <b>3068.7</b> - <b>1583.9</b> 508.2 <b>574.8</b> 125275.0 <b>2621.2</b> <b>2640.7</b> <b>16178</b> <b>2585.6</b> 54632.1 <b>58607.5</b> <b>2692.9</b> <b>3834.5</b> <b>6070.8</b> - <b>4278.9</b> 204726.0 <b>63207.6</b> <b>8577.7</b> <b>106247.0</b> <b>5683.7</b> <b>2397.7</b> <b>8185</b> 9	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2 142.4 14.9 15.8 32.9 17.5 135.8 32.9 17.5 135.8 28.0 29 35.3 - 49.8 662.3 266.1 96.8 711.8 142.5 2016
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe_pwt bcsstk32 fe_body t60k wing brack2	k=16           pMetis           2504           1370           665           189           128           59791           1237           1255           9290           1152           37441           28151           1056           2030           3181           14942           2538           77293           27180           2933           43371           2181           998           4666           12655	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174 61890 1218 1253 9273 1135 43064 28629 1083 2037 3083 16433 2552 81069 28557 3200 47829 2947 977 4671 13404	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2113           1154           579           164           117           55522           1101           8437           1015           33919           24508           951           1752           2921           13361           2160           76258           24934           2839           38361           2118           899           4076           12055	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>2113.8</b> <b>1168.3</b> <b>589.9</b> <b>182.1</b> 129.3 <b>55800.7</b> <b>1121.6</b> <b>1142.6</b> <b>8508.7</b> <b>1041.8</b> <b>34839.1</b> <b>25711.3</b> <b>983.3</b> <b>1806.3</b> <b>2989.6</b> <b>13558.5</b> <b>2221.7</b> <b>76954.5</b> <b>26192.0</b> <b>2864.5</b> <b>40966.4</b> <b>2201.7</b> <b>922.9</b> <b>4154.1</b> <b>12322 4</b>	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9 54.1 11.9 24.3 15.7 73.2 51.2 24.2 26.8 29.9 273.8 44.8 141.9 147.3 83.4 214.2 140.4 228.9 235.1 269.6	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01) 86008 1891 1890 13237 1787 46112 41190 1769 2913 4605 17303 3579 131405 42645 6029 70020 3424 1613 6700 19786	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303 84613 1895 1962 13258 1796 51006 42935 1796 51006 42935 1766 2920 4532 17936 3588 128694 45354 6036 73377 4194 1594 6843 20172	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01)           1859           978           288(1.01)           212(1.01)           78844           1727           1730           11990           1655           42579           36330           1597           2638           4243           14778           3057           119413           40742           5783           64186           3385           1488           5896           17855	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8 224.9 79374.2 1750.7 1767.4 12064.7 1681.8 45100.9 37265.4 1650.5 2686.7 4335.3 15110.4 3111.6 123824.0 41573.5 5966.2 68541.7 3516.2 1549.3 6001.0 18411 1	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7 80.5 12.8 13.71 23.5 15.1 94.2 57.9 27.3 24.6 28.3 569.6 267.3 123.1 92.8 406.7 137.4 194.5 224.1 92.5 137.4 194.5 224.6 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 27.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.3 267.4 27.4 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.5 27.	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02) 116203(1.01) 2847(1.01) 2847(1.01) 2765(1.01) 2765(1.01) 53764(1.01) 62891(1.01) 53764(1.01) 62891(1.01) 4191 6461 19140(1.01) 4791 191691 66526 9310 106733 5843 2484 9405 28872	CHACO 3349 3145 540 730 )115530 2811 2904 17783 2781 58392 63576 63576 63576 4817 191445 68375 9231 108855 6326 2506 9308 29923	MMA <sub>B</sub> 3050(1.05) - 1574 513 572 125407 2594 2609(1.01) 16075(1.01) 2574 55189 58272(1.01) 2640 3803 6014 - 4219 184829 61778 8532 101861 5576 2331 8065 27056	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>3068.7</b> - <b>1583.9</b> 508.2 <b>574.8</b> 125275.0 <b>2640.7</b> <b>16178</b> <b>2585.6</b> 54632.1 <b>58607.5</b> <b>2692.9</b> <b>3834.5</b> <b>6070.8</b> - <b>4278.9</b> 204726.0 <b>63207.6</b> <b>8577.7</b> <b>106247.0</b> <b>5683.7</b> <b>2397.7</b> <b>8185.9</b> <b>27853 8</b>	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2 142.4 14.9 15.8 32.9 17.5 135.8 93.2 28.0 29 35.3 - 49.8 662.3 266.1 96.8 711.8 142.5 201.7 220.6 308.5
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk31 fe_pwt bcsstk31 fe_body t60k wing brack2 fnap512	k=16           pMetis           2504           1370           665           189           128           59791           1237           1255           9290           1152           37441           28151           1056           2030           3181           14942           2538           77293           27180           2933           43371           2181           998           4666           12655           1377	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174 61890 1218 1253 9273 1135 43064 28629 1083 2037 3083 16433 2552 81069 28557 3200 47829 2947 977 4671 13404 1296	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2113           1154           579           164           117           55522           1101           1101           8437           1015           33919           24508           951           1752           2921           13361           2160           76258           24934           2839           38361           2118           899           4076           1296	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>2113.8</b> <b>1168.3</b> <b>589.9</b> <b>182.1</b> 129.3 <b>55800.7</b> <b>1121.6</b> <b>1142.6</b> <b>8508.7</b> <b>1041.8</b> <b>34839.1</b> <b>25711.3</b> <b>983.3</b> <b>1806.3</b> <b>2989.6</b> <b>13558.5</b> <b>2221.7</b> <b>76954.5</b> <b>26192.0</b> <b>2864.5</b> <b>40966.4</b> <b>2201.7</b> <b>922.9</b> <b>4154.1</b> <b>12322.4</b> <b>1368.9</b> <b>1368.9</b> <b>1368.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>1369.9</b> <b>136</b>	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9 54.1 11.9 13.9 24.3 15.7 73.2 51.2 24.2 26.8 29.9 273.8 44.8 141.9 147.3 83.4 214.2 140.4 228.9 235.1 269.2 245.1 140.4 228.9 235.1 269.2 275.1 269.2 275.1 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275.2 275	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01) 86008 1891 1890 13237 1787 46112 41190 1769 2913 4605 17303 3579 131405 42645 6029 70020 3424 1613 6700 19786 2592	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303 84613 1895 1962 13258 1796 51006 42935 1766 2920 4532 17936 3588 128694 45354 6036 73377 4194 1594 6843 20172 2592	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01)           1859           978           288(1.01)           212(1.01)           78844           1727           1730           11990           1655           42579           36330           1597           2638           4243           14778           3057           119413           40742           5783           64186           3385           1488           5896           17855           2592	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8 224.9 79374.2 1750.7 1767.4 12064.7 1681.8 45100.9 37265.4 1650.5 2686.7 4335.3 15110.4 3111.6 123824.0 41573.5 5966.2 68541.7 3516.2 1549.3 6001.0 18411.1 2592.0	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7 80.5 12.8 13.71 23.5 15.1 94.2 57.9 27.3 24.6 28.3 569.6 267.3 123.1 92.8 406.7 137.4 194.5 224.1 295.6 267.9	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02) 116203(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2765(1.01) 53764(1.01) 2953 4191 6461 19140(1.01) 4791 191691 66526 9310 106733 5843 2484 9405 28872 10842	CHACO 3349 3145 1722 540 730 0)115530 2811 2904 17783 2781 58392 63576 2921 4151 6334 18978 4817 191445 68375 9231 108855 6326 2506 9308 29223 11962	MMA <sub>B</sub> 3050(1.05)           -           1574           513           572           125407           2594           2609(1.01)           16075(1.01)           2574           5189           58272(1.01)           2640           3803           6014           -           4219           184829           61778           8532           101861           5576           2331           8065           27056           10764	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>3068.7</b> - <b>1583.9</b> 508.2 <b>574.8</b> 125275.0 <b>2621.2</b> <b>2640.7</b> <b>16178</b> <b>2585.6</b> 54632.1 <b>58607.5</b> <b>2692.9</b> <b>3834.5</b> <b>6070.8</b> - <b>4278.9</b> 204726.0 <b>63207.6</b> <b>8577.7</b> <b>106247.0</b> <b>5683.7</b> <b>2397.7</b> <b>8185.9</b> <b>27853.8</b> <b>10978</b> 4	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2 142.4 14.9 15.8 32.9 17.5 135.8 93.2 28.0 29 35.3 - 49.8 662.3 266.1 96.8 711.8 142.5 201.7 220.6 350.3 350.3
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe_pwt bcsstk32 fe_body t60k wing brack2 fnan512 fa_tocth	k=16           pMetis           2504           1370           665           189           128           59791           1237           1255           9290           1152           37441           28151           1056           2030           3181           14942           2538           77293           27180           2933           43371           2181           998           4666           12655           1377           19346	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174 61890 1218 1253 9273 1135 43064 28629 1083 2037 3083 16433 2552 81069 28557 3200 47829 2947 977 4671 13404 1296 20887	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2113           1154           579           164           117           55522           1101           1015           33919           24508           951           1752           2921           13361           2160           76258           24934           2839           38361           2118           899           4076           12055           1296           17857	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>2113.8</b> <b>1168.3</b> <b>589.9</b> <b>182.1</b> 129.3 <b>55800.7</b> <b>1121.6</b> <b>1142.6</b> <b>8508.7</b> <b>1041.8</b> <b>34839.1</b> <b>25711.3</b> <b>983.3</b> <b>1806.3</b> <b>2989.6</b> <b>13558.5</b> <b>2221.7</b> <b>76954.5</b> <b>26192.0</b> <b>2864.5</b> <b>40966.4</b> 2201.7 <b>922.9</b> <b>4154.1</b> <b>12322.4</b> <b>1368.9</b> <b>18204 5</b> <b>18204 5</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18206</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18206</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18206</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>18205</b> <b>182</b>	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9 54.1 11.9 13.9 24.3 15.7 73.2 51.2 24.2 26.8 29.9 273.8 44.8 141.9 147.3 83.4 214.2 140.4 228.9 235.1 269.6 391.2 23.8 147.7 24.3 147.7 24.3 15.7 24.2 26.8 27.9 27.8 27.8 27.8 27.9 27.8 27.9 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2 27.2	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01) 86008 1891 1890 13237 1787 46112 41190 1769 2913 4605 17303 3579 131405 42645 6029 70020 3424 1613 6700 19786 2592 29215	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303 84613 1895 1962 13258 1796 51006 42935 1766 2920 4532 17936 3588 128694 45354 6036 73377 4194 1594 6843 20172 2592	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01)           1859           978           288(1.01)           212(1.01)           78844           1727           1730           11990           1655           42579           36330           1597           2638           4247           3057           119413           40742           5783           64186           3385           1488           5896           17855           2592           25787	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8 224.9 79374.2 1750.7 1767.4 12064.7 1681.8 45100.9 37265.4 1650.5 2686.7 4335.3 15110.4 3111.6 123824.0 41573.5 5966.2 68541.7 3516.2 1549.3 6001.0 18411.1 2592.0 26179.6	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7 80.5 12.8 13.71 23.5 15.1 94.2 57.9 27.3 24.6 28.3 569.6 39.6 267.3 123.1 92.8 406.7 137.4 194.5 224.1 295.6 362.5	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02) 116203(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2795(1.01) 2765(1.01) 53764(1.01) 62891(1.01) 2953 4191 6461 19140(1.01) 4791 191691 66526 9310 106733 5843 2484 9405 28872 10842 40162	CHACO 3349 3145 1722 540 730 115530 2811 2904 17783 2781 58392 63576 2921 4151 6334 18978 4817 191445 68375 9231 108855 6326 2506 9308 29223 11962	MMA <sub>B</sub> 3050(1.05)           -           1574           513           572           125407           2594           2609(1.01)           16075(1.01)           2574           55189           58272(1.01)           2640           3803           6014           -           4219           184829           61778           8532           101861           5576           2331           8065           27056           10764	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>3068.7</b> - <b>1583.9</b> 508.2 <b>574.8</b> 125275.0 <b>2621.2</b> <b>2640.7</b> <b>16178</b> <b>2585.6</b> <b>54632.1</b> <b>58607.5</b> <b>2692.9</b> <b>3834.5</b> <b>6070.8</b> - <b>4278.9</b> 204726.0 <b>63207.6</b> <b>8577.7</b> <b>106247.0</b> <b>5683.7</b> <b>2397.7</b> <b>8185.9</b> <b>27853.8</b> 10978.4 <b>36055 7</b> <b>36055 7</b> <b>360555 7</b> <b>360555 7</b> <b>3605555 7</b> <b>36055555555555555555555555555555555</b>	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2 142.4 14.9 15.8 32.9 17.5 135.8 93.2 28.0 29 35.3 - 49.8 662.3 266.1 96.8 711.8 142.5 201.7 220.6 308.5 350.3 550 350.3 550 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.6 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7 201.7
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe_body t60k wing brack2 finan512 fe_tooth fe_tooth	k=16           pMetis           2504           1370           665           189           128           59791           1237           1255           9290           1152           37441           28151           1056           2030           3181           14942           2538           77293           27180           2933           43371           2181           998           4666           12655           1377           19346           23862	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174 61890 1218 1253 9273 1135 43064 28629 1083 2037 3083 16433 2037 3083 16433 2552 81069 28557 3200 47829 2947 977 4671 13404 1296 20887 232≤	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2113           1154           579           164           117           55522           1101           1101           8437           1015           33919           24508           951           1752           2921           13361           2160           76258           24934           2839           38361           2118           899           4076           12055           1296           17857           20604	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>2113.8</b> <b>1168.3</b> <b>589.9</b> <b>182.1</b> 129.3 <b>55800.7</b> <b>1121.6</b> <b>1142.6</b> <b>8508.7</b> <b>1041.8</b> <b>34839.1</b> <b>25711.3</b> <b>983.3</b> <b>1806.3</b> <b>2989.6</b> <b>13558.5</b> <b>2221.7</b> <b>76954.5</b> <b>26192.0</b> <b>2864.5</b> <b>40966.4</b> 2201.7 <b>922.9</b> <b>4154.1</b> <b>12322.4</b> <b>1368.9</b> <b>18204.5</b> <b>12302.4</b> <b>1368.9</b> <b>18204.5</b> <b>12302.4</b> <b>1368.9</b> <b>18204.5</b> <b>12302.4</b> <b>1368.9</b> <b>18204.5</b> <b>12302.4</b> <b>1368.9</b> <b>18204.5</b> <b>12302.4</b> <b>1368.9</b> <b>18204.5</b> <b>12302.4</b> <b>1368.9</b> <b>18204.5</b> <b>12302.4</b> <b>1368.9</b> <b>18204.5</b> <b>12302.4</b> <b>1368.9</b> <b>18204.5</b> <b>12302.4</b> <b>1368.9</b> <b>18204.5</b> <b>12302.4</b> <b>1368.9</b> <b>18204.5</b> <b>12302.4</b> <b>12302.4</b> <b>12302.4</b> <b>12302.4</b> <b>12302.4</b> <b>12302.4</b> <b>12302.4</b> <b>12302.5</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b> <b>1230.6</b>	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9 54.1 11.9 13.9 24.3 15.7 73.2 51.2 24.2 26.8 29.9 273.8 44.8 141.9 147.3 83.4 214.2 140.4 228.9 235.1 269.6 391.2 348.7 146.6 5	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01) 86008 1891 13237 1787 46112 41190 1769 2913 4605 17303 3579 131405 42645 6029 70020 3424 1613 6700 19786 2592 29215 3625	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303 84613 1895 1962 13258 1796 51006 42935 1766 2920 4532 17936 3588 128694 45354 6036 73377 4194 1594 6843 20172 2592 29849 26267	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01)           1859           978           288(1.01)           212(1.01)           78844           1727           1730           11990           1655           42579           36330           1597           2638           4243           14778           3057           119413           40742           5783           64186           3385           1488           5896           17855           2592           25787           22024	MMA <sub>Av</sub> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8 224.9 79374.2 1750.7 1767.4 12064.7 1681.8 45100.9 37265.4 1650.5 2686.7 4335.3 15110.4 3111.6 123824.0 41573.5 5966.2 68541.7 3516.2 1549.3 6001.0 18411.1 2592.0 26179.6 23824.1	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7 80.5 12.8 13.71 23.5 15.1 94.2 27.3 24.6 28.3 569.6 39.6 267.3 123.1 92.8 406.7 137.4 194.5 224.1 92.8 406.7 137.4 194.5 224.5 225.6 362.9 345.5 559.2	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02) 116203(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2847(1.01) 2847(1.01) 62891(1.01) 62891(1.01) 62891(1.01) 62891(1.01) 62891(1.01) 6461 19140(1.01) 4791 191691 66526 9310 106733 5843 2484 9405 28872 10842 40162 53262	CHACO 3349 3145 1722 540 730 )115530 2811 2904 17783 2781 58392 2904 17783 2781 58392 2904 17783 2781 58392 2904 4151 63576 2921 4151 63576 2921 4151 63576 2921 4151 63576 2921 4151 63576 2921 4151 63576 2921 4151 63576 2921 4151 63576 2921 4151 108855 6326 2506 9308 29223 11962 40307 2004	MMA <sub>B</sub> 3050(1.05) - 1574 513 572 125407 2594 2609(1.01) 16075(1.01) 2574 55189 58272(1.01) 2640 3803 6014 - 4219 184829 61778 8532 101861 5576 2331 8065 27056 10764 35864 49519	MMA <sub>Av</sub> <b>3068.7</b> - <b>1583.9</b> 508.2 <b>574.8</b> 125275.0 <b>2621.2</b> <b>2640.7</b> <b>16178</b> <b>2585.6</b> 54632.1 <b>58607.5</b> <b>2692.9</b> <b>3834.5</b> <b>6070.8</b> - <b>4278.9</b> 204726.0 <b>63207.6</b> <b>8577.7</b> <b>106247.0</b> <b>5683.7</b> <b>2397.7</b> <b>8185.9</b> <b>27853.8</b> 10978.4 <b>36055.7</b> <b>50042</b> <i>5</i> <b>50042</b> <i>5</i> <b></b>	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2 142.4 14.9 15.8 32.9 17.5 135.8 32.9 17.5 135.8 32.9 17.5 28.0 29 35.3 - 49.8 662.3 266.1 96.8 711.8 142.5 201.6 308.5 350.3 456.3 20.6 308.5 350.3 452.3 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.6 20.
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe_pwt bcsstk32 fe_body t60k wing brack2 finan512 fe_tooth fe_rooth	k=16           pMetis           2504           1370           665           189           128           59791           1237           1255           9290           1152           37441           28151           1056           2030           3181           14942           2538           77293           27180           2933           43371           2181           998           4666           12655           1377           19346           23863           28222	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174 61890 1218 1253 9273 1135 43064 28629 1083 2037 3083 16433 2552 81069 28557 3200 47829 2947 977 4671 13404 1296 20887 23936 2087	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2113           1154           579           164           117           55522           1101           8437           1015           33919           24508           951           1752           2921           13361           2160           76258           24934           2839           38361           2118           899           4076           12055           1296           17857           20694           2624	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>2113.8</b> <b>1168.3</b> <b>589.9</b> <b>182.1</b> 129.3 <b>55800.7</b> <b>1121.6</b> <b>1142.6</b> <b>8508.7</b> <b>1041.8</b> <b>34839.1</b> <b>25711.3</b> <b>983.3</b> <b>1806.3</b> <b>2989.6</b> <b>13558.5</b> <b>2221.7</b> <b>76954.5</b> <b>26192.0</b> <b>2864.5</b> <b>40966.4</b> <b>2201.7</b> <b>922.9</b> <b>4154.1</b> <b>12322.4</b> <b>1368.9</b> <b>18204.5</b> <b>21398.3</b> <b>2697.9</b> <b>2</b>	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9 54.1 11.9 24.3 15.7 73.2 51.2 24.2 26.8 29.9 273.8 44.8 141.9 147.3 83.4 214.2 140.4 228.9 235.1 269.6 239.2 248.7 460.6 572.0 248.7 248.7 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 249.2 24	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01) 86008 1891 1890 13237 1787 46112 41190 1769 2913 4605 17303 3579 131405 42645 6029 70020 3424 1613 6700 19786 2592 29215 36225 44760	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303 84613 1895 1962 13258 1796 51006 42935 1796 51006 42935 1766 2920 4532 17936 3588 128694 45354 6036 73377 4194 1594 6843 20172 2592 29849 36367	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01)           1859           978           288(1.01)           212(1.01)           78844           1727           1730           11990           1655           42579           36330           1597           2638           4243           14778           3057           119413           40742           5783           64186           3385           1488           5896           17855           2592           25787           32034           20470	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8 224.9 79374.2 1750.7 1767.4 12064.7 1681.8 45100.9 37265.4 1650.5 2686.7 4335.3 15110.4 3111.6 123824.0 41573.5 5966.2 68541.7 3516.2 1549.3 6001.0 18411.1 2592.0 26179.6 33831.1	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7 80.5 12.8 13.71 23.5 15.1 94.2 27.3 24.6 28.3 569.6 267.3 123.1 92.8 406.7 137.4 194.5 224.1 295.6 362.9 345.5 559.2 245.5 255.9 245.5 255.9 245.5 255.9 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5 265.5	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02) 116203(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2847(1.01) 2765(1.01) 2765(1.01) 53764(1.01) 62891(1.01) 2953 4191 6461 19140(1.01) 4791 191691 66526 9310 106733 5843 2484 9405 28872 10842 40162 53623 6427	CHACO 3349 3145 1722 540 730 )115530 2811 2904 17783 2781 58392 63576 2921 4151 6334 4817 191445 68375 9231 108855 6326 2506 9308 29223 11962 40306 52497	MMA <sub>B</sub> 3050(1.05) - 1574 513 572 125407 2594 2609(1.01) 16075(1.01) 2574 55189 58272(1.01) 2640 3803 6014 - 4219 184829 61778 8532 101861 5576 2331 8065 27056 10764 35864 48518 65942	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>3068.7</b> - <b>1583.9</b> 508.2 <b>574.8</b> 125275.0 <b>2640.7</b> <b>16178</b> <b>2585.6</b> 54632.1 <b>58607.5</b> <b>2692.9</b> <b>3834.5</b> <b>6070.8</b> - <b>4278.9</b> 204726.0 <b>63207.6</b> <b>8577.7</b> <b>106247.0</b> <b>5683.7</b> <b>2397.7</b> <b>8185.9</b> <b>27853.8</b> 10978.4 <b>36055.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>5095.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>5095.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>5095.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>5095.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>5095.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>5095.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>5095.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>5095.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>5095.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>5095.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>5095.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>5095.7</b> <b>5005.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>5005.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>5005.7</b> <b>5005.7</b> <b>5006.2</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b> <b>700.0</b>	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2 142.4 14.9 15.8 32.9 17.5 135.8 93.2 28.0 29 35.3 - 49.8 662.3 266.1 96.8 711.8 142.5 201.7 220.6 308.5 350.3 456.3 943.2 028.0 29 29 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe_pwt bcsstk32 fe_body t60k wing brack2 finan512 fe_tooth fe_rotor 598a 598a	k=16           pMetis           2504           1370           665           189           128           59791           1237           1255           9290           1152           37441           28151           1056           2030           3181           14942           2538           77293           27180           2933           43371           2181           998           4666           12655           1377           19346           23863           28922           0612	CHACO 2297 1360 660 211 174 61890 1218 1253 9273 1135 43064 28629 1083 2037 3083 16433 2552 81069 28557 3200 47829 2947 977 4671 13404 1296 20887 23936 29674	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2113           1154           579           164           117           55522           1101           8437           1015           33919           24508           951           1752           2921           13361           2160           76258           24934           2839           38361           2118           899           4076           12055           1296           17857           20694           26361           7000	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>2113.8</b> <b>1168.3</b> <b>589.9</b> <b>182.1</b> 129.3 <b>55800.7</b> <b>1121.6</b> <b>1142.6</b> <b>8508.7</b> <b>1041.8</b> <b>34839.1</b> <b>25711.3</b> <b>983.3</b> <b>1806.3</b> <b>2989.6</b> <b>13558.5</b> <b>2221.7</b> <b>76954.5</b> <b>26192.0</b> <b>2864.5</b> <b>40966.4</b> <b>2201.7</b> <b>922.9</b> <b>4154.1</b> <b>12322.4</b> <b>1368.9</b> <b>18204.5</b> <b>21398.3</b> <b>26807.0</b> <b>932.6</b> <b>18204.5</b> <b>21398.3</b> <b>26807.0</b> <b>932.6</b> <b>18204.5</b> <b>21398.3</b> <b>26807.0</b> <b>932.6</b> <b>18204.5</b> <b>21398.3</b> <b>26807.0</b> <b>18204.5</b> <b>21398.3</b> <b>26807.0</b> <b>18204.5</b> <b>21398.3</b> <b>26807.0</b> <b>18204.5</b> <b>21398.3</b> <b>26807.0</b> <b>18204.5</b> <b>21398.3</b> <b>26807.0</b> <b>1121.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>112.6</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b> <b>113.5</b>	time 16.3 3.4 5.4 4.7 7.9 54.1 11.9 13.9 24.3 15.7 73.2 51.2 24.2 26.8 29.9 273.8 44.8 141.9 147.3 83.4 214.2 140.4 228.9 235.1 269.2 245.1 140.4 228.9 235.1 269.2 248.7 460.6 578.0 279.2 248.7 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279.5 279	k=32 pMetis - 2060(1.01) 1093 316(1.01) 288(1.01) 288(1.01) 86008 1891 1890 13237 1787 46112 41190 1769 2913 4605 17303 3579 131405 42645 6029 70020 3424 1613 6700 19786 2592 29215 36225 44760 14612	CHACO 2684 2143 1106 343 303 84613 1895 1962 13258 1796 51006 42935 1766 2920 4532 17936 3588 128694 45354 6036 73377 4194 1594 6843 20172 2592 29849 36367 45780	MMA <sub>B</sub> 2447(1.01)           1859           978           288(1.01)           212(1.01)           78844           1727           1730           11990           1655           42579           36330           1597           2638           4243           14778           3057           119413           40742           5783           64186           3385           1488           5896           17855           25787           32034           39470           12227	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> 2439.4 1881.9 988.8 307.8 224.9 79374.2 1750.7 1767.4 12064.7 1681.8 45100.9 37265.4 1650.5 2686.7 4335.3 15110.4 3111.6 123824.0 41573.5 5966.2 68541.7 3516.2 1549.3 6001.0 18411.1 2592.0 26179.6 33831.1 40244.3	time 20.6 3.9 5.6 11.2 7.7 80.5 12.8 13.71 23.5 15.1 94.2 57.9 27.3 24.6 28.3 569.6 267.3 123.1 92.8 406.7 137.4 194.5 224.1 295.6 345.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2 615.5 559.2	k=64 pMetis 3433(1.07) 3116(1.03) 1710 495(1.02) 626(1.02) 116203(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2796(1.01) 2795(1.01) 53764(1.01) 62891(1.01) 2953 4191 6461 19140(1.01) 4791 191691 66526 9310 106733 5843 2484 9405 28872 10842 40162 53623 64307 22217	CHACO 3349 3145 1722 540 730 0)115530 2811 2904 2917 17783 2781 58392 63576 2921 4151 6334 18978 4817 191445 68375 9231 108855 6326 2506 9308 29223 11962 40306 52497 65094	MMA <sub>B</sub> 3050(1.05)           -           1574           513           572           125407           2594           2609(1.01)           16075(1.01)           2574           5189           58272(1.01)           2640           3803           6014           -           4219           184829           61778           8532           101861           5576           2331           8065           27056           10764           35864           48518           58483           21142	<i>MMA<sub>Av</sub></i> <b>3068.7</b> - <b>1583.9</b> 508.2 <b>574.8</b> 125275.0 <b>2621.2</b> <b>2640.7</b> <b>16178</b> <b>2585.6</b> 54632.1 <b>58607.5</b> <b>2692.9</b> <b>3834.5</b> <b>6070.8</b> - <b>4278.9</b> 204726.0 <b>63207.6</b> <b>8577.7</b> <b>106247.0</b> <b>5683.7</b> <b>2397.7</b> <b>8185.9</b> <b>27853.8</b> 10978.4 <b>36055.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>3045.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>3045.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>3045.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>3045.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>3045.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>3045.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>3045.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>3045.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>3045.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>3045.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>3045.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>3045.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>3045.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>3045.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>3045.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>3045.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>3045.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>3045.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>3045.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>3045.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>3045.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>3045.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>3045.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>315.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>315.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>315.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>58985.7</b> <b>315.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>580985.7</b> <b>315.7</b> <b>50043.5</b> <b>580985.7</b> <b>5105.7</b> <b>5107.6</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.8</b> <b>5107.8</b> <b>5107.8</b> <b>5107.8</b> <b>5107.8</b> <b>5107.8</b> <b>5107.8</b> <b>5107.8</b> <b>5107.8</b> <b>5107.8</b> <b>5107.8</b> <b>5107.8</b> <b>5107.8</b> <b>5107.8</b> <b>5107.8</b> <b>5107.8</b> <b>5107.8</b> <b>5107.8</b> <b>5107.8</b> <b>5107.8</b> <b>5107.8</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.8</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.8</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>5107.7</b> <b>510.</b>	time 38.5 - 6.4 5.9 8.2 142.4 14.9 15.8 32.9 17.5 135.8 93.2 28.0 29 35.3 - 49.8 662.3 266.1 96.8 711.8 142.5 201.7 201.7 201.6 308.5 350.3 456.3 943.2 928.9 928.9 928.9 928.9 928.9 928.9 928.9 928.9 928.9 928.9 928.9 928.9 928.9 928.9 928.9 928.9 928.9 928.9 928.9 928.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12.9 12

# TABLE III

tabu search procedure generally reduces the partition imbalance after each iteration, the imbalance may not be decreased after an iteration of Move 2 since the balance constraint is only partially imposed. As it can be seen from the experimental results, the balance is always established for  $k \leq 16$ . For larger k, there is generally a large number of feasible moves implying more freedom for vertex migrations. As a result, it is more difficult to establish a perfect partition balance via the two move operators.

## D. Comparisons with the best known results

To better assess the performance of our MMA approach, we show in this section experimental results under relaxed time constraint. We prolong the running time from several minutes up to 5 hours for the largest graph (notice that the current most effective evolutionary approach by Soper et al. [38] requires computing time of up to one week to produce state-of-the-art results). The main purpose of this experiment is to know whether our MMA algorithm can improve further the current best solutions.

For comparison, we use the *current best partitions* reported at the Walshaw's Graph Partitioning Archive. The majority of these best partitions are generated with the hybrid evolutionary algorithm presented by Soper et al. [38], which uses JOSTLE multilevel procedure as a black box. Since each run of Soper et al.'s algorithm consists of 50,000 calls to JOSTLE, this approach requires significant running time of up to one week for large graphs. Another great portion of these current best partitions are produced with NetWorks, which is a commercialized version of JOSTLE. The remaining best results are obtained with several other approaches [20], [31], [11]. Since the experimental conditions to obtain the current best results are not available, we focus on comparing solution quality based on the best objective value.

Table IV summarizes the current best results from the Graph Partitioning Archive (column 'Best')<sup>1</sup>, the best results obtained by MMA (column 'MMA')<sup>2</sup>, as well as the average and standard deviation of partitions obtained by MMA (column 'Avg(Std)'). The last row with heading 'Total' shows the number of times MMA succeeds to improve the current best partition. All the comparisons are carried out between partitions of the same balance. In most cases, the partitions of MMA are perfectly balanced (i.e.  $\varepsilon = 1.00$ , this is the default balance). For the cases where MMA produces imbalanced partitions ( $k \in \{32, 64\}$ ), we indicate the imbalance in parentheses next to the objective value and compare the partitions with the same imbalance.

The results show that, in the case of bisection, our MMA approach succeeds to reach the same solution quality of more than two thirds of the best balanced bisections reported at the archive. It also improves the best bisection in three cases, and produces, only in four cases, bisections that are less good than the current best ones. More importantly, as k increases  $(4 \le k \le 64)$ , MMA improves even 63%, 90%, 93%, 83%

and 77% of the current best k-partitions from the archive when k is equal to 4, 8, 16, 32 and 64 respectively.

## VI. LANDSCAPE AND STRUCTURAL ANALYSIS

In this section, we wish to obtain some insight on the search space and provide motivations for the proposed multiparent crossover operator. For this purpose, we employ the fitness distance analysis (FDA) [22], which investigates the correlation between quality (fitness) of local optima and their distances to the optimum. Additionally, we analyze structural similarity between local optima in terms of backbone size.

## A. Analysis protocol

We perform the analysis on seven graph partitioning instances of different types, with the cardinal number k set to 4, 8, 16 and 32. The results reported for each graph and k are based on 1500 independent runs of the multilevel perturbationbased tabu search algorithm from Section IV-C, and using the distance measure introduced in Section IV-D1. Since the optimal solutions for the selected instances are not known, we use instead the best local optima found to compute fitnessdistance correlation. Table V contains the data to which we will be referring in the following sections.

## B. FDA for selected graph partitioning instances

The fitness distance correlation (FDC) coefficient  $\rho_{fdc}$  [22] is a well-known tool for landscape analysis and can provide useful indications about the problem hardness, even if such an analysis has some known shortcomings and limits. FDC estimates how closely related are the fitness and distance to the nearest optimum. For a minimization problem, if the fitness of a solution decreases with the decrease of distance from the optimum, then it would be easy to reach the target optimum for an algorithm that concentrates around the best candidate solutions found so far, since there is a "path" to the optimum via solutions with decreasing (better) fitness. A value of  $\rho_{fdc} = 1$  indicates perfect correlation between fitness and distance to the optimum. For correlation of  $\rho_{fdc} = -1$ , the fitness function is completely misleading. FDC can also be visualized with the FD plot, where the same data used for estimating  $\rho_{fdc}$  is displayed graphically. Such plots have been used to estimate the distribution of local optima for a number of problems including for instance the TSP problem [7], graph bipartitioning problem [30] and flow-shop scheduling problem [35].

In column ' $\rho_{fdc}$ ' of Table V, we report FDC coefficients  $\rho_{fdc}$  for the 7 selected graphs. For illustrative purpose, FD plots of only two graphs (*3elt* and *vibrobox*) are given in Figure 3 for  $k \in \{4, 8, 16, 32\}$ . To make the difference in fitness distribution more obvious, we "normalize" the actual fitness values in the FD plots by subtracting from them the best objective value.

As it can be seen from Table V, there is a signification fitness distance correlation in many cases. However, the FDA analysis also reveals the existence of several cases among the selected instances for which there is virtually no correlation

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Results retrieved in June 2010

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Our best results are available at: http://www.info.univ-angers.fr/pub/hao/ MMAbest.html

	k=2			k=4			k=8		
Graph	Best	MMA	Avg(Std)	Best	MMA	Avg(Std)	Best	MMA	Avg(Std)
add20	596	678	708.5 (20.6)	1203	1159	1187.6 (17.1)	1714	1696	1705.5 (14.1)
data	189	189	189.0 (0.0)	383	382	391.6 (8.4)	679	669	675.6 (4.3)
3elt	90	90	90.0 (0.0)	201	201	202.4 (2.2)	348	345	346.8 (1.0)
uk	20	19	20.8 (0.9)	43	42	43.1 (0.7)	89	84	87.1 (2.2)
add32	11	10	10.3 (0.46)	34	33	34.8 (1.89)	75	66	68.9 (4.0)
bcsstk33	10171	10171	10171.0 (0.0)	21719	21730	22193.6 (431.8)	34579	34455	34491.3 (34.9)
whitaker3	127	127	127.0 (0.0)	382	382	382.1 (0.2)	661	658	659.4 (1.3)
crack	184	184	184.0 (0.0)	368	366	366.0 (0.0)	687	679	686.6 (5.7)
fo Aolt2	1/0/	1707	1/0/.8 (0.4)	3381	35/8	3008.0 (27.0)	5445	5438	5481.8 (42.1)
uibrohov	10242	102/2	10084.5(265.4)	10245	J47 10128	105241(2172)	24715	24582	013.8(3.0)
besstk29	2843	2843	2846.0 (3.3)	8159	8475	8484 9 (13.4)	14322	15340	15905 8 (247.0)
4elt	139	139	1392(07)	326	326	329.6 (4.3)	548	547	548 5 (2.5)
fe-sphere	386	386	386.0 (0.0)	770	770	771 (0.9)	1193	1165	1182.2 (18.3)
cti	334	334	334.0 (0.0)	963	955	970.0 (5.3)	1812	1795	1841.1 (21.4)
memplus	5513	5524	5587.6 (53.2)	9643	9646	9792.5 (56.6)	11872	11879	12040.1 (132.9)
cs4	371	371	374.0 (1.6)	964	934	962.1 (14.6)	1496	1455	1474.9 (12.3)
bcsstk30	6394	6394	6394.0 (0.0)	16652	16652	16856.0 (220.9)	34921	34910	34948.4 (34.9)
bcsstk31	2762	2762	2768.1 (6.5)	7469	7355	7621.6 (140.2)	13812	13370	13755.3 (383.3)
fe-pwt	340	340	358.1 (5.3)	709	707	718.8 (5.7)	1465	1450	1465.1 (22.1)
bcsstk32	4667	4667	4679.5 (23.5)	9492	9318	9383.4 (53.0)	22757	21119	22377 (786.4)
fe-body	262	262	262.0 (0.0)	703	624	661.5 (13.1)	1234	1055	1086.9 (30.5)
t60k	79 791	83	85.5 (1.2)	213	218	222.3 (1.3)	476	474	486.9 (11.1)
wing	791	798	806.4 (5.3)	1666	1644	16/2.9 (22.0)	2589	2525	2564.3 (24.7)
brack2	162	/31	/31.0 (0.0)	3090	3084	3100.5 (24.7)	/209	/151	7208.2 (104.9)
fa tooth	102	102	102.0 (0.0)	324 7142	524 6010	550.2 (28.9) 6060 1 (67.6)	048	048	050.1 (24.3) 11680.5 (172.2)
fe rotor	2008	2008	2103.8(10.0)	7480	7277	7630 7 (105 5)	13202	114/3	11080.3(173.3) 131524(130.0)
598a	2398	2398	2398.9 (1.0)	8154	8016	8072 6 (43 3)	16884	15938	16160 2 (115.6)
fe-ocean	464	464	467.6 (1.2)	1902	1895	1898.9(2.9)	4299	4205	4233 5 (16 5)
Total	4	3	407.0 (1.2)	4	19	10)0.9 (2.9)	2	27	4255.5 (10.5)
					- /		-		
	k=16			k=32			k=64		
Graph	k=16 Best	MMA	Avg(Std)	k=32 Best	MMA	Avg(Std)	k=64 Best	MMA	Avg(Std)
Graph add20	k=16 Best 2149	MMA 2064	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03)	MMA 2387(1.03)	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9)	k=64 Best 3152(1.03)	MMA 3021(1.03)	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9)
Graph add20 data	k=16 Best 2149 1162	MMA 2064 1135	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) <b>1802</b> (1.03)	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02)	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0)	k=64 Best 3152(1.03) <b>2798</b>	MMA 3021(1.03)	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9)
Graph add20 data 3elt	k=16 Best 2149 1162 581	MMA 2064 1135 573	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) <b>1802</b> (1.03) <b>969</b> (1.01)	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 969(1.01)	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0) 972.3 (2.57)	k=64 Best 3152(1.03) <b>2798</b> 1564(1.01)	MMA 3021(1.03) - 1554(1.01)	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2)
Graph add20 data 3elt uk	k=16 Best 2149 1162 581 159	MMA 2064 1135 573 153	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4) 158 (2.6)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) <b>1802</b> (1.03) <b>969</b> (1.01) <b>258</b> (1.01)	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 969(1.01) 264(1.01)	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0) 972.3 (2.57) 273.0 (4.5)	k=64 Best 3152(1.03) <b>2798</b> 1564(1.01) <b>438</b> (1.01)	MMA 3021(1.03) - 1554(1.01) 454(1.01)	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2) 460.7 (5.0)
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32	k=16 Best 2149 1162 581 159 121 55126	MMA 2064 1135 573 153 117	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4) 158 (2.6) 122.4 (5.9)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) <b>1802</b> (1.03) <b>969</b> (1.01) <b>258</b> (1.01) <b>212</b> (1.01) <b>212</b> (1.01)	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 969(1.01) 264(1.01) 212(1.01) (10.07)	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0) 972.3 (2.57) 273.0 (4.5) 215.4 (8.6)	k=64 Best 3152(1.03) 2798 1564(1.01) 438(1.01) 493	MMA 3021(1.03) - 1554(1.01) 454(1.01) 499	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2) 460.7 (5.0) 514.2 (7.7)
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33	k=16 Best 2149 1162 581 159 121 55136	MMA 2064 1135 573 153 117 54763 1005	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4) 158 (2.6) 122.4 (5.9) 55250.5 (337.7)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) <b>1802</b> (1.03) <b>969</b> (1.01) <b>258</b> (1.01) <b>212</b> (1.01) 78132	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 969(1.01) 264(1.01) 212(1.01) 61047	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0) 972.3 (2.57) 273.0 (4.5) 215.4 (8.6) 61984 (552.3)	k=64 Best 3152(1.03) <b>2798</b> 1564(1.01) <b>438</b> (1.01) <b>493</b> 108505(1.01)	MMA <b>3021</b> (1.03) - <b>1554</b> (1.01) 454(1.01) 499 <b>107862</b> (1.01) <b>2552</b>	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2) 460.7 (5.0) 514.2 (7.7) 108144 (219.7) 05622 (0.2)
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 arcale	k=16 Best 2149 1162 581 159 121 55136 1108 1108	MMA 2064 1135 573 153 117 54763 1095 1094	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4) 158 (2.6) 122.4 (5.9) 55250.5 (337.7) 1102.3 (4.3)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) <b>1802</b> (1.03) <b>969</b> (1.01) <b>258</b> (1.01) <b>212</b> (1.01) 78132 1718 1778	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 969(1.01) 264(1.01) 212(1.01) 61047 1697 1692	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0) 972.3 (2.57) 273.0 (4.5) 215.4 (8.6) 61984 (552.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1708.4 (55.1)	k=64 Best 3152(1.03) 2798 1564(1.01) 438(1.01) 493 108505(1.01) 2569 2566	MMA 3021(1.03) - 1554(1.01) 454(1.01) 499 107862(1.01) 2552 2561	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2) 460.7 (5.0) 514.2 (7.7) 108144 (219.7) 2563.1 (8.3) 0574.2 (6.4)
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing pedd	k=16 Best 2149 1162 581 159 121 55136 1108 1108 8422	MMA 2064 1135 573 153 117 54763 1095 1094 8350	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4) 158 (2.6) 122.4 (5.9) 55250.5 (337.7) 1102.3 (4.3) 1111.4 (10.3) 8404 1 (20.4)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) <b>1802</b> (1.03) <b>969</b> (1.01) <b>258</b> (1.01) <b>212</b> (1.01) 78132 1718 1728 12090	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 969(1.01) 264(1.01) 212(1.01) 61047 1697 1693 11828	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0) 972.3 (2.57) 273.0 (4.5) 215.4 (8.6) 61984 (552.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1704.6 (5.1)	k=64 Best 3152(1.03) 2798 1564(1.01) 438(1.01) 493 108505(1.01) 2569 2566(1.01) 16134(1.01)	MMA <b>3021</b> (1.03) - <b>1554</b> (1.01) 454(1.01) 4599 <b>107862</b> (1.01) <b>2552</b> <b>2561</b> (1.01) <b>1598</b> (1.01) <b>1598</b> (1.01)	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2) 460.7 (5.0) 514.2 (7.7) 108144 (219.7) 2563.1 (8.3) 2574.3 (6.4) 159111 (28.7)
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing-nodal fe-delt2	k=16 Best 2149 1162 581 159 121 55136 1108 1108 8422 1018	MMA 2064 1135 573 153 117 54763 1095 1094 8359 1010	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4) 158 (2.6) 122.4 (5.9) 55250.5 (337.7) 1102.3 (4.3) 1111.4 (10.3) 8404.1 (29.4) 1013.1 (3.4)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) <b>1802</b> (1.03) <b>969</b> (1.01) <b>258</b> (1.01) <b>212</b> (1.01) 78132 1718 1728 12080 1657	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 969(1.01) 264(1.01) 212(1.01) 61047 1693 11828 1633	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0) 972.3 (2.57) 273.0 (4.5) 215.4 (8.6) 61984 (552.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1704.6 (5.1) 11891.1 (34.55) 1643.8 (7.3)	k=64 Best 3152(1.03) <b>2798</b> 1564(1.01) <b>433</b> (1.01) <b>433</b> 108505(1.01) 2569 2566(1.01) 161134(1.01) 2537	MMA 3021(1.03) - 1554(1.01) 454(1.01) 499 107862(1.01) 2552 2561(1.01) 15888(1.01) 2519	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2) 460.7 (5.0) 514.2 (7.7) 108144 (219.7) 2563.1 (8.3) 2574.3 (6.4) 15911.1 (28.7) 2533.2 (6.4)
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing-nodal fe-4elt2 wibrobox	k=16 Best 2149 1162 581 159 121 55136 1108 1108 8422 1018 32654	MMA 2064 1135 573 153 117 54763 1095 1094 8359 1010 32532	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4) 158 (2.6) 122.4 (5.9) 55250.5 (337.7) 1102.3 (4.3) 1111.4 (10.3) 8404.1 (29.4) 1013.1 (3.4) 33207 3 (249.7)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) 1802(1.03) 969(1.01) 258(1.01) 212(1.01) 78132 1718 1728 12080 1657 42187	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 969(1.01) 264(1.01) 212(1.01) 61047 1693 11828 1633 40098	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0) 972.3 (2.57) 273.0 (4.5) 215.4 (8.6) 61984 (552.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1704.6 (5.1) 11891.1 (34.55) 1643.8 (7.3) 40607 2 (382.0)	k=64 Best 3152(1.03) 2798 1564(1.01) 438(1.01) 493 108505(1.01) 2569 2566(1.01) 16134(1.01) 2537 49521(1.01)	MMA 3021(1.03) - 1554(1.01) 454(1.01) 499 107862(1.01) 2552 2561(1.01) 15888(1.01) 2519 48040(1.01)	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2) 460.7 (5.0) 514.2 (7.7) 108144 (219.7) 2563.1 (8.3) 2574.3 (6.4) 15911.1 (28.7) 2533.2 (6.4) 48794 (1066 3)
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing-nodal fe-4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29	k=16 Best 2149 1162 581 159 121 55136 1108 1108 8422 1018 32654 <b>22869</b>	MMA 2064 1135 573 153 117 54763 1095 1094 8359 1010 32532 24106	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4) 158 (2.6) 122.4 (5.9) 55250.5 (337.7) 1102.3 (4.3) 1111.4 (10.3) 8404.1 (29.4) 1013.1 (3.4) 33207.3 (249.7) 25167.5 (694.5)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) 1802(1.03) 969(1.01) 258(1.01) 212(1.01) 78132 1718 1728 12080 1657 42187 36104	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 969(1.01) 264(1.01) 212(1.01) 61047 1693 11828 1633 40098 35537	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0) 972.3 (2.57) 273.0 (4.5) 215.4 (8.6) 61984 (552.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1704.6 (5.1) 11891.1 (34.55) 1643.8 (7.3) 40607.2 (282.0) 36100.3 (239.3)	k=64 Best 3152(1.03) 2798 1564(1.01) 438(1.01) 493 108505(1.01) 2569 2566(1.01) 16134(1.01) 2337 49521(1.01) 57054(1.01)	MMA 3021(1.03) - 1554(1.01) 454(1.01) 499 107862(1.01) 2552 2551(1.01) 15888(1.01) 2519 48040(1.01) 56792(1.01)	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2) 460.7 (5.0) 514.2 (7.7) 108144 (219.7) 2563.1 (8.3) 2574.3 (6.4) 15911.1 (28.7) 2533.2 (6.4) 48794 (1006.3) 57640.1 (448.8)
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing-nodal fe-4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt	k=16 Best 2149 1162 581 159 121 55136 1108 1108 8422 1018 32654 <b>22869</b> 956	MMA 2064 1135 573 153 117 54763 1095 1094 8359 1010 32532 24106 942	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4) 158 (2.6) 122.4 (5.9) 55250.5 (337.7) 1102.3 (4.3) 1111.4 (10.3) 8404.1 (29.4) 1013.1 (3.4) 33207.3 (249.7) 25167.5 (694.5) 950.2 (6.096)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) <b>1802</b> (1.03) <b>969</b> (1.01) <b>258</b> (1.01) <b>212</b> (1.01) 78132 1718 1728 12080 1657 42187 36104 1592	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 969(1.01) 264(1.01) 212(1.01) 61047 1697 1693 11828 1633 40098 35637 1553	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0) 972.3 (2.57) 273.0 (4.5) 215.4 (8.6) 61984 (552.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1704.6 (5.1) 11891.1 (34.55) 1643.8 (7.3) 40607.2 (282.0) 36100.3 (239.3) 1577.7 (9.5)	k=64 Best 3152(1.03) <b>2798</b> 1564(1.01) <b>438</b> (1.01) <b>493</b> 108505(1.01) 2569 2566(1.01) 16134(1.01) 2537 49521(1.01) 57054(1.01) 2636	MMA 3021(1.03) - 1554(1.01) 454(1.01) 499 107862(1.01) 2552 2561(1.01) 15888(1.01) 2519 48040(1.01) 56792(1.01) 2596	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2) 460.7 (5.0) 514.2 (7.7) 108144 (219.7) 2563.1 (8.3) 2574.3 (6.4) 15911.1 (28.7) 2533.2 (6.4) 48794 (1006.3) 57640.1 (448.8) 2603.8 (6.4)
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 besstk33 whitaker3 crack wing-nodal fe-4elt2 vibrobox besstk29 4elt fe-sphere	k=16 Best 2149 1162 581 159 121 55136 1108 8422 1018 32654 <b>22869</b> 956 1750	MMA 2064 1135 573 153 117 54763 1095 1094 8359 1010 32532 24106 942 1734	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4) 158 (2.6) 122.4 (5.9) 55250.5 (337.7) 1102.3 (4.3) 1111.4 (10.3) 8404.1 (29.4) 1013.1 (3.4) 33207.3 (249.7) 25167.5 (694.5) 950.2 (6.096) 1739.4 (3.1)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) <b>1802</b> (1.03) <b>969</b> (1.01) <b>258</b> (1.01) <b>212</b> (1.01) 78132 1718 1728 12080 1657 42187 36104 1592 2567	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 969(1.01) 264(1.01) 212(1.01) 61047 1697 1693 11828 1633 40098 35637 1563 2542	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0) 972.3 (2.57) 273.0 (4.5) 215.4 (8.6) 61984 (552.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1704.6 (5.1) 11891.1 (34.55) 1643.8 (7.3) 40607.2 (282.0) 36100.3 (239.3) 1577.7 (9.5) 2565.3 (12.4)	k=64 Best 3152(1.03) <b>2798</b> 1564(1.01) <b>438</b> (1.01) <b>493</b> 108505(1.01) 2566(1.01) 16134(1.01) 2537 49521(1.01) 57054(1.01) 2636 3663	MMA 3021(1.03) - 1554(1.01) 454(1.01) 499 107862(1.01) 2552 2561(1.01) 15888(1.01) 2519 48040(1.01) 56792(1.01) 2596 3625	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2) 460.7 (5.0) 514.2 (7.7) 108144 (219.7) 2563.1 (8.3) 2574.3 (6.4) 15911.1 (28.7) 2533.2 (6.4) 48794 (1006.3) 57640.1 (448.8) 2603.8 (6.4) 3655.7 (15.7)
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing-nodal fe-4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe-sphere cti	k=16 Best 2149 1162 581 159 121 55136 1108 1108 1108 8422 1018 32654 <b>22869</b> 956 1750 2909	MMA 2064 1135 573 153 1095 1094 8359 1010 32532 24106 942 1734 2837	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4) 158 (2.6) 122.4 (5.9) 55250.5 (337.7) 1102.3 (4.3) 1111.4 (10.3) 8404.1 (29.4) 1013.1 (3.4) 33207.3 (249.7) 25167.5 (694.5) 950.2 (6.096) 1739.4 (3.1) 2894.5 (27.8)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) 1802(1.03) 969(1.01) 258(1.01) 212(1.01) 78132 1718 1728 12080 1657 42187 36104 1592 2567 4288	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 969(1.01) 264(1.01) 212(1.01) 61047 1693 11828 1633 11828 1633 40098 35637 1563 2542 4142	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0) 972.3 (2.57) 273.0 (4.5) 215.4 (8.6) 61984 (552.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1704.6 (5.1) 11891.1 (34.55) 1643.8 (7.3) 40607.2 (282.0) 36100.3 (239.3) 1577.7 (9.5) 2565.3 (12.4) 4200.0 (33.1)	k=64 Best 3152(1.03) <b>2798</b> 1564(1.01) <b>438</b> (1.01) <b>493</b> 108505(1.01) 2566 2566(1.01) 16134(1.01) 2537 49521(1.01) 57054(1.01) 2636 3663 5955	MMA 3021(1.03) - 1554(1.01) 454(1.01) 499 2552 2561(1.01) 15888(1.01) 2519 48040(1.01) 56792(1.01) 2596 3625 5818	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2) 460.7 (5.0) 514.2 (7.7) 108144 (219.7) 2563.1 (8.3) 2574.3 (6.4) 15911.1 (28.7) 2533.2 (6.4) 48794 (1006.3) 57640.1 (448.8) 2603.8 (6.4) 3655.7 (15.7) 5862.8 (36.0)
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing-nodal fe-4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe-sphere cti memplus	k=16           Best           2149           1162           581           159           121           55136           1108           1108           120           32654           22869           956           1750           2909           13516	MMA 2064 1135 573 153 1095 1094 8359 1010 32532 24106 942 1734 2837 13054	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4) 158 (2.6) 122.4 (5.9) 55250.5 (337.7) 1102.3 (4.3) 1111.4 (10.3) 8404.1 (29.4) 1013.1 (3.4) 33207.3 (249.7) 25167.5 (694.5) 950.2 (6.096) 1739.4 (3.1) 2894.5 (27.8) 1309.0 (31.1)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) 1802(1.03) 969(1.01) 258(1.01) 212(1.01) 78132 1718 1728 12080 1657 42187 36104 1592 2567 4288 14634	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 969(1.01) 264(1.01) 212(1.01) 61047 1693 11828 1633 11828 1633 40098 35637 1563 2542 4142 14501	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0) 972.3 (2.57) 273.0 (4.5) 215.4 (8.6) 61984 (552.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1704.6 (5.1) 11891.1 (34.55) 1643.8 (7.3) 40607.2 (282.0) 36100.3 (239.3) 1577.7 (9.5) 2565.3 (12.4) 4200.0 (33.1) 14601.6 (75.5)	k=64           Best           3152(1.03)           2798           1564(1.01)           438(1.01)           493           108505(1.01)           2569           2566(1.01)           16134(1.01)           2537           49521(1.01)           57054(1.01)           2636           3663           5955           17446	MMA 3021(1.03) - 1554(1.01) 454(1.01) 499 107862(1.01) 2552 2561(1.01) 15888(1.01) 2519 48040(1.01) 56792(1.01) 2596 3625 5818 -	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2) 460.7 (5.0) 514.2 (7.7) 108144 (219.7) 2563.1 (8.3) 2574.3 (6.4) 15911.1 (28.7) 2533.2 (6.4) 48794 (1006.3) 57640.1 (448.8) 2603.8 (6.4) 3655.7 (15.7) 5862.8 (36.0) -
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing-nodal fe-4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe-sphere cti memplus cs4	k=16 Best 2149 1162 581 159 121 55136 1108 1108 8422 1018 32654 <b>22869</b> 956 1750 2909 13516 2206	MMA 2064 1135 573 153 117 54763 1095 1094 8359 1010 32532 24106 942 1734 2837 13054 2107	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4) 158 (2.6) 122.4 (5.9) 55250.5 (337.7) 1102.3 (4.3) 1111.4 (10.3) 8404.1 (29.4) 1013.1 (3.4) 33207.3 (249.7) 25167.5 (694.5) 950.2 (6.096) 1739.4 (3.1) 2894.5 (27.8) 13099.0 (31.1) 2136.8 (15.1)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) 1802(1.03) 969(1.01) 258(1.01) 212(1.01) 78132 1718 1728 12080 1657 42187 36104 1592 2567 4288 14634 3110	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 999(1.01) 264(1.01) 212(1.01) 61047 1693 11828 1633 11828 1633 40098 35637 1563 2542 4142 14501 2938	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0) 972.3 (2.57) 273.0 (4.5) 215.4 (8.6) 61984 (552.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1704.6 (5.1) 11891.1 (34.55) 1643.8 (7.3) 40607.2 (282.0) 36100.3 (239.3) 1577.7 (9.5) 2565.3 (12.4) 4200.0 (33.1) 14601.6 (75.5) 2979.7 (16.5)	k=64 Best 3152(1.03) 2798 1564(1.01) 438(1.01) 493 108505(1.01) 2569 2566(1.01) 16134(1.01) 2537 49521(1.01) 257054(1.01) 2636 3663 5955 17446 4223	MMA 3021(1.03) - 1554(1.01) 454(1.01) 499 107862(1.01) 2552 2561(1.01) 15888(1.01) 2519 48040(1.01) 56792(1.01) 2596 3625 5818 - 4051	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2) 460.7 (5.0) 514.2 (7.7) 108144 (219.7) 2563.1 (8.3) 2574.3 (6.4) 15911.1 (28.7) 2533.2 (6.4) 48794 (1006.3) 57640.1 (448.8) 2603.8 (6.4) 3655.7 (15.7) 5862.8 (36.0) - 4095.7 (19.8)
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing-nodal fe-4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe-sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30	k=16           Best           2149           1162           581           159           121           55136           1108           1108           1018           32654           22869           956           1750           209           13516           2206           72007	MMA 2064 1135 573 153 117 54763 1095 1094 8359 1010 32532 24106 942 1734 2837 13054 2107 70910	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4) 158 (2.6) 122.4 (5.9) 55250.5 (337.7) 1102.3 (4.3) 1111.4 (10.3) 8404.1 (29.4) 1013.1 (3.4) 33207.3 (249.7) 25167.5 (694.5) 950.2 (6.096) 1739.4 (3.1) 2894.5 (27.8) 13099.0 (31.1) 2136.8 (15.1) 71978.7 (411.9)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) 1802(1.03) 969(1.01) 258(1.01) 212(1.01) 78132 1718 1728 12080 1657 42187 36104 1592 2567 4288 14634 3110 119164	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 969(1.01) 264(1.01) 212(1.01) 61047 1693 11828 1633 11828 1633 11828 1633 2542 4142 14501 2938 113788	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0) 972.3 (2.57) 273.0 (4.5) 215.4 (8.6) 61984 (552.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1704.6 (5.1) 11891.1 (34.55) 1643.8 (7.3) 40607.2 (282.0) 36100.3 (239.3) 1577.7 (9.5) 2565.3 (12.4) 4200.0 (33.1) 14601.6 (75.5) 2979.7 (16.5) 115716 (1030.4)	k=64           Best           3152(1.03)           2798           1564(1.01)           493           108505(1.01)           2569           2566(1.01)           16134(1.01)           2337           49521(1.01)           2636           3663           5955           17446           4223           173945(1.01)	MMA 3021(1.03) - 1554(1.01) 454(1.01) 499 107862(1.01) 2552 2551(1.01) 15888(1.01) 2519 48040(1.01) 56792(1.01) 2596 3625 5818 - 4051 174982(1.01)	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2) 460.7 (5.0) 514.2 (7.7) 108144 (219.7) 2563.1 (8.3) 2574.3 (6.4) 15911.1 (28.7) 2533.2 (6.4) 48794 (1006.3) 57640.1 (448.8) 2603.8 (6.4) 3655.7 (15.7) 5862.8 (36.0) - 4095.7 (19.8) 176496 (1066.3)
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing-nodal fe-4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe-sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk31	k=16           Best           2149           1162           581           159           121           55136           1108           1108           8422           1018           32654           22869           956           1750           2909           13516           2206           72007           24551	MMA 2064 1135 573 153 117 54763 1095 1094 8359 1010 32532 24106 942 1734 2837 13054 2107 70910 23807	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4) 158 (2.6) 122.4 (5.9) 55250.5 (337.7) 1102.3 (4.3) 1111.4 (10.3) 8404.1 (29.4) 1013.1 (3.4) 33207.3 (249.7) 25167.5 (694.5) 950.2 (6.096) 1739.4 (3.1) 2894.5 (27.8) 13099.0 (31.1) 2136.8 (15.1) 71978.7 (411.9) 24152.2 (226.3)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) <b>1802</b> (1.03) <b>258</b> (1.01) <b>258</b> (1.01) <b>212</b> (1.01) 78132 1718 1728 12080 1657 42187 36104 1592 2567 4288 14634 3110 119164 38484	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 969(1.01) 264(1.01) 212(1.01) 61047 1697 1693 11828 1633 40098 35637 1563 2542 4142 14501 2938 113788 37927	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0) 972.3 (2.57) 273.0 (4.5) 215.4 (8.6) 61984 (552.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1704.6 (5.1) 11891.1 (34.55) 1643.8 (7.3) 40607.2 (282.0) 36100.3 (239.3) 1577.7 (9.5) 2565.3 (12.4) 4200.0 (33.1) 14601.6 (75.5) 2979.7 (16.5) 115716 (1030.4) 38432.7 (447.0)	k=64           Best           3152(1.03)           2798           1564(1.01)           493           108505(1.01)           2569           2566(1.01)           16134(1.01)           2537           49521(1.01)           57054(1.01)           2636           3663           5955           173446           4223           173945(1.01)           60724	MMA 3021(1.03) - 1554(1.01) 454(1.01) 499 107862(1.01) 2552 2561(1.01) 15888(1.01) 2519 48040(1.01) 56792(1.01) 2596 3625 5818 - 4051 174982(1.01) 58241	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2) 460.7 (5.0) 514.2 (7.7) 108144 (219.7) 2563.1 (8.3) 2574.3 (6.4) 15911.1 (28.7) 2533.2 (6.4) 48794 (1006.3) 57640.1 (448.8) 2603.8 (6.4) 3655.7 (15.7) 5862.8 (36.0) - 4095.7 (19.8) 176496 (1066.3) 58651.4 (230.4)
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing-nodal fe-4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe-sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe-pwt	k=16           Best           2149           1162           581           159           121           55136           1108           1108           1108           1018           32654           22869           956           1750           2909           13516           2206           72007           24551           2855	MMA 2064 1135 573 153 1095 1094 8359 1010 32532 24106 942 1734 2837 13054 2107 70910 23807 2838	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4) 158 (2.6) 122.4 (5.9) 55250.5 (337.7) 1102.3 (4.3) 1111.4 (10.3) 8404.1 (29.4) 1013.1 (3.4) 33207.3 (249.7) 25167.5 (694.5) 950.2 (6.096) 1739.4 (3.1) 2894.5 (27.8) 13099.0 (31.1) 2136.8 (15.1) 71978.7 (411.9) 24152.2 (226.3) 2845.0 (6.1)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) 1802(1.03) 969(1.01) 258(1.01) 212(1.01) 78132 1718 1728 12080 1657 42187 36104 1592 2567 4288 14634 3110 119164 38484 5758	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 969(1.01) 264(1.01) 212(1.01) 61047 1693 11828 1633 11828 1633 40098 35637 1563 2542 4142 14501 2938 113788 37927 5663	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0) 972.3 (2.57) 273.0 (4.5) 215.4 (8.6) 61984 (552.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1704.6 (5.1) 11891.1 (34.55) 1643.8 (7.3) 40607.2 (282.0) 36100.3 (239.3) 1577.7 (9.5) 2565.3 (12.4) 4200.0 (33.1) 14601.6 (75.5) 2979.7 (16.5) 115716 (1030.4) 38432.7 (447.0) 5693.1 (24.3)	k=64           Best           3152(1.03)           2798           1564(1.01)           438(1.01)           493           108505(1.01)           2566(1.01)           16134(1.01)           2537           49521(1.01)           57054(1.01)           2636           3663           5955           17446           4223           173945(1.01)           60724           8495	MMA 3021(1.03) - 1554(1.01) 454(1.01) 499 107862(1.01) 2552 2561(1.01) 15888(1.01) 2519 48040(1.01) 56792(1.01) 2596 3625 5818 - 4051 174982(1.01) 58241 8338	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2) 460.7 (5.0) 514.2 (7.7) 108144 (219.7) 2563.1 (8.3) 2574.3 (6.4) 15911.1 (28.7) 2533.2 (6.4) 48794 (1006.3) 57640.1 (448.8) 2603.8 (6.4) 3655.7 (15.7) 5862.8 (36.0) - 4095.7 (19.8) 176496 (1066.3) 58651.4 (230.4) 8358.4 (15.0)
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing-nodal fe-4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe-sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe-pwt bcsstk31	k=16           Best           2149           1162           581           159           121           55136           1108           1108           10108           32654           22869           956           1750           2909           13516           2206           72007           24551           2855           38711	MMA 2064 1135 573 153 1095 1094 8359 1010 32532 24106 942 1734 2837 13054 2107 70910 23807 2838 36518	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4) 158 (2.6) 122.4 (5.9) 55250.5 (337.7) 1102.3 (4.3) 1111.4 (10.3) 8404.1 (29.4) 1013.1 (3.4) 33207.3 (249.7) 25167.5 (694.5) 950.2 (6.096) 1739.4 (3.1) 2894.5 (27.8) 1309.0 (31.1) 2136.8 (15.1) 71978.7 (411.9) 24152.2 (226.3) 2450.0 (6.1) 37225.7 (506.1)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) 1802(1.03) 969(1.01) 258(1.01) 212(1.01) 78132 1718 1728 12080 1657 42187 36104 1592 2567 42187 36104 1592 2567 4288 14634 3110 119164 38484 5758 63856 2371	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 969(1.01) 264(1.01) 212(1.01) 61047 1693 11828 1633 11828 1633 40098 35637 1563 2542 4142 14501 2938 113788 37927 5663 60898	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0) 972.3 (2.57) 273.0 (4.5) 215.4 (8.6) 61984 (552.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1704.6 (5.1) 11891.1 (34.55) 1643.8 (7.3) 40607.2 (282.0) 36100.3 (239.3) 1577.7 (9.5) 2565.3 (12.4) 4200.0 (33.1) 14601.6 (75.5) 2979.7 (16.5) 115716 (1030.4) 38432.7 (447.0) 5693.1 (24.3) 61670.1 (538.7)	k=64           Best           3152(1.03)           2798           1564(1.01)           438(1.01)           493           108505(1.01)           2569           2566(1.01)           16134(1.01)           2537           49521(1.01)           2636           3663           5955           17446           4223           173945(1.01)           60724           8495           95199           5169	MMA 3021(1.03) - 1554(1.01) 454(1.01) 499 107862(1.01) 2552 2561(1.01) 15888(1.01) 2519 48040(1.01) 56792(1.01) 2596 3625 5818 - 4051 174982(1.01) 58241 8338 91863 4022	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2) 460.7 (5.0) 514.2 (7.7) 108144 (219.7) 2563.1 (8.3) 2574.3 (6.4) 15911.1 (28.7) 2533.2 (6.4) 48794 (1006.3) 57640.1 (448.8) 2603.8 (6.4) 3655.7 (15.7) 5862.8 (36.0) - 4095.7 (19.8) 176496 (1066.3) 58651.4 (230.4) 8358.4 (15.0) 93633.2 (826.3) 620.1 f (5.7)
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing-nodal fe-4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe-sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe-pwt bcsstk32 fe-body	k=16 Best 2149 1162 581 159 121 55136 1108 1108 1108 8422 1018 32654 <b>22869</b> 956 1750 2909 13516 2206 72007 24551 2855 38711 2057	MMA 2064 1135 573 153 1095 1094 8359 1010 32532 24106 942 1734 2837 13054 2107 70910 23807 2838 36518 1834	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4) 158 (2.6) 122.4 (5.9) 55250.5 (337.7) 1102.3 (4.3) 1111.4 (10.3) 8404.1 (29.4) 1013.1 (3.4) 33207.3 (249.7) 25167.5 (694.5) 950.2 (6.096) 1739.4 (3.1) 2894.5 (27.8) 13099.0 (31.1) 2136.8 (15.1) 71978.7 (411.9) 24152.2 (226.3) 2845.0 (6.1) 37225.7 (506.1) 1890.6 (36.0)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) <b>1802</b> (1.03) <b>969</b> (1.01) <b>258</b> (1.01) <b>212</b> (1.01) 78132 1718 1728 12080 1657 42187 36104 1592 2567 42187 36104 1592 2567 4288 14634 3110 119164 38484 5758 63856 3371	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 969(1.01) 264(1.01) 212(1.01) 61047 1693 11828 1633 40098 35637 1563 2542 4142 14501 2938 113788 37927 5663 60898 3060	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0) 972.3 (2.57) 273.0 (4.5) 215.4 (8.6) 61984 (552.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1704.6 (5.1) 11891.1 (34.55) 1643.8 (7.3) 40607.2 (282.0) 36100.3 (239.3) 1577.7 (9.5) 2565.3 (12.4) 4200.0 (33.1) 14601.6 (75.5) 2979.7 (16.5) 115716 (1030.4) 38432.7 (447.0) 5693.1 (24.3) 61670.1 (538.7) 3101.7 (35.1)	k=64           Best           3152(1.03)           2798           1564(1.01)           438(1.01)           493           108505(1.01)           16134(1.01)           2569           2566(1.01)           16134(1.01)           2537           49521(1.01)           2636           3663           5955           17446           4223           173945(1.01)           60724           8495           95199           5460           2323	MMA 3021(1.03) - 1554(1.01) 454(1.01) 499 107862(1.01) 2552 2561(1.01) 15888(1.01) 2519 48040(1.01) 56792(1.01) 2596 3625 5818 - 4051 174982(1.01) 58241 8338 91863 4903 2020	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2) 460.7 (5.0) 514.2 (7.7) 108144 (219.7) 2563.1 (8.3) 2574.3 (6.4) 15911.1 (28.7) 2533.2 (6.4) 48794 (1006.3) 57640.1 (448.8) 2603.8 (6.4) 3655.7 (15.7) 5862.8 (36.0) - 4095.7 (19.8) 176496 (1066.3) 58651.4 (230.4) 8358.4 (15.0) 93633.2 (826.3) 5021.7 (47.7) 2022 7 (202)
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing-nodal fe-4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe-sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk31 fe-pwt bcsstk32 fe-body t60k	k=16 Best 2149 1162 581 159 121 55136 1108 1108 8422 1018 32654 22869 956 1750 2909 13516 2206 72007 24551 2855 38711 2057 <b>866</b> 4100	MMA 2064 1135 573 153 117 54763 1095 1094 8359 1010 32532 24106 942 1734 2837 13054 2107 70910 23807 2838 36518 1834 881 2921	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4) 158 (2.6) 122.4 (5.9) 55250.5 (337.7) 1102.3 (4.3) 1111.4 (10.3) 8404.1 (29.4) 1013.1 (3.4) 33207.3 (249.7) 25167.5 (694.5) 950.2 (6.096) 1739.4 (3.1) 2894.5 (27.8) 13099.0 (31.1) 2136.8 (15.1) 71978.7 (411.9) 24152.2 (226.3) 2845.0 (6.1) 37225.7 (506.1) 1890.6 (36.0) 890.1 (6.3) 2050.0 (27.2)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) 1802(1.03) 969(1.01) 258(1.01) 212(1.01) 78132 1718 1728 12080 1657 42187 36104 1592 2567 42187 36104 1592 2567 4288 14634 3110 119164 38484 5758 63856 3371 1440 (200)	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 969(1.01) 264(1.01) 212(1.01) 61047 1693 11828 1633 40098 35637 1563 2542 4142 14501 2938 113788 37927 5663 60898 3060 1431 5643	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0) 972.3 (2.57) 273.0 (4.5) 215.4 (8.6) 61984 (552.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1704.6 (5.1) 11891.1 (34.55) 1643.8 (7.3) 40607.2 (282.0) 36100.3 (239.3) 1577.7 (9.5) 2565.3 (12.4) 4200.0 (33.1) 14601.6 (75.5) 2979.7 (16.5) 115716 (1030.4) 38432.7 (447.0) 5693.1 (24.3) 61670.1 (538.7) 3101.7 (35.1) 1453.5 (10.6) 5702.7 (26.2)	k=64           Best           3152(1.03)           2798           1564(1.01)           438(1.01)           493           108505(1.01)           16134(1.01)           2569           2566(1.01)           16134(1.01)           2537           49521(1.01)           57054(1.01)           2636           3663           5955           17446           4223           173945(1.01)           60724           8495           95199           5460           2233	MMA 3021(1.03) - 1554(1.01) 454(1.01) 499 107862(1.01) 2552 2561(1.01) 15888(1.01) 2519 48040(1.01) 56792(1.01) 2596 3625 5818 - 4051 174982(1.01) 58241 8338 91863 4903 2260 7609	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2) 460.7 (5.0) 514.2 (7.7) 108144 (219.7) 2563.1 (8.3) 2574.3 (6.4) 15911.1 (28.7) 2533.2 (6.4) 48794 (1006.3) 57640.1 (448.8) 2603.8 (6.4) 3655.7 (15.7) 5862.8 (36.0) - 4095.7 (19.8) 176496 (1066.3) 58651.4 (230.4) 8358.4 (15.0) 93633.2 (826.3) 5021.7 (47.7) 2273.7 (7.9) 7752.7 (7.9) 7752.7 (7.9) 7752.7 (7.9)
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing-nodal fe-4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe-sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe-pwt bcsstk32 fe-body t60k wing hcstb2	k=16           Best           2149           1162           581           159           121           55136           1108           1108           1208           22869           956           1750           2009           13516           2206           72007           24551           387111           2057           866           4198           12222	MMA 2064 1135 573 153 117 54763 1095 1094 8359 1010 32532 24106 942 1734 2837 13054 2107 70910 23807 2838 36518 1834 881 3921 1160	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4) 158 (2.6) 122.4 (5.9) 55250.5 (337.7) 1102.3 (4.3) 1111.4 (10.3) 8404.1 (29.4) 1013.1 (3.4) 33207.3 (249.7) 25167.5 (694.5) 950.2 (6.096) 1739.4 (3.1) 2894.5 (27.8) 13099.0 (31.1) 2136.8 (15.1) 71978.7 (411.9) 24152.2 (226.3) 2845.0 (6.1) 37225.7 (506.1) 1890.6 (36.0) 890.1 (6.3) 3960.9 (27.2)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) 1802(1.03) 969(1.01) 258(1.01) 212(1.01) 78132 1718 12080 1657 42187 36104 1592 2567 4288 14634 3110 119164 38484 5758 63856 3371 1440 6009 18220	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 969(1.01) 264(1.01) 212(1.01) 61047 1693 11828 1633 11828 1633 40098 35637 1563 2542 4142 14501 2938 113788 37927 5663 60898 3060 1431 5643 11738	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0) 972.3 (2.57) 273.0 (4.5) 215.4 (8.6) 61984 (552.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1704.6 (5.1) 11891.1 (34.55) 1643.8 (7.3) 40607.2 (282.0) 36100.3 (239.3) 1577.7 (9.5) 2565.3 (12.4) 4200.0 (33.1) 14601.6 (75.5) 2979.7 (16.5) 115716 (1030.4) 38432.7 (447.0) 5693.1 (24.3) 61670.1 (538.7) 3101.7 (35.1) 1453.5 (10.6) 5703.7 (33.2)	k=64           Best           3152(1.03)           2798           1564(1.01)           493           108505(1.01)           2569           2566(1.01)           16134(1.01)           2537           49521(1.01)           57054(1.01)           2636           3663           5955           17446           4223           173945(1.01)           60724           895           95199           5460           2233           8132           27178	MMA 3021(1.03) - 1554(1.01) 454(1.01) 499 107862(1.01) 2552 2551(1.01) 15888(1.01) 2519 48040(1.01) 56792(1.01) 2596 3625 5818 - 4051 174982(1.01) 58241 8338 91863 4903 2260 7690 25907	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2) 460.7 (5.0) 514.2 (7.7) 108144 (219.7) 2563.1 (8.3) 2574.3 (6.4) 15911.1 (28.7) 2533.2 (6.4) 48794 (1006.3) 57640.1 (448.8) 2603.8 (6.4) 3655.7 (15.7) 5862.8 (36.0) - 4095.7 (19.8) 176496 (1066.3) 58651.4 (230.4) 8358.4 (15.0) 93633.2 (826.3) 5021.7 (47.7) 2273.7 (7.9) 7752.7 (33.8)
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing-nodal fe-4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe-sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe-pwt bcsstk32 fe-body t60k wing brack2 finap512	k=16 Best 2149 1162 581 159 121 55136 1108 1108 1108 8422 1018 32654 <b>22869</b> 956 1750 2909 13516 2206 72007 24551 2855 38711 2057 <b>866</b> 4198 12323 <b>1296</b>	MMA 2064 1135 573 153 1095 1094 8359 1010 32532 24106 942 1734 2837 13054 2107 70910 23807 2838 36518 1834 881 3921 11689 1296	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4) 158 (2.6) 122.4 (5.9) 55250.5 (337.7) 1102.3 (4.3) 1111.4 (10.3) 8404.1 (29.4) 1013.1 (3.4) 33207.3 (249.7) 25167.5 (694.5) 950.2 (6.096) 1739.4 (3.1) 2894.5 (27.8) 13099.0 (31.1) 2136.8 (15.1) 71978.7 (411.9) 24152.2 (226.3) 2845.0 (6.1) 37225.7 (506.1) 1890.6 (36.0) 890.1 (6.3) 3960.9 (27.2) 11859.5 (92.6)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) 1802(1.03) 969(1.01) 258(1.01) 212(1.01) 78132 1718 1728 12080 1657 42187 36104 1592 2567 4288 14634 3110 119164 38484 5758 63856 3371 1440 6009 18229 2592	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 969(1.01) 264(1.01) 212(1.01) 61047 1693 11828 1633 11828 1633 2542 44098 35637 1563 2542 4442 14501 2542 4442 14501 2538 113788 37927 5663 60898 3060 1431 5643 17398 2592	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0) 972.3 (2.57) 273.0 (4.5) 215.4 (8.6) 61984 (552.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1704.6 (5.1) 11891.1 (34.55) 1643.8 (7.3) 40607.2 (282.0) 36100.3 (239.3) 1577.7 (9.5) 2565.3 (12.4) 4200.0 (33.1) 14601.6 (75.5) 115716 (1030.4) 38432.7 (447.0) 5693.1 (24.3) 61670.1 (538.7) 3101.7 (35.1) 1453.5 (10.6) 5703.7 (33.2) 17612.7 (135.8) 2592.0 (0.0)	k=64           Best           3152(1.03)           2798           1564(1.01)           493           108505(1.01)           2569           2566(1.01)           16134(1.01)           2537           49521(1.01)           57054(1.01)           2636           3663           5955           173945(1.01)           60724           8495           95199           5460           2233           8132           21178           10560	MMA 3021(1.03) - 1554(1.01) 454(1.01) 499 107862(1.01) 2552 2561(1.01) 15888(1.01) 2519 48040(1.01) 56792(1.01) 2596 3625 5818 - 4051 174982(1.01) 58241 8338 91863 4903 2260 7690 25997 10566	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2) 460.7 (5.0) 514.2 (7.7) 108144 (219.7) 2563.1 (8.3) 2574.3 (6.4) 15911.1 (28.7) 2533.2 (6.4) 48794 (1006.3) 57640.1 (448.8) 2603.8 (6.4) 3655.7 (15.7) 5862.8 (36.0) - 4095.7 (19.8) 176496 (1066.3) 58651.4 (230.4) 8358.4 (15.0) 93633.2 (826.3) 5021.7 (47.7) 2273.7 (7.9) 7752.7 (33.8) 26154.6 (108.6) 10662.3 (92.6)
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing-nodal fe-4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe-sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk31 fe-pwt bcsstk31 fe-pwt bcsstk31 fe-body t60k wing brack2 finan512 fe-tootb	k=16 Best 2149 1162 581 159 121 55136 1108 1108 1108 8422 1018 32654 <b>22869</b> 956 1750 2909 13516 2206 72007 24551 2855 38711 2057 <b>866</b> 4198 12323 <b>1296</b> 18382	MMA 2064 1135 573 153 1095 1094 8359 1010 32532 24106 942 1734 2837 13054 2107 70910 23807 2838 36518 1834 881 3921 11689 1296 17428	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4) 158 (2.6) 122.4 (5.9) 55250.5 (337.7) 1102.3 (4.3) 1111.4 (10.3) 8404.1 (29.4) 1013.1 (3.4) 33207.3 (249.7) 25167.5 (694.5) 950.2 (6.096) 1739.4 (3.1) 2894.5 (27.8) 13099.0 (31.1) 2136.8 (15.1) 71978.7 (411.9) 24152.2 (226.3) 2845.0 (6.1) 37225.7 (506.1) 1890.6 (36.0) 890.1 (6.3) 3960.9 (27.2) 11859.5 (92.6) 1356.8 (35.1)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) 1802(1.03) 969(1.01) 258(1.01) 212(1.01) 78132 17118 1728 12080 1657 42187 36104 1592 2567 4288 14634 3110 119164 38484 5758 63856 3371 1440 6009 18229 2592 26346	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 969(1.01) 264(1.01) 212(1.01) 61047 1693 11828 1633 11828 1633 40098 35637 1563 2542 4142 14501 2938 113788 37927 5663 60898 3060 1431 5643 17398 2592 24085	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0) 972.3 (2.57) 273.0 (4.5) 215.4 (8.6) 61984 (552.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1704.6 (5.1) 11891.1 (34.55) 1643.8 (7.3) 40607.2 (282.0) 36100.3 (239.3) 1577.7 (9.5) 2565.3 (12.4) 4200.0 (33.1) 14601.6 (75.5) 2979.7 (16.5) 115716 (1030.4) 38432.7 (447.0) 5693.1 (24.3) 61670.1 (538.7) 3101.7 (35.1) 1453.5 (10.6) 5703.7 (33.2) 17612.7 (135.8) 2292.0 (10.0)	k=64           Best           3152(1.03)           2798           1564(1.01)           438(1.01)           493           108505(1.01)           16134(1.01)           2569           2566(1.01)           16134(1.01)           2537           49521(1.01)           57054(1.01)           2636           3663           5955           17446           4223           173945(1.01)           60724           8495           95199           5460           2233           8132           27178           10560           35980	MMA 3021(1.03) - 1554(1.01) 454(1.01) 499 107862(1.01) 2552 2561(1.01) 15888(1.01) 2519 48040(1.01) 56792(1.01) 2596 3625 5818 - 4051 174982(1.01) 58241 8338 91863 4903 2260 7690 25997 10560 34433	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2) 460.7 (5.0) 514.2 (7.7) 108144 (219.7) 2563.1 (8.3) 2574.3 (6.4) 15911.1 (28.7) 2533.2 (6.4) 48794 (1006.3) 57640.1 (448.8) 2603.8 (6.4) 3655.7 (15.7) 5862.8 (36.0) - 4095.7 (19.8) 176496 (1066.3) 58651.4 (230.4) 8358.4 (15.0) 93633.2 (826.3) 5021.7 (47.7) 2273.7 (7.9) 7752.7 (33.8) 26154.6 (108.6) 10662.3 (82.6) 34688.9 (100.9)
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing-nodal fe-4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe-sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe-pwt bcsstk32 fe-body t60k wing brack2 finan512 fe-tooth fe-rotor	k=16           Best           2149           1162           581           159           121           55136           1108           1108           1108           1108           1108           121           55136           1108           1108           32654           22869           956           7500           2909           13516           2206           7007           24551           2855           38711           2057           866           4198           12323           1296           18382           21241	MMA 2064 1135 573 153 1095 1094 8359 1010 32532 24106 942 1734 2837 13054 2107 70910 23807 2838 36518 1834 881 3921 11689 1296 17428 20438	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4) 158 (2.6) 122.4 (5.9) 55250.5 (337.7) 1102.3 (4.3) 1111.4 (10.3) 8404.1 (29.4) 1013.1 (3.4) 33207.3 (249.7) 25167.5 (694.5) 950.2 (6.096) 1739.4 (3.1) 2894.5 (27.8) 1309.0 (31.1) 2136.8 (15.1) 71978.7 (411.9) 24152.2 (226.3) 2845.0 (6.1) 37225.7 (506.1) 1890.6 (36.0) 890.1 (6.3) 3960.9 (27.2) 11859.5 (92.6) 1356.8 (35.1) 1766.3 (96.3)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) 1802(1.03) 969(1.01) 258(1.01) 212(1.01) 78132 1718 1728 12080 1657 42187 36104 1592 2567 42187 36104 1592 2567 4288 14634 3110 119164 38484 5758 63856 3371 1440 6009 18229 2592 26346 32783	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 969(1.01) 264(1.01) 212(1.01) 61047 1693 11828 1633 11828 1633 40098 35637 1563 2542 4142 14501 2938 113788 37927 5663 60898 3060 1431 5643 17398 2592 24985 31369	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0) 972.3 (2.57) 273.0 (4.5) 215.4 (8.6) 61984 (552.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1704.6 (5.1) 11891.1 (34.55) 1643.8 (7.3) 40607.2 (282.0) 36100.3 (239.3) 1577.7 (9.5) 2565.3 (12.4) 4200.0 (33.1) 14601.6 (75.5) 2979.7 (16.5) 115716 (1030.4) 38432.7 (447.0) 5693.1 (24.3) 61670.1 (538.7) 3101.7 (35.1) 1453.5 (10.6) 5703.7 (33.2) 17612.7 (135.8) 2592.0 (0.0) 2592.4 (178.0) 31720.5 (257.7)	k=64           Best           3152(1.03)           2798           1564(1.01)           438(1.01)           493           108505(1.01)           16134(1.01)           2569           2566(1.01)           16134(1.01)           2537           49521(1.01)           57054(1.01)           2636           3663           5955           17446           4223           173945(1.01)           60724           8495           95199           5460           2233           8132           27178           10560           35980           49381	MMA 3021(1.03) - 1554(1.01) 454(1.01) 499 107862(1.01) 2552 2561(1.01) 15888(1.01) 2519 48040(1.01) 56792(1.01) 2596 3625 5818 - 4051 174982(1.01) 58241 8338 91863 4903 2260 7690 25997 10560 34433 45984	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2) 460.7 (5.0) 514.2 (7.7) 108144 (219.7) 2563.1 (8.3) 2574.3 (6.4) 15911.1 (28.7) 2533.2 (6.4) 48794 (1006.3) 57640.1 (448.8) 2603.8 (6.4) 3655.7 (15.7) 5862.8 (36.0) - 4095.7 (19.8) 176496 (1066.3) 58651.4 (230.4) 8358.4 (15.0) 93633.2 (826.3) 5021.7 (47.7) 2273.7 (7.9) 7752.7 (33.8) 26154.6 (108.6) 10662.3 (82.6) 34688.9 (100.9) 46364 3 (209.0)
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing-nodal fe-4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe-sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe-pwt bcsstk31 fe-body t60k wing brack2 finan512 fe-tooth fe-rotor 598a	k=16           Best           2149           1162           581           159           121           55136           1108           1108           1108           1108           1018           32654           22869           956           1750           2909           13516           2206           72007           24551           2855           38711           2057           866           4198           12323           1296           18382           21241	MMA 2064 1135 573 153 117 54763 1095 1094 8359 1010 32532 24106 942 1734 2837 13054 2107 70910 23807 2838 36518 1834 881 3921 11689 1296 17428 20438 25783	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4) 158 (2.6) 122.4 (5.9) 55250.5 (337.7) 1102.3 (4.3) 1111.4 (10.3) 8404.1 (29.4) 1013.1 (3.4) 33207.3 (249.7) 25167.5 (694.5) 950.2 (6.096) 1739.4 (3.1) 2894.5 (27.8) 13099.0 (31.1) 2136.8 (15.1) 71978.7 (411.9) 24152.2 (226.3) 2845.0 (6.1) 37225.7 (506.1) 1890.6 (36.0) 890.1 (6.3) 3960.9 (27.2) 11859.5 (92.6) 1356.8 (35.1) 17636.3 (96.3) 20711 (129.7) 26095.5 (147.1)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) 1802(1.03) 258(1.01) 212(1.01) 78132 1718 1728 12080 1657 42187 36104 1592 2567 42187 36104 1592 2567 4288 14634 3110 119164 38484 5758 63856 3371 1440 6009 18229 2592 26346 32783	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 969(1.01) 264(1.01) 212(1.01) 61047 1693 11828 1633 40098 35637 1563 2542 4142 14501 2938 113788 37927 5663 60898 3060 1431 5643 17398 2592 24985 31369 38682	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0) 972.3 (2.57) 273.0 (4.5) 215.4 (8.6) 61984 (552.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1704.6 (5.1) 11891.1 (34.55) 1643.8 (7.3) 40607.2 (282.0) 36100.3 (239.3) 1577.7 (9.5) 2565.3 (12.4) 4200.0 (33.1) 14601.6 (75.5) 2979.7 (16.5) 115716 (1030.4) 38432.7 (447.0) 5693.1 (24.3) 61670.1 (538.7) 3101.7 (35.1) 1453.5 (10.6) 5703.7 (33.2) 17612.7 (135.8) 2592.0 (0.0) 25292.4 (178.0) 31720.5 (257.7) 38939.2 (161.1)	k=64           Best           3152(1.03)           2798           1564(1.01)           438(1.01)           493           108505(1.01)           16134(1.01)           2569           2566(1.01)           16134(1.01)           2537           49521(1.01)           57054(1.01)           2636           3663           5955           17446           4223           173945(1.01)           60724           8495           95199           5460           2233           8132           27178           10560           35980           49381	MMA 3021(1.03) - 1554(1.01) 454(1.01) 499 107862(1.01) 2552 2561(1.01) 15888(1.01) 2519 48040(1.01) 56792(1.01) 2596 3625 5818 - 4051 174982(1.01) 58241 8338 91863 4903 2260 7690 25997 10560 34433 45984 56260	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2) 460.7 (5.0) 514.2 (7.7) 108144 (219.7) 2563.1 (8.3) 2574.3 (6.4) 15911.1 (28.7) 2533.2 (6.4) 48794 (1006.3) 57640.1 (448.8) 2603.8 (6.4) 3655.7 (15.7) 5862.8 (36.0) - 4095.7 (19.8) 176496 (1066.3) 58651.4 (230.4) 8358.4 (15.0) 93633.2 (826.3) 5021.7 (47.7) 2273.7 (7.9) 7752.7 (33.8) 26154.6 (108.6) 10662.3 (82.6) 34688.9 (100.9) 46364.3 (209.0) 56574.5 (163.4)
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing-nodal fe-4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe-sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe-pwt bcsstk32 fe-body t60k wing brack2 finan512 fe-tooth fe-rotor 598a fe-ocean	k=16 Best 2149 1162 581 159 121 55136 1108 1108 8422 1018 32654 22869 956 1750 2909 13516 2206 72007 24551 2855 38711 2057 <b>866</b> 4198 12323 <b>1296</b> 18382 21241 26427 8622	MMA 2064 1135 573 153 117 54763 1095 1094 8359 1010 32532 24106 942 1734 2837 13054 2107 70910 23807 2838 36518 1834 881 3921 11689 1296 17428 20438 25783 7803	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4) 158 (2.6) 122.4 (5.9) 55250.5 (337.7) 1102.3 (4.3) 1111.4 (10.3) 8404.1 (29.4) 1013.1 (3.4) 33207.3 (249.7) 25167.5 (694.5) 950.2 (6.096) 1739.4 (3.1) 2894.5 (27.8) 13099.0 (31.1) 2136.8 (15.1) 71978.7 (411.9) 24152.2 (226.3) 2845.0 (6.1) 37225.7 (506.1) 1890.6 (36.0) 890.1 (6.3) 3960.9 (27.2) 11859.5 (92.6) 1356.8 (35.1) 17636.3 (96.3) 20711 (129.7) 26095.5 (147.1) 7944.7 (98.8)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) 1802(1.03) 258(1.01) 212(1.01) 78132 1718 12080 1657 42187 36104 1592 2567 42187 36104 1592 2567 42187 36104 1592 2567 4288 14634 3110 119164 38484 5758 63856 3371 1440 6009 18229 2592 26346 32783 41538 14277	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 969(1.01) 264(1.01) 212(1.01) 61047 1693 11828 1633 40098 336637 1563 2542 4142 14501 2938 113788 37927 5663 60898 3060 1431 5643 17398 2592 24985 31369 38682 12903	Avg(Std)           2402.9 (8.9)           1836.8 (7.0)           972.3 (2.57)           273.0 (4.5)           215.4 (8.6)           61984 (552.3)           1708.4 (4.3)           1704.6 (5.1)           11891.1 (34.55)           1643.8 (7.3)           40607.2 (282.0)           36100.3 (239.3)           1577.7 (9.5)           2565.3 (12.4)           4200.0 (33.1)           14601.6 (75.5)           2979.7 (16.5)           115716 (1030.4)           38432.7 (447.0)           5693.1 (24.3)           61670.1 (538.7)           3101.7 (35.1)           1453.5 (10.6)           5703.7 (33.2)           17612.7 (135.8)           2592.0 (0.0)           25292.4 (178.0)           31720.5 (257.7)           3893.2 (75.7)	k=64           Best           3152(1.03)           2798           1564(1.01)           438(1.01)           493           108505(1.01)           2569           2566(1.01)           16134(1.01)           2537           49521(1.01)           57054(1.01)           2636           3663           5955           17446           4223           173945(1.01)           60724           8495           95199           5460           2233           8132           27178           10560           35980           49381           59708	MMA 3021(1.03) - 1554(1.01) 454(1.01) 499 107862(1.01) 2552 2561(1.01) 15888(1.01) 2519 48040(1.01) 56792(1.01) 2596 3625 5818 - 4051 174982(1.01) 58241 8338 91863 4903 2260 7690 25997 10560 34433 45984 56260 20146	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2) 460.7 (5.0) 514.2 (7.7) 108144 (219.7) 2563.1 (8.3) 2574.3 (6.4) 15911.1 (28.7) 2533.2 (6.4) 48794 (1006.3) 57640.1 (448.8) 2603.8 (6.4) 3655.7 (15.7) 5862.8 (36.0) - 4095.7 (19.8) 176496 (1066.3) 58651.4 (230.4) 8358.4 (15.0) 93633.2 (826.3) 5021.7 (47.7) 2273.7 (7.9) 7752.7 (33.8) 26154.6 (108.6) 10662.3 (82.6) 34688.9 (100.9) 46364.3 (209.0) 56574.5 (163.4) 20331.3 (148.1)
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing-nodal fe-4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe-sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe-pwt bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe-pwt bcsstk32 fe-body t60k wing brack2 finan512 fe-tooth fe-rotor 598a fe-ocean Total	k=16           Best           2149           1162           581           159           121           55136           1108           1108           1108           1018           32654           22869           956           1750           2909           13516           2206           72007           24551           2855           38711           2057           866           4198           12323           1296           18382           21241           26427           8622           2	MMA 2064 1135 573 153 1095 1094 8359 1010 32532 24106 942 1734 2837 13054 2107 70910 23807 2838 36518 1834 881 3921 11689 1296 17428 20438 25783 7803 27	Avg(Std) 2073.6 (7.5) 1146 (6.3) 575.6 (2.4) 158 (2.6) 122.4 (5.9) 55250.5 (337.7) 1102.3 (4.3) 1111.4 (10.3) 8404.1 (29.4) 1013.1 (3.4) 33207.3 (249.7) 25167.5 (694.5) 950.2 (6.096) 1739.4 (3.1) 2894.5 (27.8) 13099.0 (31.1) 2136.8 (15.1) 71978.7 (411.9) 24152.2 (226.3) 2845.0 (6.1) 37225.7 (506.1) 1890.6 (36.0) 890.1 (6.3) 3960.9 (27.2) 11859.5 (92.6) 1356.8 (35.1) 17636.3 (96.3) 20711 (129.7) 26095.5 (147.1) 7944.7 (98.8)	k=32 Best 2493(1.03) 1802(1.03) 969(1.01) 258(1.01) 212(1.01) 78132 1718 12080 1657 42187 36104 1592 2567 4288 14634 3110 119164 38484 5758 63856 3371 1440 6009 18229 2592 26346 32783 41538 14277 2	MMA 2387(1.03) 1824(1.02) 969(1.01) 264(1.01) 212(1.01) 61047 1693 11828 1633 11828 1633 40098 35637 1563 2542 4142 14501 2938 113788 37927 5663 60898 3060 1431 5643 17398 2592 24985 31369 38682 112903 25	Avg(Std) 2402.9 (8.9) 1836.8 (7.0) 972.3 (2.57) 273.0 (4.5) 215.4 (8.6) 61984 (552.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1708.4 (4.3) 1704.6 (5.1) 11891.1 (34.55) 1643.8 (7.3) 40607.2 (282.0) 36100.3 (239.3) 1577.7 (9.5) 2565.3 (12.4) 4200.0 (33.1) 14601.6 (75.5) 2979.7 (16.5) 115716 (1030.4) 38432.7 (447.0) 5693.1 (24.3) 61670.1 (538.7) 3101.7 (35.1) 1453.5 (10.6) 5703.7 (33.2) 17612.7 (135.8) 2592.0 (0.0) 25292.4 (178.0) 31720.5 (257.7) 38939.2 (161.1) 13032 (75.7)	k=64           Best           3152(1.03)           2798           1564(1.01)           493           108505(1.01)           2569           2566(1.01)           16134(1.01)           2537           49521(1.01)           57054(1.01)           2636           3663           5955           17446           4223           173945(1.01)           60724           8495           95199           5460           2233           8132           27178           10560           35980           49381           59708           22301	MMA 3021(1.03) - 1554(1.01) 454(1.01) 499 107862(1.01) 2552 2561(1.01) 15888(1.01) 2519 48040(1.01) 56792(1.01) 2596 3625 5818 - - 4051 174982(1.01) 58241 8338 91863 4903 2260 7690 25997 10560 34433 45984 56260 20146 23	Avg(Std) 3021.1 (7.9) - 1557.2 (2.2) 460.7 (5.0) 514.2 (7.7) 108144 (219.7) 2563.1 (8.3) 2574.3 (6.4) 15911.1 (28.7) 2533.2 (6.4) 48794 (1006.3) 57640.1 (448.8) 2603.8 (6.4) 3655.7 (15.7) 5865.8 (36.0) - 4095.7 (19.8) 176496 (1066.3) 58651.4 (230.4) 8358.4 (15.0) 93633.2 (826.3) 5021.7 (47.7) 2273.7 (7.9) 7752.7 (33.8) 26154.6 (108.6) 10662.3 (82.6) 34688.9 (100.9) 46364.3 (209.0) 56574.5 (163.4) 20331.3 (148.1)

TABLE IVComparison with the best results from the Graph Partitioning Archive (column 'best') and the best results obtained by MMA(column 'MMA') over 20 independent runs for  $k \in \{2, 4, 8, 16, 32\}$ . Column 'Avg(Std)' provides the average and standard deviationOF partitions obtained with MMA. If the partition is imbalanced, we report the degree of imbalance between parentheses.



Fig. 3. FD correlation plots with respect to the normalized solution fitness and distance to the optimum for *3elt* and *vibrobox* when  $k \in \{4, 8, 16, 32\}$ . The first four plots are related to the *3elt* graph, while the last four are related to the *vibrobox*.

between fitness and distance, i.e. cases where  $\rho_{fdc} < 0.15$ . Indeed, from plots in Figure 3, it is clear that there is practically no correlation for 'vibrobox' when  $k \in \{4, 8\}$ . In addition, the correlation is weak for 'vibrobox' when k = 32. On the other hand, the strongest correlation is observed for graph '3elt' when  $k \in \{4, 16\}$  and 'vibrobox' when k = 16. The presence of significant FD correlation in many cases explains to some extent why the local optimization engine (tabu search) used in MMA is extremely powerful.

The strong correlation between solution quality (fitness) and its distance to the reference solution also indicates the presence of a big valley structure in the search landscape around the selected local optimum [8]. Intuitively, in this structure the global optimum (in our case, the best local optimum) is surrounded by many local optima whose fitness values deteriorate with the increase of distance from the optimum. To investigate the existence of the big valley structure, we provide in Figure 4 plots with respect to solution fitness and *average* distance between any two solutions of a given set of local optima. As it can be expected, the plots give further evidence for the big valley structure in cases of graph '3elt'



Fig. 4. FD correlation plots with respect to the normalized solution fitness and the average distance between any two solutions of a given set of local optima for *3elt* and *vibrobox* when  $k \in \{4, 8, 16, 32\}$ . The first four plots are related to *3elt*, while the last four are related to the *vibrobox*.

and 'vibrobox' when k = 16, i.e. high correlation between fitness and average distance between any two local optima. On the other hand, such correlation is not visible in case of 'vibrobox' when  $k \in \{4, 8, 32\}$ .

The big valley structure implies that high-quality local optima tend to be positioned centrally within the region of sampled local optima. Although we did not include fitnessdistance plots for all the analyzed graph partitioning instances, except for some very rare cases, these plots confirm our observation on the distribution of local optima in the search space.

For informative purpose, columns 'avg  $d_{lo}$ ' and 'avg  $d_{qo}$ '

from Table V report respectively the average distance between local optima and the average distance of local optima from the best local optimum, expressed as a percentage of |V|. Given that the maximum distance between any two solutions is |V|, these results also confirm that local optima are not uniformly distributed, but are rather concentrated within a limited number of regions in the search space.

# C. Backbone analysis and motivation for the BBC operator

To evaluate the degree of similarity between local optima (including global optima which are technically speaking also local optima), we provide an analysis of the backbone size.

#### TABLE V

Analytical results for seven graph partitioning instances when  $k \in \{4, 8, 16, 32\}$ . Columns ' $d_{lo}$ ' and ' $d_{go}$ ' report respectively the average distance between local optima and the average distance of local optima from the best local optimum, expressed as a percentage of |V|. Column ' $\rho_{fdc}$ ' shows the correlation coefficients with respect to fitness and distance, while columns ' $avgB_{lo}$ ' and ' $B_{hq}$ ' indicate respectively (in percentage of |V|) the average backbone size with respect to 10 randomly chosen local optima, and the backbone size with respect to best local optima found during the search.

	k=4					k=8				
Graph	avg d <sub>lo</sub>	avg $d_{go}$	$\rho_{fdc}$	avg B <sub>lo</sub>	$B_{hq}$	avg $d_{lo}$	avg $d_{go}$	$\rho_{fdc}$	avg B <sub>lo</sub>	$B_{hq}$
data	30.5	34.8	0.57	21.5	95.2	17.8	16.0	0.68	46.6	64.7
3elt	19.1	18.7	0.7	50.0	97.3	17.2	14.6	0.53	58.2	69.6
uk	18	14.3	0.61	60.2	68.4	26.3	25.7	0.24	34.2	51.4
crack	3.5	2.2	0.89	98.3	98.9	22.5	19.6	0.51	59.8	95.4
wing-nodal	26.1	21.6	0.81	36.5	91.5	17.1	13.6	0.91	53.4	96.0
fe-4elt2	9.8	6.7	0.74	61.9	88.0	26.0	24.4	0.68	28.3	62.4
vibrobox	40.1	41.4	-0.02	21.7	40.7	22.4	19.7	0.03	54.1	52.4
	k=16					k=32				
Graph	avg d <sub>lo</sub>	avg $d_{go}$	$\rho_{fdc}$	avg B <sub>lo</sub>	$B_{hq}$	avg d <sub>lo</sub>	avg $d_{go}$	$\rho_{fdc}$	avg B <sub>lo</sub>	$B_{hq}$
data	22.5	23.7	0.08	42.3	42.2	24.9	23.1	0.6	32.4	50.9
3elt	14.0	12.1	0.75	61.8	77.2	20.5	17.1	0.53	43.3	61.5
uk	26.9	25.1	0.33	32.9	30.0	27.4	24.9	0.44	34.6	61.5
crack	27.7	22.9	0.74	24.8	79.6	28.1	26.3	0.58	24.5	33.8
wing-nodal	31.0	27.3	0.56	25.2	33.2	37.5	35.6	0.4	13.5	15.5
fe-4elt2	16.4	14.7	0.51	55.3	73.5	28.7	25.5	0.51	20.1	34.3
vibrobox	41.5	45.5	0.65	12.3	7.5	49.7	46.8	0.21	4.6	3.2

While the column 'avg  $B_{lo}$ ' from Table V reports the average backbone size with respect to 10 randomly chosen local optima, column ' $B_{hq}$ ' presents the backbone size with respect to best local optima found during the search. The backbone size is expressed as the percentage of |V|. From these results, we observe that except for very few cases, the backbone is generally of significant size. We also note that the values reported in ' $B_{hq}$ ' are generally higher than the ones in 'avg  $B_{lo}$ ', which indicates that the structure of a set of high quality solutions is very similar to the structure of the supposed global optimum. This suggests that if a significant number of vertices is grouped together throughout each of the high quality partitions, there is a strong chance that they are also grouped together in the global optimum. This observation constitutes the first motivation for the BBC crossover which tries to preserve the backbones through the search process.

On the other hand, the FD analysis above shows the presence of a big valley structure and high fitness-distance correlation in many cases. This provides justifications about why the tabu search based local optimization is important within our memetic approach. This additionally gives an argument for preferring a constructive crossover operator like BBC over highly destructive ones like uniform crossover. To enforce this comment, we show in Section VII a computational comparison between the BBC crossover and a uniform crossover, and study the influence of the perturbation strength within BBC.

## VII. A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF THE BBC OPERATOR

## A. Comparison with a traditional crossover operator

We compare the performance of the BBC operator with an adapted uniform crossover on the set of 30 instances of the Graph Partitioning Archive for  $k \in \{4, 8, 16, 32\}$ . For the uniform crossover, each vertex in the offspring partition keeps with equal probability the subset of either parent partition, with the constraint that the subset weight in the offspring partition does not exceed  $W_{opt}$  (see Section II). In addition, we reinforce the randomness of the crossover by performing some vertex swaps after the uniform crossover.

In order to highlight the role of the crossover operators, we set the number of generations to 1000 and reduce the number of tabu search iterations to  $0.5*|V_m|$ , where  $|V_m|$  is the number of vertices in the  $m^{th}$  graph level. We execute 20 times the two versions of our multilevel memetic algorithm, i.e. with BBC and uniform operators, and report the results in Table VI. For each value of k, columns 'b. BBC' and 'b. UNI' report respectively the best partition obtained with our approach integrating the BBC and uniform crossover, while columns 'BBC Avg(Std)' and 'UNI Avg(Std)' report respectively the average and standard deviation of the generated partitions when BBC and uniform crossovers are employed. A lower average value is indicated in bold. In addition, we perform a statistical analysis using the Welch's t-test, and report in column 'p-value' the two tailed p-value over the two partition sets.

From Table VI we observe that there is no significant statistical difference between the solution sets for lower values of k, i.e.  $k \in \{4, 8\}$ . However, as k increases, we note that our BBC operator visibly outperforms the uniform crossover in almost each case for  $k \in \{16, 32\}$ . One explanation is that intuitively, given the semantics of the BBC crossover, larger k would favor the preservation of backbone information by BBC whereas the number of parts has a weak influence for the uniform crossover operator as to backbone preservation. Additionally, we compare in Table VII-A the average percentage of perturbed vertices over 20 generations with the two crossovers as well as with a variant of the BBC (see Section VII-B) for  $k \in \{4, 8, 16, 32\}$ . The perturbation strength is expressed as the minimum (set-theoretic partition) distance between a resulting individual and the parents participating in the crossover. As it can be expected, the perturbation introduced by the proposed crossover is always significantly weaker than the one introduced with the uniform crossover. Moreover, the degree of perturbation introduced with the uniform crossover increases with k. This may constitute another explanation why the BBC performs better than the uniform crossover for larger values of  $k \in \{16, 32\}$ , since according to the observations

	k=4					k=8				
Graph	b. BBC	BBC Avg(Std)	b. UNI	UNI Avg(Std)	p-value	b. BBC	BBC Avg(Std)	b. UNI	UNI Avg(Std)	p-value
add20	1159	1196.9 (23.5)	1154	1188.8 (14.5)	0.199	1696	1729.2 (23.2)	1698	1725.0 (24.5)	0.581
data	383	419.3 (21.1)	395	<b>410.2</b> (10.4)	0.095	681	725.9 (29.7)	712	747.9 (35.6)	0.041
3elt	201	222.6 (20.9)	204	<b>220.5</b> (13.5)	0.708	348	<b>369.6</b> (23.0)	348	385.2 (27.1)	0.057
uk	43	49.2 (6.5)	45	<b>48.8</b> (4.2)	0.819	88	<b>96.0</b> (6.8)	102	115.4 (9.6)	0.000
add32	41	<b>42.0</b> (6.9)	33	42.8 (8.6)	0.748	67	<b>76.4</b> (7.2)	74	96.0 (17.1)	0.000
bcsstk33	21779	<b>22234.5</b> (402.4)	21779	22536.5 (605.0)	0.072	34430	34689.8 (471.8)	34480	<b>34683.0</b> (282.2)	0.956
whitaker3	384	403.1 (24.1)	381	<b>393.5</b> (15.0)	0.141	659	<b>670.4</b> (10.0)	662	685.0 (24.1)	0.019
crack	366	394.1 (32.5)	366	<b>385.5</b> (26.9)	0.368	687	<b>714.7</b> (15.8)	687	727.5 (34.5)	0.143
wing_nodal	3582	3646.3 (45.0)	3579	<b>3643.4</b> (33.6)	0.819	5457	5590.6 (115.9)	5454	<b>5515.6</b> (41.0)	0.012
fe_4elt2	349	379.8 (31.4)	349	<b>365.1</b> (26.3)	0.117	608	644.0 (28.2)	614	<b>640.6</b> (16.8)	0.646
vibrobox	19228	<b>19795.8</b> (336.0)	19170	19832.8 (331.6)	0.728	24935	25038.7 (311.2)	24739	<b>25011.0</b> (150.3)	0.723
bcsstk29	8475	8613.0 (280.7)	8493	8981.2 (754.7)	0.052	15586	<b>16</b> 77 <b>8.</b> 7 (709.3)	16025	16945.0 (554.8)	0.415
4elt	326	<b>364.0</b> (24.2)	326	366.1 (22.7)	0.779	546	<b>608.0</b> (36.0)	570	690.7 (66.6)	0.000
re_sphere	770	770.3 (0.6)	770	770.8 (0.9)	0.047	1208	1225.5 (12.6)	1216	1242.4 (22.8)	0.007
Ct1	9/1	1052.0 (86.0)	954	1028.4 (87.4)	0.395	1808	1927.9 (62.1)	1799	1896.9 (53.8) 12517 ( (178.4)	0.100
mempius	9077	9/94.3 (98.0)	9628	9057 (25.8)	0.000	12470	12555.5 (55.9)	12104	1251/.0 (1/8.4) 1510 8 (15 9)	0.700
CS4	9/1	<b>995.5</b> (10.7) <b>10902 4</b> (45.47.2)	970	995.7 (25.8)	0.977	1502	1551.0 (20.7)	1485	<b>1510.8</b> (15.8)	0.001
bcsstk30	100/1	<b>19802.4</b> (4547.5)	10095	198/8.4 (4598.1)	0.959	33810	<b>38342.3</b> (3431.0) <b>15336 7</b> (1272.6)	35904	38490.0 (3333.7) 15447.5 (1224.8)	0.894
fo put	7042	0055.7 (994.1) 744.2 (54.6)	7390	<b>7955.0</b> (574.1) <b>726 4</b> (50 7)	0.015	13730	15350.7 (1272.0)	13073	15447.5 (1224.6) 1506 2 (21.8)	0.781
heasth22	0400	12218 8 (2161.0)	0212	<b>10007 5</b> (1422 0)	0.005	21402	<b>1</b> 340.3 (96.2) <b>22211 0</b> (788.2)	22402	24109.1 (1219.1)	0.094
fe body	660	8267 (007)	601	<b>821 5</b> (07 0)	0.000	1079	<b>1164 5</b> (60.0)	1122	11065(784)	0.007
te_bouy	210	20.7 (99.7) 248 3 (44.6)	223	2521.3(97.0)	0.808	1079	<b>518 3</b> (17 5)	500	536.9 (26.6)	0.138
wing	1665	<b>1730 3</b> (55 7)	1680	1763.2(55.1)	0.765	2575	<b>2666 8</b> (72 3)	2629	2716 1 (61 5)	0.015
brack?	3097	<b>3235 1</b> (208 7)	3084	3275.7(417.4)	0.000	7491	7800.7 (207.3)	7222	<b>7756 4</b> (291 4)	0.583
finan512	324	<b>490 1</b> (129 3)	324	4941(72)	0.700	729	<b>866 7</b> (109 0)	729	907.2 (125.5)	0.283
fe tooth	6933	7273 5 (328 5)	6975	7304 3 (362 4)	0.780	11875	12188 5 (215 2)	11591	<b>11952 5</b> (221.6)	0.002
fe_rotor	7296	<b>7888 1</b> (419 2)	7495	7932 4 (429 9)	0.744	13184	<b>13784 2</b> (458 1)	13396	14039 2 (440.0)	0.081
598a	8071	8352 4 (313 2)	8058	<b>8321 7</b> (396 2)	0.787	16032	16899 1 (632 6)	16124	<b>16888 0</b> (670.6)	0.957
fe ocean	1890	<b>2007.9</b> (270.2)	1890	2220.0 (425.5)	0.069	4224	4502.3 (257.2)	4211	<b>4389.7</b> (149 7)	0.100
re_occum	1000		1020	2220.0 (120.0)	0.002			1411		0.100
	k=16	. ,		. ,		k=32			. ,	
Graph	k=16 b. BBC	BBC Avg(Std)	b. UNI	UNI Avg(Std)	p-value	k=32 b. BBC	BBC Avg(Std)	b. UNI	UNI Avg(Std)	p-value
Graph add20	k=16 b. BBC 2073	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7)	b. UNI 2145(1.01)	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6)	p-value 0.000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03)	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8)	b. UNI 2541(1.03)	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9)	p-value 0.000
Graph add20 data	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5)	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4)	p-value 0.000 0.000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07)	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01)	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9) 2074.5 (37.2)	p-value 0.000 0.000
Graph add20 data 3elt	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0)	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348 661	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07) 971	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000
Graph add20 data 3elt uk	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600 155	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0) 180.2 (16.5)	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348 661 211	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2) 227.3 (9.5)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07) 971 330	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7) 344.1 (8.3)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076 342(1.01)	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2) 353.7 (8.1)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.001
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600 155 123	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0) 180.2 (16.5) 134.4 (8.8)	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348 661 211 172(1.01)	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2) 227.3 (9.5) 196.9 (17.5)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07) 971 330 215	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7) 344.1 (8.3) 238.7 (26.0)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076 342(1.01) 275(1.01)	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2) 353.7 (8.1) 332.5 (24.3)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.001 0.000
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600 155 123 55318	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0) 180.2 (16.5) 134.4 (8.8) 55854.9 (486.9)	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348 661 211 172(1.01) 55411	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2) 227.3 (9.5) 196.9 (17.5) 56477 (650.5)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.002	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07) 971 330 215 77990	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7) 344.1 (8.3) 238.7 (26.0) 79380.1 (1013.7)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076 342(1.01) 275(1.01) 80642	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2) 353.7 (8.1) 332.5 (24.3) 82517.8 (1862.8)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.001 0.000 0.000
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600 155 123 55318 1114	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0) 180.2 (16.5) 134.4 (8.8) 55854.9 (486.9) 1128.4 (11.5)	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348 661 211 172(1.01) 55411 1204	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2) 227.3 (9.5) 196.9 (17.5) 56477 (650.5) 1292.9 (40.5)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.002 0.000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07) 971 330 215 77990 1862	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7) 344.1 (8.3) 238.7 (26.0) 79380.1 (1013.7) 1802.9 (60.6)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076 342(1.01) 275(1.01) 80642 1840	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2) 353.7 (8.1) 332.5 (24.3) 82517.8 (1862.8) 1905.4 (29.2)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.001 0.000 0.000 0.000
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600 155 123 55318 1114 1109	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0) 180.2 (16.5) 134.4 (8.8) 55854.9 (486.9) 1128.4 (11.5) 1151.9 (21.8)	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348 661 211 172(1.01) 55411 1204 1301	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2) 227.3 (9.5) 196.9 (17.5) 56477 (650.5) 1292.9 (40.5) 1384.3 (39.3)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07) 971 330 215 77990 1862 1907	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7) 344.1 (8.3) 238.7 (26.0) 79380.1 (1013.7) 1802.9 (60.6) 1895.0 (78.1)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076 342(1.01) 275(1.01) 80642 1840 1890	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2) 353.7 (8.1) 332.5 (24.3) 82517.8 (1862.8) 1905.4 (29.2) 1975.8 (46.4)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.001 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600 155 123 55318 1114 1109 8478	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0) 180.2 (16.5) 134.4 (8.8) 55854.9 (486.9) 1128.4 (11.5) 1151.9 (21.8) 8550.5 (61.8)	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348 661 211 172(1.01) 55411 1204 1301 8832	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2) 227.3 (9.5) 196.9 (17.5) 56477 (650.5) 1292.9 (40.5) 1384.3 (39.3) 8962.5 (279.3)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.002 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07) 971 330 215 77990 1862 1907 12291	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7) 344.1 (8.3) 238.7 (26.0) 79380.1 (1013.7) 1802.9 (60.6) 1895.0 (78.1) 12383.8 (78.6)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076 342(1.01) 275(1.01) 80642 1840 1890 12400	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2) 353.7 (8.1) 332.5 (24.3) 82517.8 (1862.8) 1905.4 (29.2) 1975.8 (46.4) 12561.8 (143.5)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600 155 123 55318 1114 1109 8478 1025 2016	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0) 180.2 (16.5) 134.4 (8.8) 55854.9 (486.9) 1128.4 (11.5) 1151.9 (21.8) 8550.5 (61.8) 1054.9 (18.6)	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348 661 211 172(1.01) 55411 1204 1301 8832 1114	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2) 227.3 (9.5) 196.9 (17.5) 56477 (650.5) 1292.9 (40.5) 1384.3 (39.3) 8962.5 (279.3) 1297.4 (83.4) 2707.4 (83.4)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07) 971 330 215 77990 1862 1907 12291 1673	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7) 344.1 (8.3) 238.7 (26.0) 79380.1 (1013.7) 1802.9 (60.6) 1895.0 (78.1) 12383.8 (78.6) 1765.0 (83.5)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076 342(1.01) 275(1.01) 80642 1840 1890 12400 1833	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84-9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2) 353.7 (8.1) 332.5 (24.3) 82517.8 (1862.8) 1905.4 (29.2) 1975.8 (46.4) 12561.8 (143.5) 1902.1 (44.0)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600 155 123 55318 1114 1109 8478 1025 33613 0557	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0) 180.2 (16.5) 134.4 (8.8) 55854.9 (486.9) 1128.4 (11.5) 1151.9 (21.8) 8550.5 (61.8) 1054.9 (18.6) 35292.2 (784.2) 26940.9 (795.2)	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348 661 211 172(1.01) 55411 1204 1301 8832 1114 35975	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2) 227.3 (9.5) 196.9 (17.5) 56477 (650.5) 1292.9 (40.5) 1384.3 (39.3) 8962.5 (279.3) 1297.4 (83.4) 37234.7 (563.2) 25797 (563.2)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07) 971 330 215 77990 1862 1907 12291 1673 43861 24514	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7) 344.1 (8.3) 238.7 (26.0) 79380.1 (1013.7) 1802.9 (60.6) 1895.0 (78.1) 12383.8 (78.6) 1765.0 (83.5) 45060.1 (1090.2) 272(62.6)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076 342(1.01) 275(1.01) 80642 1840 1890 12400 1833 44462 20010	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2) 353.7 (8.1) 332.5 (24.3) 82517.8 (1862.8) 1905.4 (29.2) 1975.8 (46.4) 12561.8 (143.5) 1902.1 (44.0) 45463.8 (1493.1) 4205 (210.5)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000000
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600 155 123 55318 1114 1109 8478 1025 33613 25567	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0) 180.2 (16.5) 134.4 (8.8) 55854.9 (486.9) 1128.4 (11.5) 1151.9 (21.8) 8550.5 (61.8) 1054.9 (18.6) 35292.2 (784.2) 25849.3 (705.3) 029.9 (5.2)	b. UNI 2145(.01) 1348 661 211 172(1.01) 55411 1204 1301 8832 1114 35975 24456	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2) 227.3 (9.5) 196.9 (17.5) 56477 (650.5) 1292.9 (40.5) 1384.3 (39.3) 8962.5 (279.3) 1297.4 (83.4) 37234.7 (563.2) <b>25586.9</b> (673.4)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07) 971 330 215 77990 1862 1907 12291 1673 43861 36514 36514	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7) 344.1 (8.3) 238.7 (26.0) 79380.1 (1013.7) 1802.9 (60.6) 1895.0 (78.1) 12383.8 (78.6) 1765.0 (83.5) 45060.1 (1090.2) 37362.3 (876.1) 1792.0 (60.2)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076 342(1.01) 275(1.01) 80642 1840 1890 12400 1833 44462 39819	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2) 353.7 (8.1) 332.5 (24.3) 82517.8 (1862.8) 1905.4 (29.2) 1975.8 (46.4) 12561.8 (143.5) 1902.1 (44.0) 45463.8 (1493.1) 41205.5 (748.5)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.336 0.000
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600 155 123 55318 1114 1109 8478 1025 33613 25567 959	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0) 180.2 (16.5) 134.4 (8.8) 55854.9 (486.9) 1128.4 (11.5) 1151.9 (21.8) 8550.5 (61.8) 1054.9 (18.6) 35292.2 (784.2) 25849.3 (705.3) 992.8 (53.3) 1999.8 (45.2)	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348 661 211 172(1.01) 55411 1204 1301 8832 1114 35975 24456 1154 1060	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2) 227.3 (9.5) 196.9 (17.5) 56477 (650.5) 1292.9 (40.5) 1384.3 (39.3) 8962.5 (279.3) 1297.4 (83.4) 37234.7 (563.2) <b>25586.9</b> (673.4) 1223.8 (43.1) 265.5	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.236 0.000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07) 971 330 215 77990 1862 1907 12291 1673 43861 36514 1706 2626	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7) 344.1 (8.3) 238.7 (26.0) 79380.1 (1013.7) 1802.9 (60.6) 1895.0 (78.1) 12383.8 (78.6) 1765.0 (83.5) 45060.1 (1090.2) 37362.3 (876.1) 1783.3 (68.3) 2935.9 (66.6)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076 342(1.01) 275(1.01) 80642 1840 1840 1840 1840 1833 44462 39819 1789 2826	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2) 353.7 (8.1) 332.5 (24.3) 82517.8 (1862.8) 1905.4 (29.2) 1975.8 (46.4) 12561.8 (143.5) 1902.1 (44.0) 45463.8 (1493.1) 41205.5 (748.5) 1863.7 (37.6) 2996 2 (29.9)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.336 0.000 0.000 0.336 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000000
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600 155 123 55318 1114 1109 8478 1025 33613 25567 959 1734 2036	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0) 180.2 (16.5) 134.4 (8.8) 55854.9 (486.9) 1128.4 (11.5) 1151.9 (21.8) 8550.5 (61.8) 1054.9 (18.6) 35292.2 (784.2) 25849.3 (705.3) 992.8 (53.3) 1808.8 (45.2) 2020.9 (54.1)	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348 661 211 172(1.01) 55411 1204 1301 8832 1114 35975 24456 1154 1969 2062	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2) 227.3 (9.5) 196.9 (17.5) 56477 (650.5) 1292.9 (40.5) 1384.3 (39.3) 8962.5 (279.3) 1297.4 (83.4) 37234.7 (563.2) <b>25586.9</b> (673.4) 1223.8 (43.1) 2072.3 (59.5) 295.5 (24.1)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07) 971 330 215 77990 1862 1907 12291 1673 43861 36514 1706 2636 4227	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7) 344.1 (8.3) 238.7 (26.0) 79380.1 (1013.7) 1802.9 (60.6) 1895.0 (78.1) 12383.8 (78.6) 1765.0 (83.5) 45060.1 (1090.2) 37362.3 (876.1) 1783.3 (68.3) 2825.8 (66.6) 4265.4 (78.2)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076 342(1.01) 275(1.01) 80642 1840 1890 12400 1833 44462 39819 1789 2826 4870	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2) 353.7 (8.1) 332.5 (24.3) 82517.8 (1862.8) 1905.4 (29.2) 1975.8 (46.4) 12561.8 (143.5) 1902.1 (44.0) 45463.8 (1493.1) 45463.8 (1493.1) 41205.5 (748.5) 1863.7 (37.6) 2886.2 (29.9) 5025 (289.7)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000000
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600 155 123 55318 1114 1109 8478 1025 33613 25567 959 1734 2936	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0) 180.2 (16.5) 134.4 (8.8) 55854.9 (486.9) 1128.4 (11.5) 1151.9 (21.8) 8550.5 (61.8) 1054.9 (18.6) 35292.2 (784.2) 25849.3 (705.3) 992.8 (53.3) 1808.8 (45.2) 3020.0 (54.1) 440(14) (2014)	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348 661 211 172(1.01) 55411 1204 1301 8832 1114 35975 24456 1154 1969 2962 12000	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2) 227.3 (9.5) 196.9 (17.5) 56477 (650.5) 1292.9 (40.5) 1384.3 (39.3) 8962.5 (279.3) 1297.4 (83.4) 37234.7 (563.2) <b>25586.9</b> (673.4) 1223.8 (43.1) 2072.3 (59.5) 3085.9 (84.1)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.236 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.000000 0.00000000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07) 971 330 215 77990 1862 1907 12291 1673 43861 36514 1706 2636 4237	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7) 344.1 (8.3) 238.7 (26.0) 79380.1 (1013.7) 1802.9 (60.6) 1895.0 (78.1) 12383.8 (78.6) 1765.0 (83.5) 45060.1 (1090.2) 37362.3 (876.1) 1783.3 (68.3) 2825.8 (66.6) 4365.4 (78.3) 140027 (255.9)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076 342(1.01) 275(1.01) 80642 1840 1890 12400 1833 44462 39819 1789 2826 4870	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2) 353.7 (8.1) 332.5 (24.3) 82517.8 (1862.8) 1905.4 (29.2) 1975.8 (46.4) 12561.8 (143.5) 1902.1 (44.0) 45463.8 (1493.1) 41205.5 (748.5) 1863.7 (37.6) 2886.2 (29.9) 5025.0 (88.7)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.000000 0.00000000
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600 155 123 55318 1114 1109 8478 1025 33613 25567 959 1734 2936 13733 217°	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0) 180.2 (16.5) 134.4 (8.8) 55854.9 (486.9) 1128.4 (11.5) 1151.9 (21.8) 8550.5 (61.8) 1054.9 (18.6) 35292.2 (784.2) 25849.3 (705.3) 992.8 (53.3) 1808.8 (45.2) 3020.0 (54.1) 14061.1 (204.4) 2230.0 (18.0)	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348 661 211 172(1.01) 55411 1204 1301 8832 1114 35975 24456 1154 1969 2962 13999 2108	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2) 227.3 (9.5) 196.9 (17.5) 56477 (650.5) 1292.9 (40.5) 1384.3 (39.3) 8962.5 (279.3) 1297.4 (83.4) 37234.7 (563.2) <b>25586.9</b> (673.4) 1223.8 (43.1) 2072.3 (59.5) 3085.9 (84.1) 14183.5 (103.4) 2361.5 (110.7)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07) 971 330 215 77990 1862 1907 12291 1673 43861 36514 1706 2636 4237 14659(1.01) 2110	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7) 344.1 (8.3) 238.7 (26.0) 79380.1 (1013.7) 1802.9 (60.6) 1895.0 (78.1) 12383.8 (78.6) 1765.0 (83.5) 45060.1 (1090.2) 37362.3 (876.1) 1783.3 (68.3) 2825.8 (66.6) 4365.4 (78.3) 14907.7 (255.8) 3273.8 (100.1)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076 342(1.01) 275(1.01) 80642 1840 1890 12400 1833 44462 39819 1789 2826 4870 - - 2247	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2) 353.7 (8.1) 332.5 (24.3) 82517.8 (1862.8) 1905.4 (29.2) 1975.8 (46.4) 12561.8 (143.5) 1902.1 (44.0) 45463.8 (1493.1) 41205.5 (748.5) 1863.7 (37.6) 2886.2 (29.9) 5025.0 (88.7) -	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.336 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.000000 0.00000000
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsetk20	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600 155 123 55318 1114 1109 8478 1025 33613 25567 959 1734 2936 13733 2178 2558	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0) 180.2 (16.5) 134.4 (8.8) 55854.9 (486.9) 1128.4 (11.5) 1151.9 (21.8) 8550.5 (61.8) 1054.9 (18.6) 35292.2 (784.2) 25849.3 (705.3) 992.8 (53.3) 1808.8 (45.2) 3020.0 (54.1) 14061.1 (204.4) 220.9 (18.0) 76054 5 (2185.0)	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348 661 211 172(1.01) 55411 1204 1301 8832 1114 35975 24456 1154 1969 2962 13999 2198 \$2522	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2) 227.3 (9.5) 196.9 (17.5) 56477 (650.5) 1292.9 (40.5) 1384.3 (39.3) 8962.5 (279.3) 1297.4 (83.4) 37234.7 (563.2) <b>25586.9</b> (673.4) 1223.8 (43.1) 2072.3 (59.5) 3085.9 (84.1) 14183.5 (103.4) 2361.5 (110.7) 97068 0 (4704.2)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.236 0.000 0.236 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.236 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.000000 0.00000000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07) 971 330 215 77990 1862 1907 1862 1907 12291 1673 43861 36514 1706 2636 4237 14659(1.01) 3110	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7) 344.1 (8.3) 238.7 (26.0) 79380.1 (1013.7) 1802.9 (60.6) 1895.0 (78.1) 12383.8 (78.6) 1765.0 (83.5) 45060.1 (1090.2) 37362.3 (876.1) 1783.3 (68.3) 2825.8 (66.6) 4365.4 (78.3) 14907.7 (255.8) 3273.8 (120.1) 128005 8 (2207.1)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076 342(1.01) 275(1.01) 80642 1840 1840 1840 1840 1840 1833 44462 39819 1789 2826 4870 - 3447 121402	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2) 353.7 (8.1) 332.5 (24.3) 82517.8 (1862.8) 1905.4 (29.2) 1975.8 (46.4) 12561.8 (143.5) 1902.1 (44.0) 45463.8 (1493.1) 41205.5 (748.5) 1863.7 (37.6) 2886.2 (29.9) 5025.0 (88.7) - 3424.8 (48.0) 124148 5 (2420.9)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.336 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.000000 0.00000000
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk21	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600 155 123 55318 1114 1109 8478 1025 33613 25567 959 1734 2936 13733 2178 76258 24464	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0) 180.2 (16.5) 134.4 (8.8) 55854.9 (486.9) 1128.4 (11.5) 1151.9 (21.8) 8550.5 (61.8) 1054.9 (18.6) 35292.2 (784.2) 25849.3 (705.3) 992.8 (53.3) 1808.8 (45.2) 3020.0 (54.1) 14061.1 (204.4) 2220.9 (18.0) 76954.5 (2185.0) 26796 (200.1)	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348 661 211 172(1.01) 55411 1204 1301 8832 1114 35975 24456 1154 1969 2962 13999 2198 82533 24726	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2) 227.3 (9.5) 196.9 (17.5) 56477 (650.5) 1292.9 (40.5) 1384.3 (39.3) 8962.5 (279.3) 1297.4 (83.4) 37234.7 (563.2) <b>25586.9</b> (673.4) 1223.8 (43.1) 2072.3 (59.5) 3085.9 (84.1) 14183.5 (103.4) 2361.5 (110.7) 87968.0 (4704.3) 207006 (2617.2)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.236 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.024 0.002 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0024 0.000 0.0024 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0024 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.000000 0.00000000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07) 971 330 215 77990 1862 1907 12291 1673 43861 36514 1706 2636 4237 14659(1.01) 3110 124969 4150	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7) 344.1 (8.3) 238.7 (26.0) 79380.1 (1013.7) 1802.9 (60.6) 1895.0 (78.1) 12383.8 (78.6) 1765.0 (83.5) 45060.1 (1090.2) 37362.3 (876.1) 1783.3 (68.3) 2825.8 (66.6) 4365.4 (78.3) 14907.7 (255.8) 3273.8 (120.1) 128905.8 (2207.1) 45066 (41272.0)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076 342(1.01) 275(1.01) 80642 1840 1890 12400 1833 44462 39819 1789 2826 4870 - 3347 131402 42788	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2) 353.7 (8.1) 332.5 (24.3) 82517.8 (1862.8) 1905.4 (29.2) 1975.8 (46.4) 12561.8 (143.5) 1902.1 (44.0) 45463.8 (1493.1) 41205.5 (748.5) 1863.7 (37.6) 2886.2 (29.9) 5025.0 (88.7) - 3424.8 (48.0) 134148.5 (2429.8) 17250.5 (1502.2)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.0000000 0.00000000
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe_out	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600 155 123 55318 1114 1109 8478 1025 33613 25567 959 1734 2936 13733 2178 76258 24484 2947	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0) 180.2 (16.5) 134.4 (8.8) 55854.9 (486.9) 1128.4 (11.5) 1151.9 (21.8) 8550.5 (61.8) 1054.9 (18.6) 35292.2 (784.2) 25849.3 (705.3) 992.8 (53.3) 1808.8 (45.2) 3020.0 (54.1) 14061.1 (204.4) 2220.9 (18.0) 76954.5 (2185.0) 25796.5 (849.1) 2901.8 (41.1)	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348 661 211 172(1.01) 55411 1204 1301 8832 1114 35975 24456 1154 1969 2962 13999 2198 82533 26360 2860	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2) 227.3 (9.5) 196.9 (17.5) 56477 (650.5) 1292.9 (40.5) 1384.3 (39.3) 8962.5 (279.3) 1297.4 (83.4) 37234.7 (563.2) <b>25586.9</b> (673.4) 1223.8 (43.1) 2072.3 (59.5) 3085.9 (84.1) 14183.5 (103.4) 2361.5 (110.7) 87968.0 (4704.3) 30709.5 (2517.2) 20521 (04.5)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.236 0.000 0.000 0.024 0.024 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0024 0.000 0.000 0.000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07) 971 330 215 77990 1862 1907 12291 1673 43861 36514 1706 2636 4237 14659(1.01) 3110 124969 41529 \$\$77	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7) 344.1 (8.3) 238.7 (26.0) 79380.1 (1013.7) 1802.9 (60.6) 1895.0 (78.1) 12383.8 (78.6) 1765.0 (83.5) 45060.1 (1090.2) 37362.3 (876.1) 1783.3 (68.3) 2825.8 (66.6) 4365.4 (78.3) 14907.7 (255.8) 3273.8 (120.1) 128905.8 (2207.1) 43540.6 (1173.0) 626.9 7 (128.0)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076 342(1.01) 275(1.01) 80642 1840 1890 12400 1833 44462 39819 1789 2826 4870 - 3347 131402 43758 6204	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2) 353.7 (8.1) 332.5 (24.3) 82517.8 (1862.8) 1905.4 (29.2) 1975.8 (46.4) 12561.8 (143.5) 1902.1 (44.0) 45463.8 (1493.1) 41205.5 (748.5) 1863.7 (37.6) 2886.2 (29.9) 5025.0 (88.7) - 3424.8 (48.0) 134148.5 (2429.8) 47259.5 (1593.3) 6256.2 (42.0)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.000000 0.00000000
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe_pwt bcsstk32	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600 155 123 55318 1114 1109 8478 1025 33613 25567 959 1734 2936 13733 2178 76258 24484 2847 38535	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0) 180.2 (16.5) 134.4 (8.8) 55854.9 (486.9) 1128.4 (11.5) 1151.9 (21.8) 8550.5 (61.8) 1054.9 (18.6) 35292.2 (784.2) 25849.3 (705.3) 992.8 (53.3) 1808.8 (45.2) 3020.0 (54.1) 14061.1 (204.4) 2220.9 (18.0) 76954.5 (2185.0) 25796.5 (849.1) 2891.8 (41.1) 42422 7 (2105.7)	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348 661 211 172(1.01) 55411 1204 1301 8832 1114 35975 24456 1154 1969 2962 13999 2198 82533 26360 2869 46771	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2) 227.3 (9.5) 196.9 (17.5) 56477 (650.5) 1292.9 (40.5) 1384.3 (39.3) 8962.5 (279.3) 1297.4 (83.4) 37234.7 (563.2) <b>25586.9</b> (673.4) 1223.8 (43.1) 2072.3 (59.5) 3085.9 (84.1) 14183.5 (103.4) 2361.5 (110.7) 87968.0 (4704.3) 30709.5 (2517.2) 3052.1 (94.5) 51044 (6 (3010.2))	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.024 0.024 0.024 0.024 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0024 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.0000000 0.00000000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07) 971 330 215 77990 1862 1907 12291 1673 43861 36514 1706 2636 4237 14659(1.01) 3110 124969 41529 5872 66966	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7) 344.1 (8.3) 238.7 (26.0) 79380.1 (1013.7) 1802.9 (60.6) 1895.0 (78.1) 12383.8 (78.6) 1765.0 (83.5) 45060.1 (1090.2) 37362.3 (876.1) 1783.3 (68.3) 2825.8 (66.6) 4365.4 (78.3) 14907.7 (25.8) 3273.8 (120.1) 128905.8 (2207.1) 43540.6 (1173.0) 6268.7 (138.0) 71105 2 (2711.7)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076 342(1.01) 275(1.01) 80642 1840 1890 12400 1833 44462 39819 1789 2826 4870 - - 3347 131402 43758 6304 70866	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2) 353.7 (8.1) 332.5 (24.3) 82517.8 (1862.8) 1905.4 (29.2) 1975.8 (46.4) 12561.8 (143.5) 1902.1 (44.0) 45463.8 (1493.1) 41205.5 (748.5) 1863.7 (37.6) 2886.2 (29.9) 5025.0 (88.7) 	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.0000000 0.00000000
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk31 fe_pwt bcsstk32 fa body	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600 155 123 55318 1114 1109 8478 1025 33613 25567 959 1734 2936 13733 2178 76258 24484 2847 38535 1890	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0) 180.2 (16.5) 134.4 (8.8) 55854.9 (486.9) 1128.4 (11.5) 1151.9 (21.8) 8550.5 (61.8) 1054.9 (18.6) 35292.2 (784.2) 25849.3 (705.3) 992.8 (53.3) 1808.8 (45.2) 3020.0 (54.1) 14061.1 (204.4) 2220.9 (18.0) 76954.5 (2185.0) 25796.5 (849.1) 2891.8 (41.1) 42422.7 (131.7) 2103.2 (131.7)	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348 661 211 172(1.01) 55411 1204 1301 8832 1114 35975 24456 1154 1969 2962 13999 2198 82533 26360 2869 46771 1986	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2) 227.3 (9.5) 196.9 (17.5) 56477 (650.5) 1292.9 (40.5) 1384.3 (39.3) 8962.5 (279.3) 1297.4 (83.4) 37234.7 (563.2) <b>25586.9</b> (673.4) 1223.8 (43.1) 2072.3 (59.5) 3085.9 (84.1) 14183.5 (103.4) 2361.5 (110.7) 87968.0 (4704.3) 30709.5 (2517.2) 3052.1 (94.5) 51044.6 (3010.2) 2222.8 (135.1)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07) 971 330 215 77990 1862 1907 12291 1673 43861 36514 1706 2636 4237 14659(1.01) 3110 124969 41529 5872 669666 3444	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7) 344.1 (8.3) 238.7 (26.0) 79380.1 (1013.7) 1802.9 (60.6) 1895.0 (78.1) 12383.8 (78.6) 1765.0 (83.5) 45060.1 (1090.2) 37362.3 (876.1) 1783.3 (68.3) 2825.8 (66.6) 4365.4 (78.3) 14907.7 (255.8) 3273.8 (120.1) 128905.8 (2207.1) 43540.6 (1173.0) 6268.7 (138.0) 71105.2 (2711.7) 3532 1 (64.1)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076 342(1.01) 275(1.01) 80642 1840 1890 12400 1833 44462 39819 1789 2826 4870 - - 3347 131402 43758 6304 70806 3809	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84-9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2) 353.7 (8.1) 332.5 (24.3) 82517.8 (1862.8) 1905.4 (29.2) 1975.8 (46.4) 12561.8 (143.5) 1902.1 (44.0) 45463.8 (1493.1) 41205.5 (748.5) 1863.7 (37.6) 2886.2 (29.9) 5025.0 (88.7) - - 3424.8 (48.0) 134148.5 (2429.8) 47259.5 (1593.3) 6356.3 (42.0) 74726.5 (2168.4) 2697.8 (81.4)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.000000 0.00000000
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk31 fe_pwt bcsstk31 fe_bwt bcsstk32 fe_body t60k	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600 155 123 55318 1114 1109 8478 1025 33613 25567 959 1734 2936 13733 2178 76258 24484 2847 38535 1890 900	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0) 180.2 (16.5) 134.4 (8.8) 55854.9 (486.9) 1128.4 (11.5) 1151.9 (21.8) 8550.5 (61.8) 1054.9 (18.6) 35292.2 (784.2) 25849.3 (705.3) 992.8 (53.3) 1808.8 (45.2) 3020.0 (54.1) 14061.1 (204.4) 2220.9 (18.0) 76954.5 (2185.0) 25796.5 (849.1) 2891.8 (41.1) 42422.7 (3105.7) 2103.2 (13.1.7) 908.5 (1.1.8)	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348 661 211 172(1.01) 55411 1204 1301 8832 1114 35975 24456 1154 1969 2962 13999 2198 82533 26360 2869 46771 1986	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2) 227.3 (9.5) 196.9 (17.5) 56477 (650.5) 1292.9 (40.5) 1384.3 (39.3) 8962.5 (279.3) 1297.4 (83.4) 37234.7 (563.2) <b>25586.9</b> (673.4) 1223.8 (43.1) 2072.3 (595) 3085.9 (84.1) 14183.5 (103.4) 2361.5 (110.7) 87968.0 (4704.3) 30709.5 (2517.2) 3052.1 (94.5) 51044.6 (3010.2) 2222.8 (135.1) 1122.4 (49.5)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.024 0.024 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.000000 0.000000 0.00000000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07) 971 330 215 77990 1862 1907 12291 1673 43861 36514 1706 2636 4237 14659(1.01) 3110 124969 41529 5872 66966 3444 1673	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7) 344.1 (8.3) 238.7 (26.0) 79380.1 (1013.7) 1802.9 (60.6) 1895.0 (78.1) 12383.8 (78.6) 1765.0 (83.5) 45060.1 (1090.2) 37362.3 (876.1) 1783.3 (68.3) 2825.8 (66.6) 4365.4 (78.3) 14907.7 (255.8) 3273.8 (120.1) 128905.8 (2207.1) 43540.6 (1173.0) 6268.7 (138.0) 71105.2 (2711.7) 3532.1 (64.1) 1702.2 (27.5)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076 342(1.01) 275(1.01) 80642 1840 1840 1840 1833 44462 39819 1789 2826 4870 - 3347 131402 43758 6304 70806 3809 1661	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2) 353.7 (8.1) 332.5 (24.3) 82517.8 (1862.8) 1905.4 (29.2) 1975.8 (46.4) 12561.8 (143.5) 1902.1 (44.0) 45463.8 (1493.1) 41205.5 (748.5) 1863.7 (37.6) 2886.2 (29.9) 5025.0 (88.7) - 3424.8 (48.0) 134148.5 (2429.8) 47259.5 (1593.3) 6356.3 (42.0) 74726.5 (2168.4) 3697.8 (81.4) 1732.1 (29.3)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000000
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe_pwt bcsstk31 fe_body t60k wing	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600 155 123 55318 1114 1109 8478 1025 33613 25567 959 1734 2936 13733 2178 76258 24484 2847 38535 1890 900 4097	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0) 180.2 (16.5) 134.4 (8.8) 55854.9 (486.9) 1128.4 (11.5) 1151.9 (21.8) 8550.5 (61.8) 1054.9 (18.6) 35292.2 (784.2) 25849.3 (705.3) 992.8 (53.3) 1808.8 (45.2) 3020.0 (54.1) 14061.1 (204.4) 2220.9 (18.0) 76954.5 (2185.0) 25796.5 (2185.0) 26796.5 (2	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348 661 211 172(1.01) 55411 1204 1301 8832 1114 35975 24456 1154 1969 2962 13999 2198 82533 26360 2869 46771 1986 1049 4098	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2) 227.3 (9.5) 196.9 (17.5) 56477 (650.5) 1292.9 (40.5) 1384.3 (39.3) 8962.5 (279.3) 1297.4 (83.4) 37234.7 (563.2) <b>25586.9</b> (673.4) 1223.8 (43.1) 2072.3 (59.5) 3085.9 (84.1) 14183.5 (103.4) 2361.5 (110.7) 87968.0 (4704.3) 30709.5 (2517.2) 3052.1 (94.5) 51044.6 (3010.2) 2222.8 (135.1) 1122.4 (45.5) 8	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.002 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.024 0.024 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.000000 0.00000000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07) 971 330 215 77990 1862 1907 12291 1673 43861 36514 1706 2636 4237 14659(1.01) 3110 124969 41529 5872 66966 3444 1673 6054	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7) 344.1 (8.3) 238.7 (26.0) 79380.1 (1013.7) 1802.9 (60.6) 1895.0 (78.1) 12383.8 (78.6) 1765.0 (83.5) 45060.1 (1090.2) 37362.3 (876.1) 1783.3 (68.3) 2825.8 (66.6) 4365.4 (78.3) 14907.7 (255.8) 3273.8 (120.1) 128905.8 (2207.1) 43540.6 (1173.0) 6268.7 (138.0) 71105.2 (2711.7) 3532.1 (64.1) 1702.2 (37.5) 6560.8 (242.0)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076 342(1.01) 275(1.01) 80642 1840 1890 12400 1833 44462 39819 1789 2826 4870 - 3347 131402 43758 6304 70806 3809 1661 6572	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2) 353.7 (8.1) 332.5 (24.3) 82517.8 (1862.8) 1905.4 (29.2) 1975.8 (46.4) 12561.8 (143.5) 1902.1 (44.0) 45463.8 (1493.1) 41205.5 (748.5) 1863.7 (37.6) 2886.2 (29.9) 5025.0 (88.7) - 3424.8 (48.0) 134148.5 (2429.8) 47259.5 (1593.3) 6356.3 (42.0) 74726.5 (2168.4) 3697.8 (81.4) 1732.1 (39.3) 6718.7 (108.9)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.000000 0.00000000
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe_pwt bcsstk32 fe_body t60k wing prack2	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600 155 123 55318 1114 1109 8478 1025 33613 25567 959 1734 2936 13733 2178 76258 24484 2847 38535 1890 900 4097 12019	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0) 180.2 (16.5) 134.4 (8.8) 55854.9 (486.9) 1128.4 (11.5) 1151.9 (21.8) 8550.5 (61.8) 1054.9 (18.6) 35292.2 (784.2) 25849.3 (705.3) 992.8 (53.3) 1808.8 (45.2) 3020.0 (54.1) 14061.1 (204.4) 2220.9 (18.0) 76954.5 (2185.0) 25796.5 (849.1) 2891.8 (41.1) 42422.7 (3105.7) 2103.2 (131.7) 908.5 (11.8) 4155.6 (50.8) 12259 5 (234.3)	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348 661 211 172(1.01) 55411 1204 1301 8832 1114 35975 24456 1154 1969 2962 13999 2198 82533 26360 2869 46771 1986 1049 4098 13019	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2) 227.3 (9.5) 196.9 (17.5) 56477 (650.5) 1292.9 (40.5) 1384.3 (39.3) 8962.5 (279.3) 1297.4 (83.4) 37234.7 (563.2) <b>25586.9</b> (673.4) 1223.8 (43.1) 2072.3 (59.5) 3085.9 (84.1) 14183.5 (103.4) 2361.5 (110.7) 87968.0 (4704.3) 30709.5 (2517.2) 3052.1 (94.5) 51044.6 (3010.2) 2222.8 (135.1) 1122.4 (49.5) 4653.4 (150.8) 13695 (574.0)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.236 0.000 0.000 0.024 0.024 0.024 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.000000 0.00000000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07) 971 330 215 77990 1862 1907 12291 1673 43861 36514 1706 2636 4237 14659(1.01) 3110 124969 41529 5872 66966 3444 1673 6054 18413	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7) 344.1 (8.3) 238.7 (26.0) 79380.1 (1013.7) 1802.9 (60.6) 1895.0 (78.1) 12383.8 (78.6) 1765.0 (83.5) 45060.1 (1090.2) 37362.3 (876.1) 1783.3 (68.3) 2825.8 (66.6) 4365.4 (78.3) 14907.7 (255.8) 3273.8 (120.1) 128905.8 (2207.1) 43540.6 (1173.0) 6268.7 (138.0) 71105.2 (2711.7) 3532.1 (64.1) 1702.2 (37.5) 6500.8 (242.0) 19588 4 (541.7)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076 342(1.01) 275(1.01) 80642 1840 1890 12400 1833 44462 39819 1789 2826 4870 - 3347 131402 43758 6304 70806 3809 1661 6572 19613	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2) 353.7 (8.1) 332.5 (24.3) 82517.8 (1862.8) 1905.4 (29.2) 1975.8 (46.4) 12561.8 (143.5) 1902.1 (44.0) 45463.8 (1493.1) 45463.8 (1493.1) 41205.5 (748.5) 1863.7 (37.6) 2886.2 (29.9) 5025.0 (88.7) - 3424.8 (48.0) 134148.5 (2429.8) 47259.5 (1593.3) 6356.3 (42.0) 74726.5 (2168.4) 3697.8 (81.4) 1732.1 (39.3) 6718.7 (108.9) 20495.7 (504.5)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.000000 0.00000000
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe_pwt bcsstk31 fe_pwt bcsstk31 fe_body t60k wing brack2 finan512	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600 155 123 55318 1114 1109 8478 1025 33613 25567 959 1734 2936 13733 2178 76258 24484 2847 38535 1890 900 4097 12019 1296	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0) 180.2 (16.5) 134.4 (8.8) 55854.9 (486.9) 1128.4 (11.5) 1151.9 (21.8) 8550.5 (61.8) 1054.9 (18.6) 35292.2 (784.2) 25849.3 (705.3) 992.8 (53.3) 1808.8 (45.2) 3020.0 (54.1) 14061.1 (204.4) 2220.9 (18.0) 76954.5 (2185.0) 25796.5 (849.1) 2891.8 (41.1) 42422.7 (3105.7) 2103.2 (131.7) 908.5 (11.8) 4155.6 (50.8) 12259.5 (234.3) 1458.0 (88.7)	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348 661 211 172(1.01) 55411 1204 1301 8832 1114 35975 24456 1154 1969 2962 13999 2198 82533 26360 2869 46771 1986 1049 4098 13019 1539	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2) 227.3 (9.5) 196.9 (17.5) 56477 (650.5) 1292.9 (40.5) 1384.3 (39.3) 8962.5 (279.3) 1297.4 (83.4) 37234.7 (563.2) <b>25586.9</b> (673.4) 1223.8 (43.1) 2072.3 (59.5) 3085.9 (84.1) 14183.5 (103.4) 2361.5 (110.7) 87968.0 (4704.3) 30709.5 (2517.2) 3052.1 (94.5) 51044.6 (3010.2) 2222.8 (135.1) 1122.4 (49.5) 4653.4 (150.8) 13695 (574.0) 1680.8 (109.9)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.024 0.024 0.024 0.024 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07) 971 330 215 77990 1862 1907 12291 1673 43861 36514 1706 2636 4237 14659(1.01) 3110 124969 41529 5872 66966 3444 1673 6054 18413 2592	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7) 344.1 (8.3) 238.7 (26.0) 79380.1 (1013.7) 1802.9 (60.6) 1895.0 (78.1) 12383.8 (78.6) 1765.0 (83.5) 45060.1 (1090.2) 37362.3 (876.1) 1783.3 (68.3) 2825.8 (66.6) 4365.4 (78.3) 14907.7 (255.8) 3273.8 (120.1) 128905.8 (2207.1) 43540.6 (1173.0) 6268.7 (138.0) 71105.2 (2711.7) 3532.1 (64.1) 1702.2 (37.5) 6560.8 (242.0) 19588.4 (541.7) 2592.0 (0.0)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076 342(1.01) 275(1.01) 80642 1840 1890 12400 1833 44462 39819 1789 2826 4870 - 3347 131402 43758 6304 70806 3809 1661 6572 19613 2592	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2) 353.7 (8.1) 332.5 (24.3) 82517.8 (1862.8) 1905.4 (29.2) 1975.8 (46.4) 12561.8 (143.5) 1902.1 (44.0) 45463.8 (1493.1) 41205.5 (748.5) 1863.7 (37.6) 2886.2 (29.9) 5025.0 (88.7) - - 3424.8 (48.0) 134148.5 (2429.8) 47259.5 (1593.3) 6356.3 (42.0) 74726.5 (2168.4) 3697.8 (81.4) 1732.1 (39.3) 6718.7 (108.9) 20495.7 (504.5) 2592.0 (0.0)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000000
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe_pwt bcsstk31 fe_body t60k wing brack2 finan512 fe_tooth	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600 155 123 55318 1114 1109 8478 1025 33613 25567 959 1734 2936 13733 2178 76258 24484 2847 38535 1890 900 4097 12019 1296 17993	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0) 180.2 (16.5) 134.4 (8.8) 55854.9 (486.9) 1128.4 (11.5) 1151.9 (21.8) 8550.5 (61.8) 1054.9 (18.6) 35292.2 (784.2) 25849.3 (705.3) 992.8 (53.3) 1808.8 (45.2) 3020.0 (54.1) 14061.1 (204.4) 2220.9 (18.0) 76954.5 (2185.0) 25796.5 (849.1) 2891.8 (41.1) 42422.7 (3105.7) 2103.2 (131.7) 908.5 (11.8) 4155.6 (50.8) 12259.5 (234.3) 1458.0 (88.7) 18342 5 (198.6)	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348 661 211 172(1.01) 55411 1204 1301 8832 1114 35975 24456 1154 1969 2962 13999 2198 82533 26360 2869 46771 1986 1049 4098 13019 1539 18337	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2) 227.3 (9.5) 196.9 (17.5) 56477 (650.5) 1292.9 (40.5) 1384.3 (39.3) 8962.5 (279.3) 1297.4 (83.4) 37234.7 (563.2) <b>25586.9</b> (673.4) 1223.8 (43.1) 2072.3 (59.5) 3085.9 (84.1) 14183.5 (103.4) 2361.5 (110.7) 87968.0 (4704.3) 30709.5 (2517.2) 3052.1 (94.5) 51044.6 (3010.2) 2222.8 (135.1) 1122.4 (49.5) 54653.4 (150.8) 13695 (574.0) 1680.8 (109.9) 19521.8 (990.0)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.024 0.024 0.024 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07) 971 330 215 77990 1862 1907 12291 1673 43861 36514 1706 2636 4237 14659(1.01) 3110 2636 4237 14659(1.01) 3110 124969 41529 5872 66966 3444 1673 6054 18413 2592 27333	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7) 344.1 (8.3) 238.7 (26.0) 79380.1 (1013.7) 1802.9 (60.6) 1895.0 (78.1) 12383.8 (78.6) 1765.0 (83.5) 45060.1 (1090.2) 37362.3 (876.1) 1783.3 (68.3) 2825.8 (66.6) 4365.4 (78.3) 14907.7 (255.8) 3273.8 (120.1) 128905.8 (2207.1) 43540.6 (1173.0) 6268.7 (138.0) 71105.2 (2711.7) 3532.1 (64.1) 1702.2 (37.5) 6560.8 (242.0) 19588.4 (541.7) 2592.0 (0.0) 27785 9 (986.0)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076 342(1.01) 275(1.01) 80642 1840 1890 12400 1833 44462 39819 1789 2826 4870 - 3347 131402 43758 6304 70806 3809 1661 6572 19613 2592 28373	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2) 353.7 (8.1) 322.5 (24.3) 82517.8 (1862.8) 1905.4 (29.2) 1975.8 (46.4) 12561.8 (143.5) 1902.1 (44.0) 45463.8 (1493.1) 41205.5 (748.5) 1863.7 (37.6) 2886.2 (29.9) 5025.0 (88.7) - 3424.8 (48.0) 134148.5 (2429.8) 47259.5 (1593.3) 6356.3 (42.0) 74726.5 (2168.4) 3697.8 (81.4) 1732.1 (39.3) 6718.7 (108.9) 20495.7 (504.5) <b>2592.0</b> (0.0) 29090 2 (472.9)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000000
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe_pwt bcsstk31 fe_body t60k wing brack2 finan512 fe_tooth fe rotor	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600 155 123 55318 1114 1109 8478 1025 33613 25567 959 1734 2936 13733 2178 76258 24484 2847 38535 1890 900 4097 12019 1296 17993 21007	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0) 180.2 (16.5) 134.4 (8.8) 55854.9 (486.9) 1128.4 (11.5) 1151.9 (21.8) 8550.5 (61.8) 1054.9 (18.6) 35292.2 (784.2) 25849.3 (705.3) 992.8 (53.3) 1808.8 (45.2) 3020.0 (54.1) 14061.1 (204.4) 2220.9 (18.0) 76954.5 (2185.0) 25796.5 (849.1) 2891.8 (41.1) 42422.7 (3105.7) 2103.2 (131.7) 908.5 (11.8) 4155.6 (50.8) 12259.5 (234.3) 1458.0 (88.7) 18342.5 (198.6) 21473.4 (380.2)	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348 661 211 172(1.01) 55411 1204 1301 8832 1114 35975 24456 1154 1969 2962 13999 2198 82533 26360 2869 46771 1986 1049 4098 13019 1539 18337 21392	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2) 227.3 (9.5) 196.9 (17.5) 56477 (650.5) 1292.9 (40.5) 1384.3 (39.3) 8962.5 (279.3) 1297.4 (83.4) 37234.7 (563.2) <b>25586.9</b> (673.4) 1223.8 (43.1) 2072.3 (59.5) 3085.9 (84.1) 14183.5 (103.4) 2361.5 (110.7) 87968.0 (4704.3) 30709.5 (2517.2) 3052.1 (94.5) 51044.6 (3010.2) 2222.8 (135.1) 1122.4 (49.5) 4653.4 (150.8) 13695 (574.0) 1680.8 (109.9) 19521.8 (990.0) 24644.9 (1776.4)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.002 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.0000000 0.00000000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07) 971 330 215 77990 1862 1907 12291 1673 43861 36514 1706 2636 4237 14659(1.01) 3110 124969 41529 5872 66966 3444 1673 6054 18413 2592 27333 34348	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7) 344.1 (8.3) 238.7 (26.0) 79380.1 (1013.7) 1802.9 (60.6) 1895.0 (78.1) 12383.8 (78.6) 1765.0 (83.5) 45060.1 (1090.2) 37362.3 (876.1) 1783.3 (68.3) 2825.8 (66.6) 4365.4 (78.3) 14907.7 (255.8) 3273.8 (120.1) 128905.8 (2207.1) 43540.6 (1173.0) 6268.7 (138.0) 71105.2 (2711.7) 3532.1 (64.1) 1702.2 (37.5) 6560.8 (242.0) 19588.4 (541.7) 2592.0 (0.0) 27785.9 (986.0) 35049.2 (2134.0)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076 342(1.01) 275(1.01) 80642 1840 1890 12400 1833 44462 39819 1789 2826 4870 - 3347 131402 43758 6304 70806 3809 1661 6572 19613 2592 28373 39322	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2) 353.7 (8.1) 332.5 (24.3) 82517.8 (1862.8) 1905.4 (29.2) 1975.8 (46.4) 12561.8 (143.5) 1902.1 (44.0) 45463.8 (1493.1) 41205.5 (748.5) 1863.7 (37.6) 2886.2 (29.9) 5025.0 (88.7) - 3424.8 (48.0) 134148.5 (2429.8) 47259.5 (1593.3) 6356.3 (42.0) 74726.5 (2168.4) 3697.8 (81.4) 1732.1 (39.3) 6718.7 (108.9) 20495.7 (504.5) <b>2592.0</b> (0.0) 29090.2 (472.9) 40029 3 (806.2)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000000
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe_pwt bcsstk31 fe_body t60k wing brack2 finan512 fe_tooth fe_rotor 598a	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600 155 123 55318 1114 1109 8478 1025 33613 25567 959 1734 2936 13733 2178 76258 24484 2847 38535 1890 900 4097 12019 1296 17993 21007 26194	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0) 180.2 (16.5) 134.4 (8.8) 55854.9 (486.9) 1128.4 (11.5) 1151.9 (21.8) 8550.5 (61.8) 1054.9 (18.6) 35292.2 (784.2) 25849.3 (705.3) 992.8 (53.3) 1808.8 (45.2) 3020.0 (54.1) 14061.1 (204.4) 2220.9 (18.0) 76954.5 (2185.0) 25796.5 (849.1) 2891.8 (41.1) 42422.7 (3105.7) 2103.2 (131.7) 908.5 (11.8) 4155.6 (50.8) 12259.5 (234.3) 1458.0 (88.7) 18342.5 (198.6) 21473.4 (359.8)	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348 661 211 172(1.01) 55411 1204 1301 8832 1114 1307 8832 1114 1307 24456 1154 1969 2962 13999 2198 82533 26654 1301 1539 18337 21392 26534	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2) 227.3 (9.5) 196.9 (17.5) 56477 (650.5) 1292.9 (40.5) 1384.3 (39.3) 8962.5 (279.3) 1297.4 (83.4) 37234.7 (563.2) <b>25586.9</b> (673.4) 1223.8 (43.1) 2072.3 (59.5) 3085.9 (84.1) 14183.5 (103.4) 2361.5 (110.7) 87968.0 (4704.3) 30709.5 (2517.2) 3052.1 (94.5) 51044.6 (3010.2) 2222.8 (135.1) 1122.4 (49.5) 4653.4 (150.8) 13695 (574.0) 1680.8 (109.9) 19521.8 (990.0) 24644.9 (1776.4) 28206.1 (1385.0)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.002 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.024 0.024 0.024 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.000000 0.00000000	k=32           b. BBC           2436(1.03)           1833(1.07)           971           330           215           77990           1862           1907           12291           1673           36514           1706           2636           4237           14659(1.01)           3110           124969           41529           5872           66966           3444           1673           2592           27333           34348           39711	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7) 344.1 (8.3) 238.7 (26.0) 79380.1 (1013.7) 1802.9 (60.6) 1895.0 (78.1) 12383.8 (78.6) 1765.0 (83.5) 45060.1 (1090.2) 37362.3 (876.1) 1783.3 (68.3) 2825.8 (66.6) 4365.4 (78.3) 14907.7 (255.8) 3273.8 (120.1) 128905.8 (2207.1) 43540.6 (1173.0) 6268.7 (138.0) 71105.2 (2711.7) 3532.1 (64.1) 1702.2 (37.5) 6560.8 (242.0) 19588.4 (541.7) 2592.0 (0.0) 27785.9 (986.0) 35049.2 (2134.0) 40351.5 (426.7)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076 342(1.01) 275(1.01) 80642 1840 1890 12400 1833 44462 39819 1789 2826 4870 - 3347 131402 43758 6304 70806 3809 1661 6572 19613 2592 28373 39322 41713	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2) 353.7 (8.1) 332.5 (24.3) 82517.8 (1862.8) 1905.4 (29.2) 1975.8 (46.4) 12561.8 (143.5) 1902.1 (44.0) 45463.8 (1493.1) 41205.5 (748.5) 1863.7 (37.6) 2886.2 (29.9) 5025.0 (88.7) - 3424.8 (48.0) 134148.5 (2429.8) 47259.5 (1593.3) 6356.3 (42.0) 74726.5 (2168.4) 3697.8 (81.4) 1732.1 (39.3) 6718.7 (108.9) 20495.7 (504.5) <b>2592.0</b> (0.0) 29090.2 (472.9) 40929.3 (806.2) 46046.0 (2017 5)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000000
Graph add20 data 3elt uk add32 bcsstk33 whitaker3 crack wing_nodal fe_4elt2 vibrobox bcsstk29 4elt fe_sphere cti memplus cs4 bcsstk30 bcsstk31 fe_pwt bcsstk32 fe_body t60k wing brack2 fe_tooth fe_rotor 598a fe ccean	k=16 b. BBC 2073 1138 600 155 123 55318 1114 1109 8478 1025 33613 25567 959 1734 2936 13733 2178 76258 24484 2847 38535 1890 900 4097 12019 1296 17993 21007 26194 7982	BBC Avg(Std) 2094.9 (13.7) 1164.3 (18.5) 595.7 (10.0) 180.2 (16.5) 134.4 (8.8) 55854.9 (486.9) 1128.4 (11.5) 1151.9 (21.8) 8550.5 (61.8) 1054.9 (18.6) 35292.2 (784.2) 25849.3 (705.3) 992.8 (53.3) 1808.8 (45.2) 3020.0 (54.1) 14061.1 (204.4) 2220.9 (18.0) 76954.5 (2185.0) 25796.5 (849.1) 28718.2 (131.7) 908.5 (11.8) 12529.5 (234.3) 1458.0 (88.7) 18342.5 (198.6) 21473.4 (380.2) 27014.8 (359.8) 8262.4 (193.9)	b. UNI 2145(1.01) 1348 661 211 172(1.01) 55411 1204 1301 8832 1114 1307 8832 1114 1307 24456 1154 1969 2962 13999 2198 82533 26360 2869 46771 1986 1049 4098 13019 1539 18337 21392 26534	UNI Avg(Std) 2201.7 (30.6) 1409 (39.4) 734.3 (30.2) 227.3 (9.5) 196.9 (17.5) 56477 (650.5) 1292.9 (40.5) 1384.3 (39.3) 8962.5 (279.3) 1297.4 (83.4) 37234.7 (563.2) <b>25586.9</b> (673.4) 1223.8 (43.1) 2072.3 (59.5) 3085.9 (84.1) 14183.5 (103.4) 2361.5 (110.7) 87968.0 (4704.3) 30709.5 (2517.2) 3052.1 (94.5) 51044.6 (3010.2) 2222.8 (135.1) 1122.4 (49.5) 4653.4 (150.8) 13695 (574.0) 1680.8 (109.9) 19521.8 (990.0) 24644.9 (1776.4) 28206.1 (1385.0) 8215.4 (169.6)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.236 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.024 0.024 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000000	k=32 b. BBC 2436(1.03) 1833(1.07) 971 330 215 77990 1862 1907 12291 1673 43861 36514 1706 2636 4237 14659(1.01) 3110 124969 41529 5872 66966 3444 1673 6054 18413 2592 27333 34348 39711 13158	BBC Avg(Std) 2425.9 (13.8) 1870.0 (20.7) 988.6 (11.7) 344.1 (8.3) 238.7 (26.0) 79380.1 (1013.7) 1802.9 (60.6) 1895.0 (78.1) 12383.8 (78.6) 1765.0 (83.5) 45060.1 (1090.2) 37362.3 (876.1) 1783.3 (68.3) 2825.8 (66.6) 4365.4 (78.3) 14907.7 (255.8) 3273.8 (120.1) 128905.8 (2207.1) 43540.6 (1173.0) 6268.7 (138.0) 71105.2 (2711.7) 3532.1 (64.1) 1702.2 (37.5) 6500.8 (242.0) 19588.4 (541.7) 2592.0 (0.0) 27785.9 (986.0) 35049.2 (2134.0) 40351.5 (426.7) 13880.0 (447.3)	b. UNI 2541(1.03) 204 (1.01) 1076 342(1.01) 275(1.01) 80642 1840 1890 12400 1833 44462 39819 1789 2826 4870 - 3347 131402 43758 6304 70806 3809 1661 6572 19613 2592 28373 39322 41713 13321	UNI Avg(Std) 2620.3 (84.9) 2074.5 (37.2) 1116.3 (21.2) 353.7 (8.1) 332.5 (24.3) 82517.8 (1862.8) 1905.4 (29.2) 1975.8 (46.4) 12561.8 (143.5) 1902.1 (44.0) 45463.8 (1493.1) 45463.8 (1493.1) 41205.5 (748.5) 1863.7 (37.6) 2886.2 (29.9) 5025.0 (88.7) - 3424.8 (48.0) 134148.5 (2429.8) 47259.5 (1593.3) 6356.3 (42.0) 74726.5 (2168.4) 3697.8 (81.4) 1732.1 (39.3) 6718.7 (108.9) 20495.7 (504.5) <b>2592.0</b> (0.0) 29090.2 (472.9) 40046.0 (2017.5) <b>13519.8</b> (200.6)	p-value 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.0000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000 0.00000000

TABLE VIA comparison of partitions obtained with BBC and Uniform crossover operator on the set of 30 benchmark graphs for $k \in \{4, 8, 16, 32\}$ . We report the best partition obtained with BBC (b. BBC) and Uniform operator (b. UNI), the average andstandard deviation of partitions obtained with BBC (BBC Avg(Std)) and Uniform crossover (UNI Avg(std)), and the *p*-valuebetween the two partition sets. If the partition is imbalanced, we include the degree of imbalance in parentheses.

TABLE VIIPERCENTAGE OF PERTURBED VERTICES WITH BBC, SBBC AND UNIFORM CROSSOVER (UNI) FOR  $k \in \{4, 8, 16, 32\}$ . For BBC and SBBC the<br/>NUMBER OF PARENTS p = 6, while for UNI p = 2.

	k=4			k=8			k=16			k=32		
Graph	BBC	SBBC	UNI	BBC	SBBC	UNI	BBC	SBBC	UNI	BBC	SBBC	UNI
data	4.64	48.86	29.40	4.12	5.89	30.14	6.89	40.17	33.70	14.51	55.32	44.23
3elt	3.79	14.87	25.50	4.36	7.59	29.83	6.65	21.33	32.25	11.48	46.89	41.47
uk	8.36	26.35	25.92	5.38	39.38	31.52	24.13	60.04	32.71	10.82	69.14	35.28
crack	3.04	5.27	25.26	8.10	9.78	29.58	6.16	9.46	32.56	8.38	60.45	35.01
wing-nodal	2.88	3.62	25.58	2.26	5.26	29.64	9.90	9.06	31.75	12.73	61.00	34.75
fe-4elt2	5.17	9.58	25.83	4.92	51.24	29.94	6.65	15.65	32.21	8.80	71.99	35.14
vibrobox	2.12	57.77	25.38	2.90	6.07	29.58	31.14	75.16	32.40	17.20	94.15	56.26

from the analysis in Section VI, a weaker form of perturbation should be used because of the generally high FDC and the marked big valley structure in the landscape.

To see the convergence behavior of the proposed algorithm, we provide in Figure 5 evolution curves of the multilevel memetic algorithm respectively with the BBC and uniform crossovers. The curves are plotted over 300 generations performed on each graph level  $(G_m, G_{m-1}, .., G_0)$  for graph 'data' with k = 4 and 'fe-4elt2' when k = 32. The xaxis corresponds to the current number of generations, where the first 300 generations are performed on  $G_m$ , the 300–600 generations on  $G_{m-1}$ , etc. The y-axis shows the 'normalized' average fitness value obtained by subtracting the best fitness value over 10 independent executions. Both crossover operators start the refinement on a population of the same quality at the coarsest graph  $G_m$ . One observes that for graph 'data' with k = 4, the BBC is outperformed by the uniform crossover, while the situation is opposite for 'fe-4elt2' with k = 32. From the two curves, we also note that the algorithm converges in both cases toward its best partition after approximately the same number of generations. This is partially due to the quality-and-distance based population updating strategy of our MMA which ensures a healthily diversified population.

## B. Perturbation strength of BBC operator

In this section, we provide an analysis on the impact of perturbation strength introduced by our new multi-parent crossover operator (BBC) by comparing the performance of BBC from Section IV-B2 with its slight variation (call it SBBC) which mainly differs from BBC in the degree of perturbation introduced in offspring. As explained in Section IV-B2, BBC preserves all the vertices from the backbone  $B = \{B_1, ..., B_k\}$  with respect to p parent individuals, and perturbs with a certain probability a vertex v if it is not present in any subset of B (see alg. 3, lines 12–13). On the other hand, SBBC consists in preserving only the vertices  $v \in \{B_1 \cup ... \cup B_k\}$  and assigning the rest of vertices to random subsets  $S_r$  of  $I^0$ , such that  $W(S_r \cup \{v\}) \leq W_{opt}$ . Consequently, SBBC implies much stronger perturbation in  $I^0$  than BBC.

For this analysis, we use the same set of seven benchmark instances as in Section VI. To perform the statistical analysis, we use the Welch's *t*-test on sets of solutions obtained after 50 runs of our multilevel memetic algorithm. Table VII-A shows the average perturbation degree expressed as a percentage of |V|, which is introduced by both BBC and SBBC when p =

6 for  $k \in \{4, 8, 16, 32\}$ . As expected, we observe that the number of perturbed vertices is always significantly larger with SBBC than with BBC.

To analyze the difference in performance, we provide in Table VIII the *t*-value, the degree of freedom df, and the two tailed *p*-value over the two solution sets generated with BBC and SBBC respectively. We observe that the *p*-value is extremely significant (*p*-value < 0.001) except in one case, which suggests a statistically significant difference between the two solution sets. The negative *t*-value indicates that the mean value of partitions obtained by BBC is, except in two cases, significantly lower that the one produced by SBBC. These results imply that BBC outperforms in a more pronounced way SBBC, which suggests that a too strong perturbation introduced in offspring is not desirable. This result remains consistent with that observed when the uniform crossover is used.

## VIII. INFLUENCE OF LOCAL OPTIMIZATION

In this section, we briefly analyze the contribution of local optimization to the overall performance of the memetic algorithm by comparing the proposed perturbation-based tabu search procedure [6] with its hill-climbing version. The hillclimbing procedure is basically the same as the tabu search procedure with the tabu list disabled.

We perform a statistical analysis on seven graphs with  $k \in \{4, 8, 16, 32\}$  using the Welch's *t*-test on solution sets obtained after 20 independent runs. For this analysis, we set the number of generations to 500, and the number of local optimization iterations before and after crossover to  $0.5 * |V_i|$  and  $5 * |V_i|$  respectively, where  $|V_i|$  is the number of vertices at the *i*<sup>th</sup> graph level.

Table IX shows the statistical result between solution sets generated with two versions of our algorithms, which integrate respectively the tabu search procedure (TS) and the hill climbing procedure (HC). For each  $k \in \{4, 8, 16, 32\}$ , columns 't-value', 'df' and 'p-value' report respectively the t-value, degree of freedom and p-value over the two solution sets. In each case, the t-values are negative which indicates that the proposed multilevel approach always performs better when the TS algorithm is employed. From these very small p-values (< 0.001), one concludes that the difference is statistically significant. These analytical results, along with the FD analysis shown previously, provide clear evidence that the perturbationbased tabu search procedure plays an important role in the overall performance of our multilevel memetic algorithm.



Fig. 5. Evolutionary curves of the multilevel memetic algorithm with the BBC and uniform crossovers over 300 generations per graph level  $G_m, G_{m-1}, ..., G_0$  for graphs 'data' with k = 4 and 'fe-4elt2' with k = 32. The x-axis corresponds to the current number of generations, while the y-axis shows the 'normalized' average fitness value over 10 independent executions. Both algorithms start with a population of the same quality.

TABLE VIIISTATISTICAL ANALYSIS USING THE WELCH'S t-TEST OVER TWO SOLUTION SETS GENERATED WITH BBC AND SBBC WITH p = 6 for k equal to 4, 8,16 AND 32. A NEGATIVE t-VALUE MEANS THAT BBC OUTPERFORMS THE SBBC OPERATOR.

	k=4			k=8			k=16			k=32		
Graph	t-value	$d\!f$	p-value									
data	-6.547	93	0.000	-12.103	95	0.000	-18.154	91	0.000	-13.626	91	0.000
3elt	-6.314	72	0.000	-14.111	76	0.000	-9.535	93	0.000	-13.351	97	0.000
uk	-10.916	92	0.000	-8.175	98	0.000	-5.123	98	0.000	-3.716	93	0.000
crack	-4.214	81	0.000	-13.438	72	0.000	-10.535	97	0.000	-5.638	96	0.000
wing-nodal	3.539	95	0.001	3.756	94	0.000	-11.502	93	0.000	-7.492	96	0.000
fe-4elt2	-7.338	72	0.000	-13.236	70	0.000	-8.886	94	0.000	-9.757	96	0.000
vibrobox	3.390	98	0.001	-8.410	84	0.000	-5.165	92	0.000	-1.103	98	0.273

 TABLE IX

 STATISTICAL ANALYSIS USING THE WELCH'S t-TEST OVER SOLUTION SETS GENERATED WITH TWO VERSIONS OF OUR ALGORITHMS, WHICH

 INTEGRATE RESPECTIVELY THE PROPOSED PERTURBATION-BASED TABU SEARCH PROCEDURE (TS) AND A HILL CLIMBING PROCEDURE (HC). A

 NEGATIVE t-VALUE MEANS THAT THE ALGORITHM WITH TS PERFORMS BETTER THAN THE ALGORITHM WITH HC.

	k=4			k=8			k=16			k=32		
Graph	t-value	$d\!f$	p-value									
data	-4.440	38	0.000	-0.550	38	0.585	-2.144	38	0.039	-9.505	27	0.000
3elt	-4.712	29	0.000	-2.639	33	0.013	-1.773	34	0.085	-3.590	25	0.001
uk	-6.541	25	0.000	-4.728	32	0.000	-5.785	36	0.000	-13.136	26	0.000
crack	-11.441	23	0.000	-7.541	31	0.000	-4.428	38	0.000	-8.628	28	0.000
wing_nodal	-4.086	32	0.000	-3.919	35	0.000	-9.030	31	0.000	-10.938	26	0.000
fe_4elt2	-1.784	19	0.091	-7.541	31	0.000	-3.747	35	0.001	-7.188	28	0.000
vibrobox	-19.047	37	0.000	-8.222	21	0.000	-7.232	32	0.000	-6.693	27	0.000

## IX. CONCLUSION

In this paper, we have presented a highly efficient multilevel memetic algorithm for the balanced graph partitioning problem. Our MMA algorithm uses an original backbonebased multi-parent crossover operator, a perturbation-based tabu search procedure as the local optimization engine, and a pool replacement strategy that takes into consideration both the solution quality and the distance between solutions. The backbone-based multi-parent crossover operator of MMA tries to preserve the elements which hopefully belong to the optimal partition while permitting limited perturbations within offspring solutions. The tabu search procedure (via its tabu list and occasional random moves), and the quality-and-distance based population updating strategy provide MMA with a healthy population diversity during its search.

We have proposed landscape analysis using FDC to put forward the existence of the big valley structure for some problem instances, and studied the backbone phenomenon within a set of high quality solutions which provided motivation for the design of our BBC crossover. We have also investigated the role of perturbation within the crossover operators and the influence of local optimization on the performance of the memetic algorithm.

We have assessed extensively the performance of the proposed memetic algorithm with both short and long run times, on a collection of benchmark graphs from the Graph Partitioning Archive, with the cardinal number k set to 2, 4, 8, 16, 32 and 64. We have shown that the results generated in short computing time (from less than one second to some 15 minutes) are very competitive with those produced by the two well-known graph partitioning packages METIS and CHACO. When the running time is prolonged (from several minutes to 5 hours), our approach succeeds even to improve more than two thirds of the best partitions of the given balance reported at the Graph Partitioning Archive.

This study focuses on obtaining perfectly balanced or slightly imbalanced partitions. It is known that allowing more imbalance may lead to partitions of better quality. Indeed, when we relaxed the balance constraint up to a certain degree, with a slight modification of our MMA algorithm described in this paper, we obtained imbalanced partitions (not reported here) which are highly competitive with the best-known partitions reported in the literature. However, we believe that further research needs to be realized in order to design a dedicated algorithm which could improve even more the quality of imbalanced partitions.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This work was partially supported by "Angers Loire Métropole" and the Region of "Pays de la Loire" within the Miles, Radapop and LigeRO Projects.

#### REFERENCES

- C.J. Alpert and A.B. Kahng. Recent Directions in Netlist Partitioning. Integration: the VLSI Journal, 19(12): 1–81, 1995.
- [2] A. Bahreininejad, B.H.V. Topping and A.I. Khan. Finite Element Mesh Partitioning Using Neural Networks. *Advances in Engineering Software*, 103–115, 1996.
- [3] S.T. Barnard and H.D. Simon. A Fast Multilevel Implementation of Recursive Spectral Bisection for Partitioning Unstructured Problems. *Concurrency: Practice & Experience*, 6(2): 101–117, 1994.
- [4] R. Battiti and A. Bertossi. Greedy and Prohibition-Based Heuristics for Graph Partitioning. *IEEE Transactions on Computers*, 48: 361–385, 1999.
- [5] U. Benlic and J.K. Hao. An Effective Multilevel Memetic Algorithm for Balanced Graph Partitioning. *Proceedings of the 22th International Conference on Tools with Artificial Intelligence*, pages 121–128, 2010.
- [6] U. Benlic and J.K. Hao. An Effective Multilevel Tabu Search Approach for Balanced Graph Partitioning. *Computers & Operations Research*, 38(7): 1066–1075, 2011.
- [7] K.D. Boese. Cost versus Distance in the Traveling Salesman Problem. Technical Report TR-950018, UCLA CS Department, 1995.
- [8] K.D. Boese. Models for Iterative Global Optimization. Tech. PhD thesis, University of California, Computer Science Department, Los Angeles, CA, USA, 1996.
- [9] T.N. Bui and C. Jones. A Heuristic for Reducing Fill-in in Sparse Matrix Factorization. *R.F Sincovec et al. (Eds), Parallel Processing for Scientific Computing*, SIAM, Philadelphia, pages 445–452, 1993.
- [10] T.N. Bui and B.R. Moon. Genetic Algorithm and Graph Partitioning. *IEEE Transactions on Computers*, 45(7): 841–855, 1996.
- [11] P. Chardaire, M. Barake, and G. P. McKeown. A PROBE based heuristic for Graph Partitioning. *IEEE Transactions on Computers*, 56: 1707– 1720, 2007.
- [12] M. Dell'Amico and F. Maffioli. A Tabu Search Approach to the 0-1 Equicut Problem. *Meta Heuristics 1995: The State of the Art, Kluwer Academic Publishers*, pages 361–377, 1996.
- [13] O. Dubois and G. Dequen. A Backbone-Search Heuristic for Efficient Solving of Hard 3-SAT Formulae. *Proceedings of the 17th International Joint Conference on Artificial Intelligence*, pages 248–253, 2001.
- [14] C. Fiduccia and R. Mattheyses. A Linear-Time Heuristics for Improving Network Partitions. *Proceedings of the 19th Design Automation Conference*, pages 171–185, 1982.
- [15] M. Garey and D. Johnson. Computers & Intractability: A Guide to the Theory of NP-Completeness. In W.H. Freeman and Company, 1979.

- [16] C. Gil, J. Ortega, A.F. Diaz and M.G. Montoya. Annealing-Based Heuristics and Genetic Algorithms for Circuit Partitioning in Parallel Test Generation. *Future Generation Computer Systems*, 14(5): 439–451, 1998.
- [17] D. Gusfield. Partition-Distance: A Problem and Class of Perfect Graphs Arising in Clustering. *Information Processing Letters*, 82(3): 159–164, 2002.
- [18] B. Hendrickson and R. Leland. The Chaco User's Guide Version 2.0. Technical Report, Sandia National Laboratories, 1995.
- [19] B. Hendrickson and R. Leland. A Multilevel Algorithm for Partitioning Graphs. In S. Karin. (Eds) Proceedings of Supercomputing '95, San Diego, ACM Press, New York, 1995. http://www.supercomp.org/sc95/ proceedings/509\\_BHEN/SC95.HTM
- [20] M. Holtgrewe, P. Sanders, and C. Schulz. Engineering a Scalable High Quality Graph Partitioner. Technical Report, 2009.
- [21] D.S. Johnson, C.R. Aragon, L.A. Mcgeoch and C. Schevon. Optimization by Simulated Annealing: An Experimental Evaluation; Part-I, Graph Partitioning. *Operations Research*, 37: 865–892, 1989.
- [22] T. Jones and S. Forrest. Fitness Distance Correlation as a Measure of Problem Difficulty for Genetic Algorithms. *Proceedings of the 6th International Conference on Genetic Algorithms*, Morgan Kaufmann, pages 184–192, 1995.
- [23] S. Kang and B.R. Moon. A Hybrid Genetic Algorithm for Multiway Graph Partitioning. *Proceedings of the Genetic and Evolutionary Computation Conference*, pages 159–166, Morgan Kaufmann, 2000.
- [24] G. Karypis and V. Kumar. A Fast and High Quality Multilevel Scheme for Partitioning Irregular Graphs. *SIAM Journal on Scientific Computing*, 20(1): 359–392, 1998.
- [25] G. Karypis and V. Kumar. Multilevel k-way Partitioning Scheme for Irregular Graphs. *Journal of Parallel and Distributed Computing*, 48(1): 96–129, 1998.
- [26] P. Kilby and J. Slaney. Backbones and Backdoors in Satisfiability. Proceedings of the 20 th American Association for Artificial Intelligence, pages 1368–1373, 2005.
- [27] J.P. Kim and B.R. Moon. A Hybrid Genetic Search for Multi-way Graph Partitioning Based on Direct Partitioning. *Proceedings of the Genetic* and Evolutionary Computation Conference, pages 408–415, 2001.
- [28] Z. Lü and J.K. Hao. A Memetic Algorithm for Graph Coloring. European Journal of Operational Research, 203(1): 241–250, 2010.
- [29] N. Mansour and G.C. Fox. Allocating Data to Distributed-memory Multiprocessors by Genetic Algorithms. *Concurrency: Practice & Experience*, 6(6): 485–504, 1994.
- [30] P. Merz and B. Freisleben. Fitness Landscapes, Memetic Algorithms and Greedy Operators for Graph Bi-Partitioning. *Evolutionary Computation*, 8(1): 61–91, 2000.
- [31] H. Meyerhenke, B. Monien, and T. Sauerwald. A New Diffusion-based Multilevel Algorithm for Computing Graph Partitions of Very High Quality. *Journal of Parallel and Distributed Computing*, 69(9): 750– 761, 2009.
- [32] C. Papadimitriou and K. Steiglitz. Combinatorial Optimization: Algorithms and Complexity. Prentice-Hall, 1982.
- [33] F. Pellegrini. Scotch and libScotch 5.1 Users Guide, INRIA, University of Bordeaux I, 2010.
- [34] C.D. Porumbel, J.K. Hao, and P. Kuntz. An Evolutionaty Approach with Diversity Guarantee and Well-informed Grouping Recombination for Graph Coloring. *Computers and Operations Research*, 37(10): 1822– 1832, 2010.
- [35] C.R. Reeves. Landscapes, Operators and Heuristic Search. Annals of Operations Research, 86: 473–490, 1997.
- [36] E. Rolland, H. Pirkul and F. Glover. Tabu Search for Graph Partitioning. Annals of Operations Research, 63: 209–232, 1996.
- [37] J. Shi and J. Malik. Normalized Cuts and Image Segmentation. Proceedings of the IEEE Computer Society Conference on Computer Vision and Pattern Recognition, pages 731–737, 1997.
- [38] A.J. Soper, C. Walshaw, and M. Cross. A Combined Evolutionary Search and Multilevel Optimisation Approach to Graph-partitioning. *Journal of Global Optimization*, 29(2): 225–241, 2004.
- [39] A. Slowik and M. Bialko. Partitioning of VLSI Circuits on Subcircuits with Minimal Number of Connections Using Evolutionary Algorithm. In L. Rutkowski et al. (Eds.), ICAISC 2006, LNAI 4029, pages 470–478, Springer-Verlag, 2006.
- [40] A.G. Steenbeek, E. Marchiori, and A.E. Eiben. Finding balanced graph bi-partitions using a hybrid genetic algorithm. *1998 IEEE International Conference on Evolutionary Computation (ICEC98)*, pages 90–95, 1998.
- [41] L. Sun and M. Leng. An Effective Refinement Algorithm Based on Swarm Intelligence for Graph Bipartitioning. *International Symposium*

on Combinatorics, Algorithms, Probabilistic and Experimental Methodologie, LNCS/LNAI, pages 1–12, Springer, Heidelberg, 2007.

- [42] E. Talbi and P. Bessiere. A Parallel Genetic Algorithm for the Graph Partitioning Problem. *Proceedings of the 5th International Conference* on Supercomputing, ACM Press, New York, pages 312–320, 1991.
- [43] G. von Laszewski. Intelligent Structural Operators for the k-Way Graph Partitioning Problem. *Proceedings of the 4th International Conference* on Genetic Algorithms, pages 45–52, 1991.
  [44] C. Walshaw and M. Cross. Mesh Partitioning : A Multilevel Balancing
- [44] C. Walshaw and M. Cross. Mesh Partitioning : A Multilevel Balancing and Refinement Algorithm. *SIAM Journal on Scientific Computing*, 22(1): 63–80, 2000.
- [45] C. Walshaw. Multilevel Refinement for Combinatorial Optimisation Problems. Annals of Operations Research, 131: 325–372, 2004.
- [46] Y. Wang, Z. Lü, F. Glover, J.K. Hao. Backbone Guided Tabu Search for Solving the UBQP Problem, *Journal of Heuristics* (In Press), 2011. DOI:10.1007/s10732-011-9164-4
- [47] H. Zha, X. He, C. Ding, H. Simon, M. Gu. Bipartite Graph Partitioning and Data Clustering. *Proceedings of the ACM 10th International Conference on Information and Knowledge*, pages 25–31, 2001.
- [48] Q. Zhang, J. Sun, E.P.K. Tsang. Evolutionary Algorithm with the Guided Mutation for the Maximum Clique Problem, *IEEE Transactions on Evolutionary Computation*, 9(2), pp. 191–201, 2005.